Palestinian National Cash Transfers Program
Monitoring & Evaluation

Tahani Madhoun
Palestine
Reforming Cash Transfers

One scope of work
benefit level
eligibility criteria
PMTF
MIS
CTP Results Chain

**Inputs**
- Budget $120 million yearly
- Human Resources. TA from EU and WB.
- Infrastructure “completed”

**Activities**
1. Targeting new hhs.
2. Re-certification of current beneficiaries
3. Updating Database With new eligible hhs.
4. Developing delivery system.
5. HRD
6. M&E

**Outputs**
1. Increasing number of beneficiaries to (97,000 hhs).
2. Database updated.
3. New payment mechanism in place (bank accounts).
4. HRD
5. M&E

**Intermediate outcomes**
- MIS functioning.
- PNA increasing contribution to 30% in 2011 and to 50% in 2012.
- Increasing coverage.
- Performance improved.
- Quality developed.

**Final Outcomes**
- Reduce vulnerability and poverty.

Implementation (SUPPLY SIDE)  Results (DEMAND RESPONSE)
MIS facilitates M&E

- The 17 MOSA regional offices (Muderias) have access to the MIS through a web based applications technology.
- The MIS monitors the performance of the CTP program in relation to program objectives.
- A budgeting and supervision control system to facilitate tracking of program budget, resource flow and physical progress.
- close monitoring of the Social Workers’ data entry, inclusion and exclusion errors.
MIS facilitates M&E

MOF
MOE
MOH

NGOs

WFP

UNRWA

Others

Feedback

Cross checking

Targeting Module

Potential joint programs

MoSA
MIS
One database Multi Programs

Emergency Assistance

Disabled Rehabilitation Fund

Orphan Sponsorship

CTP

Health insurance

Economic Empowerment

Food aid

MIS facilitates M&E
MIS facilitates M&E

• MOF
  • Cross checking with MOF to avoid double payment.
  • Monitor the payment cycle with banks and donors.

• UNRWA
  • MoSA and UNRWA have many crosscutting issues and services, such as: targeting and services, financial constraints, community reaction
  • MoSA’s household beneficiaries that are also UNRWA-registered refugees receive food rations from UNRWA
• WFP
  • non-refugee cash transfer beneficiaries receive food rations from WFP” mosa data base”

• MOE
  • PNCTP beneficiary households entitled to free basic education

• MOH
  • PNCTP beneficiary households are also entitled to government health insurance which covers all household members and provides them with free access to healthcare services in both the West Bank and Gaza
  • Eligibility is decided by MoSA but the administration, funding and delivery of health services remains the responsibility of the MoH
## M&E – Current Mechanism

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Monitoring</th>
<th>MoSA</th>
<th>Governmental Agencies</th>
<th>Donors</th>
<th>Civil Society</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1. Steering committee monitors implementation.</td>
<td></td>
<td>1. Eligibility review.</td>
<td>1. Independent Commission for Human Rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Supervisors Field checks.</td>
<td></td>
<td>2. Quarterly Spot checks by external companies.</td>
<td>2. Media</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. Local committees to process Appeals and complaints.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5. Internal control unit checks and reports.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>~Local social protection networks</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Governmental Agencies:**
1. MOF cross checking on PNA payrolls.
3. Legislative council monitoring.

**Donors:**
1. Eligibility review.
2. Quarterly Spot checks by external companies.

**Civil Society:**
1. Independent Commission for Human Rights
2. Media
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Evaluation</th>
<th>Study Topic</th>
<th>Goal</th>
<th>Methods</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>World Bank</td>
<td>Targeting Assessment of the Cash Transfer Program</td>
<td>Before making significant changes on the current proxy means test (PMT) formula used to select beneficiaries of CTP, MoSA needs to identify strengths and weaknesses of its current method. To assess the targeting efficiency of the proxy means test (PMT) formula.</td>
<td>Quantitative household survey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DFID/ODI (Overseas Development Institute)</td>
<td>Community and Beneficiary perspectives (female headed households)</td>
<td>explore community perceptions of the cash transfer programme at individual, household and community levels, with a particular focus on the impacts on female-headed households</td>
<td>Qualitative methods</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNICEF/ODI</td>
<td>Mixed methods with a focus on child level impacts</td>
<td>UNICEF is commissioning a mixed methods study on the effects of the cash transfer on children’s well-being</td>
<td>Mixed On going</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EU</td>
<td>Mixed methods to assess impacts on households and analysis of processes and procedures</td>
<td>The global objective is to assess the social impact of the cash transfer programme in (CTP) in the West Bank and Gaza</td>
<td>Mixed On going</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Next Steps

• Recalculated benefit for families benefiting from the program.

• Develop a rational logic framework for all social protection interventions to monitor the work of social workers.

• Invest in capacity-building for social workers involved in the cash transfer programme, focusing on monitoring and evaluation (M&E) and learning approaches, as well as the specific challenges facing the most vulnerable groups (female-headed households, Bedouin communities and people with disabilities).
Next Steps

• Develop a programme governance framework, including greater decentralization and citizen participation in M&E and social accountability processes

• Strengthen grievance procedures and feedback channels (for beneficiaries and non-beneficiaries)

• Strengthen coordination among development partners and international NGOs, especially regarding M&E, information exchange and learning
Next Steps

• Create and develop linkages between MoSA and UNRWA social workers to foster cross-agency learning, exchange of experiences, and general skills and capacity-building (including through on-the-job training, coaching and mentoring)
Next Steps

• Restructuring of field work in the branch offices, taking into account the levels of data quality audit (coordinator, supervisor, researcher, data entry, official scrutiny, the follow-up committees in districts), aiming to improve the quality of the field work.

• PNCTP cost analysis.
• Thank You