Case Study: *Palestine, Cash Transfers Program*

Affiliation: *Ministry of Social Affairs*

Presenter: *Daoud AL Deek*

*Assistant Deputy Minister*
Overview of the Program

- The CTP program intends to
  - Mitigate poverty impacts on Palestinian families
- The CTP program provides
  - Regular cash transfers to poor Palestinian families (quarterly payments)
- The CTP program merged two cash assistance programs, the Special Hardship Case Program (SHC) and the Social Safety Net Reform Project (SSNRP) program
  - covers more than 95,000 poor families in Palestine
  - Families are screened by local Social Workers
  - Families are visited by Social Worker to fill up the enrolment form
  - MoSA applies the PMTF that is a Proxy for the adult equivalent household consumption.
  - Unified National Registry for Poverty in Palestine. (One data base & multi-programs).
Program Coverage

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>How many people benefited from the program?</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Men (%)</td>
<td>Women (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>38,278 (59%)</td>
<td>26,599 (41%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>53,572 (57%)</td>
<td>40,374 (43%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>55,000 (57%)</td>
<td>41,000 (43%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Program Cycle

1. Submit Application
   - MoSA Database
   - Data entry and Verifications
   - Run against the PMTF

2. List of eligible beneficiaries
   - MoSA Regional Office

3. Initial list
   - Donors
   - MoF

4. Final List
   - Local Banks

5. Final List of eligible beneficiaries

6. Lunch Payment
Interventions & Partners

MoSA MIS
One database Multi Programs

Feedback
Cross checking
Targeting Module
Potential joint programs

Line Ministries
NGOs
WFP
UNRWA
Others

Emergency Assistance
Disabled Rehabilitation Fund
Orphan Sponsorship
CTP
Health insurance
Economic Empowerment
Food aid

MoSA
MIS
Emergency Assistance
Disabled Rehabilitation Fund
Orphan Sponsorship
CTP
Health insurance
Economic Empowerment
Food aid

MoSA
MIS
Emergency Assistance
Disabled Rehabilitation Fund
Orphan Sponsorship
CTP
Health insurance
Economic Empowerment
Food aid

MoSA
MIS
Emergency Assistance
Disabled Rehabilitation Fund
Orphan Sponsorship
CTP
Health insurance
Economic Empowerment
Food aid

MoSA
MIS
Emergency Assistance
Disabled Rehabilitation Fund
Orphan Sponsorship
CTP
Health insurance
Economic Empowerment
Food aid

MoSA
MIS
Emergency Assistance
Disabled Rehabilitation Fund
Orphan Sponsorship
CTP
Health insurance
Economic Empowerment
Food aid

MoSA
MIS
Emergency Assistance
Disabled Rehabilitation Fund
Orphan Sponsorship
CTP
Health insurance
Economic Empowerment
Food aid

MoSA
MIS
Emergency Assistance
Disabled Rehabilitation Fund
Orphan Sponsorship
CTP
Health insurance
Economic Empowerment
Food aid

MoSA
MIS
Emergency Assistance
Disabled Rehabilitation Fund
Orphan Sponsorship
CTP
Health insurance
Economic Empowerment
Food aid

MoSA
MIS
Emergency Assistance
Disabled Rehabilitation Fund
Orphan Sponsorship
CTP
Health insurance
Economic Empowerment
Food aid

MoSA
MIS
Emergency Assistance
Disabled Rehabilitation Fund
Orphan Sponsorship
CTP
Health insurance
Economic Empowerment
Food aid

MoSA
MIS
Emergency Assistance
Disabled Rehabilitation Fund
Orphan Sponsorship
CTP
Health insurance
Economic Empowerment
Food aid

MoSA
MIS
Emergency Assistance
Disabled Rehabilitation Fund
Orphan Sponsorship
CTP
Health insurance
Economic Empowerment
Food aid

MoSA
MIS
Emergency Assistance
Disabled Rehabilitation Fund
Orphan Sponsorship
CTP
Health insurance
Economic Empowerment
Food aid

MoSA
MIS
Emergency Assistance
Disabled Rehabilitation Fund
Orphan Sponsorship
CTP
Health insurance
Economic Empowerment
Food aid

MoSA
MIS
Emergency Assistance
Disabled Rehabilitation Fund
Orphan Sponsorship
CTP
Health insurance
Economic Empowerment
Food aid

MoSA
MIS
Emergency Assistance
Disabled Rehabilitation Fund
Orphan Sponsorship
CTP
Health insurance
Economic Empowerment
Food aid

MoSA
MIS
Emergency Assistance
Disabled Rehabilitation Fund
Orphan Sponsorship
CTP
Health insurance
Economic Empowerment
Food aid

MoSA
MIS
Emergency Assistance
Disabled Rehabilitation Fund
Orphan Sponsorship
CTP
Health insurance
Economic Empowerment
Food aid

MoSA
MIS
Emergency Assistance
Disabled Rehabilitation Fund
Orphan Sponsorship
CTP
Health insurance
Economic Empowerment
Food aid

MoSA
MIS
Emergency Assistance
Disabled Rehabilitation Fund
Orphan Sponsorship
CTP
Health insurance
Economic Empowerment
Food aid

MoSA
MIS
Emergency Assistance
Disabled Rehabilitation Fund
Orphan Sponsorship
CTP
Health insurance
Economic Empowerment
Food aid

MoSA
MIS
Emergency Assistance
Disabled Rehabilitation Fund
Orphan Sponsorship
CTP
Health insurance
Economic Empowerment
Food aid

MoSA
MIS
Emergency Assistance
Disabled Rehabilitation Fund
Orphan Sponsorship
CTP
Health insurance
Economic Empowerment
Food aid

MoSA
MIS
Emergency Assistance
Disabled Rehabilitation Fund
Orphan Sponsorship
CTP
Health insurance
Economic Empowerment
Food aid

MoSA
MIS
Emergency Assistance
Disabled Rehabilitation Fund
Orphan Sponsorship
CTP
Health insurance
Economic Empowerment
Food aid

MoSA
MIS
Emergency Assistance
Disabled Rehabilitation Fund
Orphan Sponsorship
CTP
Health insurance
Economic Empowerment
Food aid

MoSA
MIS
Emergency Assistance
Disabled Rehabilitation Fund
Orphan Sponsorship
CTP
Health insurance
Economic Empowerment
Food aid

MoSA
MIS
Emergency Assistance
Disabled Rehabilitation Fund
Orphan Sponsorship
CTP
Health insurance
Economic Empowerment
Food aid

MoSA
MIS
Emergency Assistance
Disabled Rehabilitation Fund
Orphan Sponsorship
CTP
Health insurance
Economic Empowerment
Food aid

MoSA
MIS
Emergency Assistance
Disabled Rehabilitation Fund
Orphan Sponsorship
CTP
Health insurance
Economic Empowerment
Food aid
Challenges

1. The unique political, economic and poverty context of Palestine.
2. Multidimensional nature of poverty and vulnerability
3. Inclusion & Exclusion Errors.
4. Financial Sustainability (Reliance on External Funding)
5. LACK of a viable exit or ‘graduation’ strategy for beneficiaries, given the limited job opportunities available to vulnerable groups in the oPt.
6. M&E
7. Unconsolidated Coordination Mechanisms within and across government, development partners and NGOs
Results and Findings

- **2 Assessments recently done:**

PMTF Assessment (WB):
- The main finding of the assessment is that the large majority of applicants classified as extremely poor by the PMTF are indeed extremely poor. The model is generating indicators that are among the best in the world. The CTP targeting approach reflects its objectives of reducing the poverty gap with its emphasis on assisting extremely poor households.
- Improvements needed in terms of: extending outreach, communication, develop synergies between cash and non-cash interventions.
Community Perceptions/DFID Assessment

- Beneficiaries regard the cash transfer programme as an important but limited component of their overall economic coping strategies.
- Positive impacts at the individual, intra-household, community and state-citizen levels.
- Negative impacts:
  - **Individual level:** creating dependency, linked to the lack of a viable exit strategy for beneficiaries…
  - **At household level:** introduced new tensions and/or exacerbated pre-existing ones within extended families…
  - **At community level:** exclusion errors need to be addressed.
Lessons & Priorities

- **Targeting**
  - Take steps to reduce inclusion errors in a context of high resource scarcity
  - Complement PMTF targeting approach with qualitative assessments
  - Expedite processing time and streamline support documentation procedures
  - Introduce a cadre of MoSA data collectors to complement roles of regular social workers
  - Establish inter-agency social protection committees

- **Transfer amount and frequency**
  - Introduce payments that are inflation-indexed given spikes in cost of living
  - Increase frequency of cash transfers.

- **Capacity building**
  - Invest in capacity building for social workers involved in the CTP
  - Invest in programme awareness-raising and opportunities for cross-agency synergies
Lessons & Priorities/cont:

- **Citizen awareness-raising**
  - Invest in awareness raising efforts with programme beneficiaries and wider communities
  - Utilise the bank as a source of community-programme implementer interaction
  - Communicate programme information and success stories via radio and print media

- **Programme governance**
  - Develop a programme governance framework, including greater decentralisation and citizen participation
  - Strengthen citizen grievance procedures and feedback channels
  - Strengthen coordination among development partners, especially vis-à-vis M&E/learning.
Lessons & Priorities

- **Development of tailored packages of social assistance**
- Undertake district-specific mappings of available public, private and NGO services
- Promote shifts in gender norms, roles and expectations to strengthen the contribution of the CTP to tackling gender-specific vulnerabilities
- Develop employment counselling units within MoSA to support beneficiaries to supplement their income and gradually exit from the programme
- Develop and implement tailored social assistance and social services to people with disabilities and the chronically ill
- Develop and promote the uptake of psycho-social support services; including local community centres where beneficiaries can gather, meet and discuss.
- Provide opportunities to undertake voluntary work to support MOSA activities so as to improve citizen sense of self-worth, identity and potentially longer-term employability.
Advice to Other Countries

- Move from donor driven to national policy agenda.
- *Prioritize interventions that promote investment in human capital.*
- *Enhance targeting toward the poor and vulnerable.*
- *Improve the focus on SSN program results through M&E and social accountability.*
- *Use effective service delivery mechanisms.*
- *Develop synergies between cash and non-cash interventions.*
- Move from fragmented SP programs to SP system (rights based and protected by law) towards comprehensive programs.
- Mainstream participation and engagement of stakeholders and citizens.