Cities for a New Generation

Review and Assessment of Municipal Human Resources

Final Report
Marrakesh

June 2013
CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

1. Framework for action and aims of the consultation ................................................. 1
   1.1. Framework for action ........................................................................................................ 1
   1.2. Objectives of the consultation .......................................................................................... 1
   1.3. The terms of reference ...................................................................................................... 2
   1.4. Objectives of the intermediary report ............................................................................. 2
   1.5. The diagnosis process that was followed in each city ............................................... 2

2. Comparative overview of the three cities ..................................................................... 4
3. The main conclusions of the study ............................................................................... 10
4. The study's final report .................................................................................................... 17
   4.1. The terms of reference .................................................................................................. 17
   4.2. A distinct approach for each of the three cities ......................................................... 17
5. Discussions about the cities of tomorrow and the competencies/skills required to manage a specific area ................................................................. 18
   5.1. The cities of the new generation .................................................................................... 18
   5.2. Management, the basis of any organization ................................................................. 19
   5.3. What do municipal managers do? ................................................................................. 21
   5.4. Territorial engineering .................................................................................................. 22

PART TWO - SFAX
A. Decisions taken by the municipality .............................................................................
   1. Validation of the diagnosis ............................................................................................... Error! Bookmark not defined.
   2. Decisions taken by municipality regarding the implementation of the GSDS ........ Error! Bookmark not defined.
   2.1. Work relating to the Local Development Office (LDO) ................................................. Error! Bookmark not defined.
B. Assistance to improve the effectiveness of municipal services and the LDO .......... Error! Bookmark not defined.
   1. The structure of the Local Development Office (LDO) ............................................. Error! Bookmark not defined.
   2. Assistance for the municipal services ............................................................ Error! Bookmark not defined.
   2.1. Human resources related work ....................................................................................... Error! Bookmark not defined.
   2.2. Work relating to departmental organization to better support the LDO ............. Error! Bookmark not defined.
   2.3. Manager training ........................................................................................................ Error! Bookmark not defined.
   3. Recommendations relating to the national statutory and regulatory framework .... Error! Bookmark not defined.

PART THREE - SAIDA
1. The municipality's comments on the diagnosis of its human resources situation Error! Bookmark not defined.
1.1 The diagnosis was sent to Saida on March 13, 2013.

1.2 The comments of the municipality's representatives and their validation of the diagnosis.

2. Development of the Saida city strategy.

2.1 A committee of experts has been set up to prepare the strategy.

2.2 The strategy is structured around several debate themes.

2.3 The debates about the extent of the city strategy.

2.4 A city development strategy is a difficult exercise in the Lebanese context.

3. The implementation of Saida's future development strategy.

3.1 The city is not yet ready to implement the strategy.

3.2 The human resources needed to implement the development strategy.

3.3 Possible solutions.

3.4 Presentation of several scenarios for the strategy's implementing structure.

3.5 Training.

Appendices.

Four scenarios for the implementation of the city of Saida's development strategy.

Six job descriptions for the attention of the human resources personnel charged with rolling out the strategy.

PART FOUR - MARRAKESH

A. Decisions taken by the municipality of Marrakesh.

1. Validation of the diagnosis.

2. The decisions to be confirmed by the municipality relating to the implementation of the PCD.

2.1 The creation of a strategic committee to guide the PCD.

2.2 Role of the strategic committee.

2.3 The strategic committee’s decision is well-timed as it satisfies two requirements.

B. Challenges facing the city of Marrakesh and its strategy for the new generation.

1. A vision of the city of Marrakesh in 2030.

2. The city must begin to prepare for the future now.

C. Work required to improve the municipality's structures.

1. Many improvements may be made rapidly.

1.1 Workshop 1: Internal communications and access to information.

1.2 Workshop 2: PCD: structure, cross-cutting operation and future.

1.3 Workshop 3: Setting up a system for the sharing of technical information, preparatory to computerization.

1.4 Workshop 4: Strategic management of jobs and person profiles / HRM.

2. HRM tools and training.
2.1. Many HRM tools, adapted for Morocco, can be accessed on the Internet ...........44
2.2. Training and assistance with change .................................................................44
D. Recommendations at national level.................................................................45
  1. Recommendations relating to the national statutory and regulatory framework ....45
  2. Recommendations relating to human resources management at national level ....46
  3. Take better account of the global nature of local strategic factors ......................48
E. Conclusion .............................................................................................................48
GENERAL APPENDICES ...........................................................................................50
Statement/summary by city: Sfax ...........................................................................50
Statement/summary by city: Saida ...........................................................................52
Statement/summary by city: Marrakesh .................................................................54
An international experience: strategic plans in Turkish cities ................................56
Proposal for South-South discussions ...................................................................23
Executive Summary

The aim of the World Bank's Cities for a New Generation project is to better define the capacities necessary for the urban authorities in the south Mediterranean region if they are to assume responsibility for their economic and socio-spatial development. This includes the capacities of the authorities themselves as well as those of the local actors in general. The project has a Human Resources component, which is the subject of this study.

The purpose of the study is to provide an analysis of the competencies currently being developed by the local authorities in three cities and their capacity to implement their City Development Strategies (CDS). For this purpose, case studies were carried out on the cities of Sfax (Tunisia), Saida (Lebanon) and Marrakesh (Morocco). Under the terms of reference, the mission is "to assist the core Municipality [...] with identifying know-how, skills and organizational improvements necessary so that municipal staff best meet the needs of the citizens in terms of providing services, carrying out the CDS strategies, and the action plans stemming from the CDS elaboration".

Consultants from Egis Bdpa, the consultancy commissioned by the World Bank, visited the three cities in question:

- **Sfax**, from 14 to 18 January 2013 (Jean-Michel Lebreton, Pierre Couté and Morched Chabbi), then from 11 to 15 March 2013 (Jean-Michel Lebreton and Adel Saïdi);
- **Saida**, from 20 to 25 January 2013 (Jean-Michel Lebreton, Pierre Couté and Nabil Menhem), then from 25 to 29 March 2013 (Jean-Michel Lebreton and Nabil Menhem);
- **Marrakesh**, from 28 January to 1 February 2013 (Jean-Michel Lebreton, Pierre Couté and Firdaouss Kaghad), then from 14 to 19 April 2013 (Jean-Michel Lebreton and Firdaouss Kaghad).

**Sfax**, Tunisia's second largest city and economic centre, prepared the Greater Sfax Development Strategy (GSDS) voluntarily before 2005, completing it in 2010. The GSDS, which covers the city of Sfax and seven partner municipalities (with a total population of around 600,000), is considered to be a model in terms of its methodology and participatory approach. Its long term strategies stretch as far as 2016. It has not been implemented due to the municipal elections in 2010 followed by the Revolution in January 2011, which itself was followed by the successive appointments of two special delegations by the Ministry of the Interior.

**Saida**, the third largest city in Lebanon (covering 7 sq. km. with a population of 60,000 including 40,000 Palestinian refugees, for whom the municipality does not accept responsibility) began to prepare a CDS voluntarily at the end of 2012. It was supported by the Sustainable Urban Development Strategy Project, with financing from the European Union and technical assistance from MedCities. The CDS is due to be delivered in April 2014, while the territorial limits of the strategy are still under discussion.

**Marrakesh**, the fourth largest city in Morocco, has completed its City Investment Plan, Plan Communal de Développement (PCD), which covers the period 2011-2016, i.e. the medium term. The plan is mandatory under its municipal charter. Mainly under the direction of local authority managers, the PCD relates to the municipality of Marrakesh and its five districts, which were autonomous municipalities until recently. The total area concerned has a population of more than 800,000.
A diagnosis was produced, after the initial visits to the three cities, presenting the situation of each city in terms of its capacities and competencies and institutional problems at local and national levels. The main difficulties to be dealt with during the second phase of the study were also identified. The diagnosis referred to the concept of project ownership or the capacity to govern an area. This capacity has four components which are specific to municipalities: the political (centered on the role of elected officials); the organizational (centered, firstly, on the national institutional state and, secondly, on the internal functioning of municipal services); the technical (centered on the human professional competencies/skills required for the proper delivery of services); and the interactions between the municipality and the actors and partners located inside and outside the area.

The comprehensive diagnosis was sent to each city. It shows that each, to varying degrees, is not managing to carry out their fundamental responsibilities (local public services, maintenance of highways and public facilities, waste disposal, cleanliness, transport and traffic, slaughterhouses, etc.) to a satisfactory standard.

The study sets out the causes for the human resources failings in each city. All three share certain problems: unattractive working conditions for managers (salaries, career prospects, working environment), with conditions inferior to those enjoyed by civil servants working for the State; serious lack of managers; recruitment frozen because the total wage bill is already over budget; frequent intervention of certain elected officials in the management of services; no management and inadequate organization in working methods and internal communications; rudimentary, and inadequate equipment; human resources not managed; no account taken of performance. Because the municipalities are not able to offer better working conditions, they are losing skills and specialist human resources. Although some efforts have been made, the management of the municipalities remains archaic, which is not the case in many other public or private organizations observed in their countries.

Against this background the implementation of the CDS, (i.e. an additional, complex, specialist, strategic assignment), is a real problem.

A CDS can only be implemented if a number of conditions are in place, which are still lacking in all three municipalities. These are, particularly: a new type of governance on the part of the elected officials; additional, highly qualified, human resources; new skills and new functions (strategic planning, project management, monitoring and evaluation, communication plans, mediation, presentation and lobbying, negotiation); a new method of working in project teams and of behaving, both inside and outside the municipalities; fluid, cross-cutting organization to improve responsiveness, observance of deadlines, performance, transparency and communications; increased resources, particularly IT resources; greatly improved statutory working conditions; and, finally, the idea that work is meaningful.

Three stonemasons are asked "what are you doing?"
The first one says: "I am cutting a stone."
The second one says: "I am earning my living."
The third one says: "I am building a mosque (or a cathedral)."

In more technical terms, the implementation of a CDS also involves monitoring consistency and compatibility with other local or national projects; planning and coordinating the work of different departments within the municipality, State departments and other actors (international cooperation, civil society, consultancies, etc); taking decisions to reframe plans or update projects that are underway; and providing a monitoring and forward planning function.

In consequence, as things stand, the municipalities find it difficult to be the main actor in their own local development, of which the CDS is one of the preferred tools. These strategies
which allow for the implementation of targeted, short term, initiatives, form part of a long-term vision. They offer all urban actors (elected officials, public municipal, national public, private sector and associations) an opportunity to contribute to the development of their own metropolitan area. The strategic vision includes many projects encompassing all fields of development: improvement of the metropolitan area; access to basic services for the population; and ambitious economic projects (real estate, infrastructure, promotion of new industries, science and technology parks, etc). The Moroccan Ministry of the Interior understands the importance of these aims and it has made the PCD mandatory for municipalities. Given the pressure from the population, who find it ever more difficult to tolerate their living conditions, States need this local development, which contributes to national development. However, these same States do not always make it easy for authorities to implement their plans.

Therefore, if a CDS is to be implemented, the municipality's operating methods need to be radically upgraded, both at the institutional level (supervisory bodies) and in terms of competencies, management methods and current practices. All aspects of municipal management are affected.

* * *

The introduction of the CDS in the three municipalities has triggered a strong reaction from the elected officials who are most affected, and from the most motivated managers. How can this new development mission be put into effect? Aware that it cannot be fulfilled by the municipality in its current state, these two groups recognize that reforms must be made in order to make their municipality operational, modern, in step with the needs of the population and credible in the eyes of voters.

The consultants met elected officials who are keen for change and, above all, many far-sighted, lucid, competent and motivated managers who are ready to help build the cities of tomorrow.

The CDS have shed light on the state of the municipalities and are driving change in many forms.

**The obligation to improve the day-to-day management of municipal services in order to implement the CDS**

On the basis of the consultants' diagnosis and their own daily experience, the municipal decision-makers who we met during the second visit to each city, agreed to identify areas for improvement in the daily management of their city and to prioritize them. These ideas were then presented and developed in workshops led by the consultants. The workshops produced clear and realistic action plans that could be implemented in the municipalities immediately. This is the first achievement of the study.

These action plans respond to the main problems and malfunctions. They are explained in detail in the final report in the form of operational tables presenting the objectives, activities and sub-activities, the persons in charge, etc.

In Sfax, the action plans cover the following areas:

- Management of human resources: training of municipal officials; motivation; recruitment; assignment and reassignment; better communication.
- Internal organization of municipal departments: setting up of a geographical information system; creation of an electronic helpline for all departments; improvements in work organization in the departments; improvements in internal
communications between departments; creation of remote public services; gaining a
better understanding of the costs of certain municipal activities.

In Saida, action plans a more difficult to devise as the city has very few employees. The
municipality has only one senior manager and four category 2 managers (head of the
technical department, head of the Fire Brigade, head of the Health Department and the
police chief). The city has more employees working on short-term contracts than employees
holding permanent contracts.

In Marrakesh, action plans were chosen to cover the following areas:
- Internal communications and access to information
- PCD: structure, cross-cutting organization and future
- Setting up of a system for the sharing of technical information prior to computerization
- Strategic management of posts and profiles (HRM)

The obligation to revise the municipal organization chart in order to create an entity to
oversee the implementation of the CDS

For all the foregoing reasons, and because of its cross-cutting mission, the structure with
responsibility for the CDS cannot be one of the municipal departments. It was clear from the
discussions in Sfax and Marrakesh that it should not be part of the municipality's traditional
organization and should report directly to the General Secretary. The decision-makers also
decided what the missions of this entity would be and who should be appointed to it. The
structure will have a multi-purpose function with core members working as a project team, in
an open and flexible way. This core should include four to five managers. The head of the
structure should be a strategic manager, with experience of strategic planning and a
participatory approach, with proven inter-personal skills and acknowledged credibility. This
person will work with a planning manager, mediator manager (public relations and marketing
in the local area), a financial manager/management controller and a personal assistant.
Depending on needs, this structure will call upon specialists to deal with particular problems,
who will be either managers from operational departments or external experts.

In order to implement the Greater Sfax Development Strategy (GSDS) the municipality of
Sfax decided to create a structure of this type, called the Local Development Office (LDO).
Discussions on the same topic are now very advanced in Marrakesh. This work on the
structure of the CDS is the study's second achievement. In Sfax, the action taken by the
French Caisse des dépôts et consignations, and its numerous missions, considerably
accelerated the decision-making process.

As the Saida CDS is still in preparation, the actors' attention has turned to the construction of
a strategic vision and the agreement that must be found on the extent of the area concerned.
The structure that will implement the CDS is not yet under discussion. It would however be
unwise to neglect this issue, if only to avoid a period of inactivity between the delivery of
the strategy and the commencement of the work (which can sometimes last for several years, as
in Sfax).

The report presents outline structures for the three cities, and shows the functional links with
municipal divisions and departments. In the case of Saida, the small number of municipal
employees and extremely small number of managers means that an innovative structure
must be found, which could be both outside the municipality and under its control, as a sort
of municipal consultancy led by representatives of civil society. Possible structures are
suggested in the report, with an explanation of their advantages and disadvantages.
The report also includes job descriptions, particularly for the city of Sfax: six for the members of the LDO; five to make up a human resources department; three to better define the decentralized cooperation department; two to better describe municipal communications roles. The Local Governance project in Morocco, which was initiated by the Canadian International Development Agency and the DGCL (Direction Générale des Collectivités Locales), includes close to 200 descriptions of jobs with municipalities, which can be accessed online.

The change will be triggered by the CDS structures

Once these structures are in operation, they will encourage the municipalities to work differently. Each one will therefore experience a pre-CDS and a post-CDS phase.

The CDS structures prefigure the new municipalities. They will encourage innovation and continuous improvement. Their role will be to capitalize on the lessons learnt by contributing to the analysis of problems and consultations about internal organization. They will provide the decision-makers (elected officials, General Secretary) with feedback on the results and performance of the operational entities, which will involve discussions about internal organization, job profiles, specific recruitment needs, internal procedures and processes.

The operation of the CDS structures, which will be fluid with variable geometry, depending on needs, will be a model from which the municipalities may draw inspiration in their efforts to modernize all their departments.

*  *

This whole approach is new for the municipalities in both technical and cultural terms and in terms of prevailing attitudes. If the CDS are to succeed, appropriate assistance will have to be provided.

Three types of assistance will be necessary, if the CDS structures are to be put in place and made to operate effectively. It will have to be provided by the municipality itself and by the national ministry with responsibility for local authorities and decentralization; external technical assistance will also be required.

The municipality

Elected officials and senior managers (including general secretaries, when such individuals exist) must commit to initiating and assisting the “cultural revolution” in the municipalities. Waiting without making a decision is counter-productive and impacts negatively on the population, increasing the suspicion that people often feel towards the city authority. Courageous decisions (i.e. decisions that are innovative and counter to ingrained habits), must be taken regarding the best structure to adopt to implement the CDS, and to clean up the current situation in the municipalities.

Because the municipality of Sfax has decided to set up a Local Development Office (LDO), they must now take action. As the managers in Sfax and Marrakesh have prepared a series of precise action plans, which are both realistic and participatory, they must be implemented without delay, especially as some of them involve little or no financial cost.
External technical assistance
While the municipalities do not have enough managers, the ones they do have are responsible, competent and devoted to their city. They are ready to begin the change and have been involved in the preparation of the action plans. They need technical assistance.

The technical assistance might relate to the implementation and follow-up of action plans. The external experts will enable managers to take their plans further or complete some of them, they will assist with and encourage the implementation of the plans, they will persuade the individuals concerned to commit to the change, they will provide practical training on the ground, help to resolve blockages and find objective solutions in a dispassionate manner. Finally, they will provide advice and expertise in a field which, for some, will be new.

With respect to the CDS structures, managers may be helped to achieve the following ends: to define the objectives of the CDS structure; to determine functional relations with elected officials and managers; to prepare a methodological framework within which the strategy projects may be implemented; to plan the work to be carried out in the first year with the option to carry out a project that is relatively simple to organize, which will serve as a test; to determine means of communication, particularly with respect to data transmission between departments and the CDS structure, in order, for example, to feed the GIS system better.

The assistance may also relate to human resources management. Managers may be helped to set up a Human Resources Management section with managers who will have been appointed.

Sfax is beginning to receive technical assistance from a national expert, who is financed and supported by the French Caisse des dépôts et consignations. Marrakesh will have to seek assistance from international sponsors. Technical assistance will only be of interest to Saida when it begins to think about the system it will use to implement its CDS, which will have to be sustainable, objective and under the responsibility of the municipality.

State assistance
Up to now, the States, acting through their Interior Ministries, which have responsibility for local authorities, have provided little assistance for the cities that have embarked upon a CDS. The Moroccan local authorities help them to carry out projects but provide little assistance in institutional terms, particularly with respect to organization and human resources.

Generally speaking, it is clear that the supervisory bodies cannot ask or oblige cities to take on more responsibilities (such as local development) without providing them with the necessary resources (legal, human and financial). In Morocco, the orders implementing the Charte communale with respect to human resources management have still not been issued. These concern, for example, the role to be played by elected officials in the recruitment, allocation and appointment of managers or the allocation of responsibilities between the Leader of the municipal council and the General Secretary. The fact that they have not yet appeared only increases the municipalities' difficulties.

In Tunisia, municipalities are seeking a framework law. A structured national debate could be launched to consider this issue. The ideas generated could be included in the future decentralization policy.

Generally speaking, in all three countries, especially Lebanon and Morocco, the State must improve the status of municipal employees. Why are managers of municipalities paid less than their counterparts in the national civil service? How can this be justified? At the present time, the working conditions and (salaries, career prospects) do not attract either the best specialists or the best managers. This trend must be reversed. Otherwise, the municipalities,
which are already considered to be minor institutions, will be even less able to fulfill their basic role on behalf of the population and will be incapable of participating in local development. Social peace has a price.

Human resources management (HRM) in the municipalities must be reviewed, recognized as a profession and established. Why is this area, which is considered to be so important in the private sector, totally neglected in the municipalities, even though greater expertise is demanded of them and some employ several thousand people? National decision-makers are therefore asked to professionalize and decentralize human resources management in the major municipalities. In Tunisia, the Local Authorities Code (Code des Collectivités) must be revised in order to allow the municipalities to have their own recruitment plan.

Training must be adapted to the municipalities’ real needs, in three areas particularly: human resources management; the systematic practice of management techniques; the new jobs introduced by the CDS (strategic planning, program management, project management, mediation, marketing in the local area, marketing, external communications, organization of committees and working groups, etc). The training centers (CFAD in Tunisia, the centre run by the Lebanese Ministry of the Interior and DFCAT, run by the Moroccan Ministry of the Interior) may play a major role.

Finally, if the principles of strategic workforce planning (GPEEC in French) are more widely known, some political and administrative decision-makers should find it easier to resist the pressure of requests for positions in the civil service from some members of the public. Poor recruitment practice has negative repercussions for the municipality which may last up to around 40 years.
• **Framework for action and aims of the consultation**

• **Content of the intermediary report: the diagnoses of the three municipalities**

• **Main conclusions of the study**

• **Final report: objectives, methods and content**

• **Cross-cutting discussions about the competencies required for territorial engineering**
1. Framework for action and aims of the consultation

1.1. Framework for action

The aim of the World Bank's Cities for a New Generation project is to better define the capacities of the urban authorities in the south Mediterranean region that are necessary if they are to assume responsibility for their economic and socio-spatial development, in terms of the authorities themselves and local actors in general. This project includes a "Human Resources" dimension, which is the subject of this study.

The purpose of the study is to provide an analysis of the competencies/skills that are currently being developed by the local authorities in these cities and their capacity to implement their City Development Strategies (CDS).

To this end, a case study of the cities of Saida (Lebanon), Marrakesh (Morocco) and Sfax (Tunisia) was undertaken and is the subject of this final report.

The aim of the Consultant's recommendations is to provide support for the municipal authorities, where necessary, in their organizational development by identifying the competencies/skills required and offering training programs and incentives, where appropriate, within the local and national statutory and regulatory framework. It is clear that this framework is shifting as significant reforms are underway: in Morocco, for example, the move towards decentralization has begun and, in Tunisia, the revision of the missions and competencies of local authorities is under discussion.

1.2. Objectives of the consultation

The review of the municipalities' human resources aims to:

(i) Create a common understanding among the actors of the competencies/skills required by the municipalities, among their own staff and agents, in order to prepare and implement a City Development Strategy (CDS).

(ii) Describe the current state of the human resources available to the municipalities and to identify the objectives to be achieved in this field in order to allow for the development strategy to be implemented successfully at local level.

(iii) To suggest a series of prioritized actions setting out the necessary stages that must be followed in order to achieve this objective, in terms of new regulations, planning and effective implementation.

(iv) To make recommendations for the national statutory and regulatory framework, which has a role to play in strengthening competencies/skills at local level for the purposes of the CDS.

Therefore the mission involves assisting "the core Municipality [...] with identifying know-how, skills and organizational improvements necessary so that municipal staff best meet the needs of the citizens in terms of providing services, carrying out the CDS strategies, and the action plans stemming from the CDS elaboration".

A first initial report was presented to the World Bank on 7 January 2013.
Intermediary report resulting from the diagnosis of each municipality

1.3. The terms of reference

"The final product of the second phase is an intermediary report which will comprise:

a. A preliminary diagnosis of the local situation in each of the cities, in terms of capacities, competencies/skills and institutional problems at local and national levels;
b. The main difficulties and main areas that must be dealt with during the next phase of the study;
c. An updated version of the technical proposal showing a scheme of work that might include minor changes to the methodology and activities."

Finally the terms of reference stipulate that the report “will incorporate the requests for clarifications and comments obtained from the local and national counterparts, from the World Bank – CMI team.”

1.4. Objectives of the intermediary report

- To provide the municipalities' decision-makers with information relating to human resources to enable them to implement their city strategy.

This information included the consultants' diagnosis, based on actual visits to the municipalities. It showed the strong points and the areas for improvement in terms of municipal governance. It included initiatives previously taken by the municipalities or further to cooperation projects.

- To allow the municipal decision-makers, once in possession of the information, to make choices about possible changes to be made in order to improve the working of their municipal administration.

1.5. The diagnosis process that was followed in each city

a. Visits to the three cities

The aim of the first mission on the ground was to prepare a quantitative and qualitative diagnosis of the staff of the three municipalities, particularly the senior and middle managers, in connection with the implementation of their City Development Strategy.

Consultants from Egis Bdpa, the consultancy commissioned by the World Bank, visited the three cities in question:

- Sfax, from 14 to 18 January 2013 (Jean-Michel Lebreton, Pierre Couté and Morched Chabbi), then from 11 to 15 March 2013 (Jean-Michel Lebreton and Adel Saïdi);
- Saida, from 20 to 25 January 2013 (Jean-Michel Lebreton, Pierre Couté and Nabil Menhem),
- Marrakesh, from 28 January to 1 February 2013 (Jean-Michel Lebreton, Pierre Couté and Firdaousse Kaghad).
The general approach of the diagnosis

The program of meetings was prepared by each municipality on the basis of exchanges launched by the consultants before the mission began and proposals for interviews made by the team.

More than 50 individuals were contacted in Sfax, 20 in Saida and more than 70 in Marrakesh.

b. Diagnosis and overview of a municipality

The implementation of a city strategy cannot be severed from the general functioning of the municipality. A study relating to the improvement of the implementing structure (CDS) cannot be considered separately from all the functions that allow a municipality to fulfill its responsibilities. The overview relates to the concept of project ownership which, in reality, means its capacity to govern its area.

This capacity can be broken down into four major spheres: political, technical, organizational and territorial. Therefore the diagnosis looked at these four spheres, which are described in the following chart, in detail.

---

1 F3E, Cités Unies France and Programme d'Appui à la Décentralisation, under the aegis of the French Coopération Décentralisée scheme (which provides assistance to developing countries via cooperation between local authorities in France and the foreign country), April 2009.
## 2. Comparative overview of the three cities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Sfax</th>
<th>Saida</th>
<th>Marrakesh</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
Country’s 2nd largest city  
Metropolitan area: 600,000 | 60,000 including 40,000 Palestinian refugees  
Country’s 3rd largest city  
Saida metropolitan area: 266,000 | 830,000 (metropolitan area) in 2004  
Country’s 4th largest city |
| Geography                   | 270 km from Tunis  
Metropolitan area: 22 hectares | 40 km from Beirut  
Saida: 7 sq. km.  
Metropolitan area: 25 sq. km. | 350 km from Rabat  
Metropolitan area: 181 sq. km. |
| Most recent election        | Electoral process interrupted after the Revolution (January 2011)  
|                            | May 2010                                                             | June 2009                                                             |
| Term of office              | No official date for municipal elections  
|                            | 6 years; next elections in 2016                                      | 6 years; next elections in  
|                            |                                                                      | 2015                                                                  |
| Status of the municipal Council | Currently: 2nd special delegation appointed by the Ministry of the  
Interior in October 2012 | 21 members  
13 municipal committees | Urban municipal council: 96 elected members  
With the 5 districts: 199 elected members  
(5 municipalities absorbed recently, now districts) |
| Supervisory body            | Strong  
No assistance for the municipality  
Currently paralyzed; pre-revolution provisions still applied | Strong  
No assistance for the municipality | Strong  
Positive assistance for the municipality |
| Status of the decentralization | State currently weak as under reform. Provisions from the old regime still apply. | State weak  
Strong, rigid centralization  
Decentralization not envisaged | Many decentralization provisions are ready or still being examined  
The reform process is slow; decisions are |
Principles of decentralization under discussion (National Constituent Assembly committees)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Sfax</th>
<th>Saida</th>
<th>Marrakesh</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>General Secretary (status)</td>
<td>Head of the municipal administration</td>
<td>No GS. By law the mayor is the head of the municipal administration</td>
<td>“The Leader runs the municipal departments. He is the head of the municipal staff” (Charte Communale)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Risk of political interference in technical matters</td>
<td>Risk of political interference in technical matters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total number of municipal staff (all categories combined)</td>
<td>Approx. 1,644</td>
<td>190</td>
<td>Total workforce: 3,124 (in 2012) including: 1,705 (municipality) and 1,400 (workforce of the 5 districts)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of senior and middle managers</td>
<td>274 plus 71 vacant posts</td>
<td>1 senior manager 4 category 2 managers</td>
<td>151 senior managers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage of managerial staff</td>
<td>5.5 to 9% depending on the calculations</td>
<td>Less than 3%</td>
<td>From 4.7 to 8.3% depending on the calculations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Distribution among categories of managers</td>
<td>Imbalance against technical managers</td>
<td>Note: the number of staff working on [short term] contracts exceeds the number of permanent staff</td>
<td>Imbalance between technical managers (25% of managers) and senior managers (75% of managers)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age of managers</td>
<td>&gt; 50 years on average</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wage bill</td>
<td>67% of the total budget, 17% over budget</td>
<td>67% of the total budget</td>
<td>35% while the recommended percentage is 25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recruitment</td>
<td>Recruitment frozen Recruitment under external not municipal control Managers’ salaries paid by the municipality from its own resources (falling)</td>
<td>Recruitment possible but slow and difficult (supervisory body) Salaries paid by the municipality from its own resources</td>
<td>Recruitment frozen or has to be authorized by the Directorate of Local Authorities Salaries paid by the municipality. Little control exercised over the selection of managers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Item</td>
<td>Sfax</td>
<td>Saida</td>
<td>Marrakesh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Managers’ salaries</td>
<td>Single scale for all public service jobs (including municipalities), with no difference between municipal and central managers</td>
<td>Single scale for all public service jobs but municipal managers' scale is one grade below that of the national public service</td>
<td>Single scale for all public service jobs but the special status of the staff of local authorities does not allow for bonuses (up to 30% of the salary) nor any other benefits (junior engineer salary: approx. MAD7,500 (EUR670)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Approx. net monthly salary for newly qualified engineer: TND900 (EUR420); principal engineer: TND1,500 (EUR700).</td>
<td>Municipal engineer salary: from USD800 to 1,200 /month</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Salary differential between a municipal and a private sector engineer</td>
<td>Private sector engineers, first years of service (2013): IT/telecoms: TND 950 (EUR450) Electricity/energy: TND750 (EUR350) Civil/mechanical: TND1,050 (EUR500)</td>
<td>Private sector engineer: from USD1,200 /month (start of career) to USD8,000 /month (end of career). Source: Supervisory authority Statistics, 2012</td>
<td>Private sector engineer (IT, statistician, banking) first years: approx. MAD10,000 to 13,000 (EUR900 to 1,170). A difference of around 60% between the public and private sectors.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rapid progression. With 10 years' experience approx. TND3,000 (EUR1,400), i.e. twice as much as a principal engineer in public service</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Careers and attractiveness</td>
<td>No career progression</td>
<td>No career progression</td>
<td>Status of local authority employees unattractive People with competencies/skills leave for other sectors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Municipal careers not attractive</td>
<td>Municipal careers not attractive People with competencies/skills leave for other sectors</td>
<td>Few candidates for managerial positions with the municipality</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internal mobility</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Mobility not applicable</td>
<td>Difficult but achievable after negotiations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human Resources</td>
<td>No HRM</td>
<td>No HRM</td>
<td>Department charged with the administrative</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Consultancy services for a municipal resources review and assessment / Cities for a New Generation / World Bank - Page 7

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Management (HRM)</th>
<th>Department charged with the administrative management of the personnel</th>
<th>The same manager runs the administrative and finance departments + personnel management</th>
<th>management of the personnel Another department charged with thinking about HRM, as part of the modernization</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Sfax</th>
<th>Saida</th>
<th>Marrakesh</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Capacity to outsource municipal services (project ownership)</td>
<td>The large cities, including Sfax, are well equipped to outsource contracts (calls for tenders, terms of reference, specifications, assessment of tenders). Assistance may be provided by technical departments (Ministry of Infrastructure). The outsourcing of the management of solid waste is a positive experience for many municipalities.</td>
<td>Given the limited number of employees and the managerial culture of the elected officials, urban services are generally outsourced (waste collection, street sweeping, green spaces, maintenance of the stadium, emergency services, etc.).</td>
<td>The results of outsourcing in 2004 were mixed: generally satisfactory for urban transport; not satisfactory for waste collection and cleanliness. For 2014 (end of the contracts), the elected officials would prefer to have services managed through a semi-public company.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Computerization of services</td>
<td>Efforts being made Intranet about to become operational; personnel unwilling</td>
<td>Acceptable but inadequate No intranet</td>
<td>Efforts being made No intranet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Town hall website</td>
<td>Obsolete About to be modernized</td>
<td>Obsolete</td>
<td>Being reformed and modernized</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GIS</td>
<td>Inadequate (only 3 layers); not updated / information not added</td>
<td>Not operational</td>
<td>Managed by 4 technicians but to be developed and updated</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Item</td>
<td>Sfax</td>
<td>Saida</td>
<td>Marrakesh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **Specific problems** | • Municipality not elected therefore not legitimized  
• Serious lack of technical managers + managers ageing  
• General management of services archaic  
• No HRM  
• No internal communications between departments  
• Weakness of external communications  
• New law for municipalities expected  
• Need for external technical assistance with the creation of a Local Development Office (LDO) | • Total lack of managers and resources  
• Local political problems and conflicts relating to Lebanese culture and the country's political situation  
• No moves towards decentralization hoped for  
• The municipality is incapable of implementing a development strategy  
Needs an external structure to implement its development strategy | • No HRM at this time  
• Insufficient use made of many managers' competencies/skills  
• Internal communications between departments weak  
• Almost no external communications with citizens  
• Absorption of districts not finished  
• Manager training inadequate  
• Need for better internal organization in order to improve the implementation of its development strategy |
| **Strong points in the diagnosis** | • Willingness to change, to modernize and do better  
• Setting up of IT resources (intranet, messaging system, etc.)  
• Willingness to communicate better with the citizens  
• Strong civil society, ready to collaborate  
• International sponsors ready to collaborate | • Civil society very strong  
• International sponsors ready to collaborate | • Willingness to modernize and launch a modernization process (particularly for HRM)  
• Some managers dynamic and competent, in spite of difficulties  
• Initiatives: revision of the organization chart; creation of a structured team to implement the PCD; coordination between the municipality and its districts; improvement of public reception services; etc.  
• Efforts to computerize in spite of being spread over a wide area  
• Support from local authorities (Directorate of Local Authorities)  
• International sponsors ready to collaborate |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Sfax</th>
<th>Saida</th>
<th>Marrakesh</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>End date for the preparation of the CDS</td>
<td>The Greater Sfax CDS was begun in 2002 and finished in 2008</td>
<td>Begun in October 2012, will be finished in April 2014</td>
<td>The Plan Communal de Développement (PCD) was finished in June 2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Status of the CDS</td>
<td>Long term strategy</td>
<td>Long term strategy</td>
<td>Medium term strategy (2011-2016)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Greater Sfax CDS is considered to be relevant but updating would be useful</td>
<td>Planned only for the city of Saida, discussions are underway on adjusting the scope of the program by expanding the area covered</td>
<td>The PCD is the municipality's road map</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Authors and partners of the CDS</td>
<td>On a voluntary basis (1st one in Tunisia).</td>
<td>On a voluntary basis (at least 4 other CDS in Lebanon)</td>
<td>Under the Charte Communale, the PCD is mandatory for all municipalities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Driven by: municipality and civil society.</td>
<td>Driven by: an EU project with the participation of the municipality</td>
<td>Driven by: the municipality (which sees itself as the owner), the local DLA and members of civil society</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scope of the CDS</td>
<td>Greater Sfax, consisting of Sfax + 7 partner municipalities (which has no legal status).</td>
<td>Planned for Saida only, but inclusion of surrounding municipalities is under discussion. Break between Saida and the local union of municipalities</td>
<td>Marrakesh and its 5 districts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financing and preparation of the CDS</td>
<td>Many international contributions</td>
<td>EU funding + Hariri Foundation, with technical assistance from MedCities</td>
<td>Municipal initiative with assistance from the local authorities including the Directorate of Local Authorities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Municipality's commitment to the CDS</td>
<td>Commitment in the absence of action by the special delegation The Greater Sfax CDS is a legacy (the municipal actors who were involved in the CDS are no longer present) Sustainability weak</td>
<td>Discussions about the municipality's commitment among many internal and external actors</td>
<td>Strong commitment The current municipal team was involved in drawing up the CDS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sustainability not certain at this time</td>
<td>Sustainability strong</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Implementation of the CDS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Sfax</th>
<th>Saida</th>
<th>Marrakesh</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Implementation of the CDS</td>
<td>No implementing structure</td>
<td>Consultation considered to be premature</td>
<td>An initial (provisional) implementing structure exists, but is incorporated in the divisions; some projects have started</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local civil society</td>
<td>Civil society strong and active. But the municipality needs to build up its credibility</td>
<td>Very strong Tradition and culture of collaboration between the municipality and civil society</td>
<td>Fairly strong</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Date of the first consultation assignment (diagnosis)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Sfax</th>
<th>Saida</th>
<th>Marrakesh</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Date of the first consultation assignment</td>
<td>14-18 January 2013</td>
<td>21-25 January 2013</td>
<td>28 January -1 February 2013</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Date of the second consultation assignment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Sfax</th>
<th>Saida</th>
<th>Marrakesh</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Date of the second consultation assignment</td>
<td>11-15 March 2013</td>
<td>25-29 February 2013</td>
<td>15-19 April 2013</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3. The main conclusions of the study

The development strategies require the cities to be managed differently

The city development strategies (CDS), which aim to promote local, economic and social development, appear to be new assignments for the three cities, whether mandatory, as in the case of Marrakesh, or voluntary, as in the case of Saida and Sfax. They add to the fundamental responsibilities that these cities try, with considerable difficulty, to assume. The arrival of a CDS forces local decision-makers to look afresh at their situation and respond energetically in order to improve their basic structure and functioning.

The implementation of a CDS, which involves the management of strategic planning, setting up partnerships with numerous external actors and partners, local communications and marketing, and collaboration between different areas of expertise, cannot be organized according to traditional models and practices. City development strategies bring change. They force cities to adopt new methods of working and new skills that were hitherto unknown in these places. The CDS and the staff charged with implementation are the drivers of change and modernization.

The cities that embark upon this venture need assistance, in order to make a success of the CDS and confirm their own credibility. It must be provided by local political decision-makers, international organizations, which can provide expertise, and States. These need to change their institutional frameworks, by decentralizing power, improving the status of municipal officials, and acknowledging HRM functions, in order not to hinder the municipalities’ new missions and to allow local development.

3.1. National development will be achieved through local economic and social development

The CDS are one of the main drivers of local development. They form part of a long-term vision while allowing for the implementation of short-term, targeted initiatives. They also provide an opportunity for all the urban actors (elected officials, municipal officials, national officials, private sector actors and associations) to contribute to the development of their city. Morocco clearly understands this function as the Ministry of the Interior requires all its municipalities to have a PCD (Plan Communal de Développement).

The concept of local development is easy to verify within the spatial dimension of a CDS which encompasses the surrounding metropolitan area. This applies particularly to the Greater Sfax Development Strategy. In Saida the current discussions relate to the limits of the city strategy which, apparently, must go beyond the city boundaries. The Marrakesh PCD forms part of the policy of treating the city and the surrounding metropolitan area as a single entity, in that it covers the central municipality and its new districts which, only a short while ago, were autonomous municipalities.

The concept of development can also be verified by examining the content of a CDS. The vision is embodied in numerous projects which relate to all areas of development: improvement of the metropolitan area; access to basic services for the population; ambitious economic projects (real estate, infrastructure, promotion of new economic sectors, science and technology parks, etc). These projects are therefore genuine local development projects which can only have positive consequences nationwide.
The CDS use local initiatives at city level to drive development, particularly economic development, which complements the macroeconomic measures and major projects set up by the State.

3.2. The cities struggle to provide basic services

The three cities along with their metropolitan areas share the same difficulties but to varying degrees. In spite of their efforts, they do not manage to fulfill their responsibilities satisfactorily. They are caught between growing challenges (population increase, barely controlled urbanization, population needs) and budgetary austerity, which prevents municipal authorities from maintaining or funding basic services. Saida's "waste mountain" is evidence of this difficulty; in Sfax waste collection is virtually non-existent in many neighborhoods; in Marrakesh it is unusual in neighborhoods far from the centre.

The municipalities do not have adequate administrative or technical capacities. The small proportion of managers in the municipalities (compared with the total number of employees) shows that they are not able to carry out their functions. They are not helped by the type of management and internal organization within departments and between departments, which is often deficient, nor by the behavior of certain elected officials, who have a poor understanding of their role vis-à-vis the municipal administration. Their working conditions (salaries, career prospects, equipment, working environment) are not satisfactory, are inferior to those of State officials and make their employment unattractive. While they are not able to offer better working conditions, the municipalities are not able to retain some of their best managers, who are drawn into the private sector.

3.3. The CDS force the municipalities to look afresh at their situation

The preparation of a CDS and the conditions in which it is to be implemented add to the daily emergencies and other problems, both organizational and operational, that the cities already have to deal with. Can the municipalities bear this new, wide-ranging mission? Can the CDS be implemented by the municipality's structures in their current state? A CDS is revelatory, since the CDS diagnosis obliges elected officials and managers to answer a certain number of questions.

The diagnosis, which relates to the ownership of the project or local governance, may cover several areas:

- The political sphere, which is centered on the role of the elected officials. Do they have the capacity to manage the strategic aspects of the municipality? (define a vision, set a general policy, coordinate among themselves, arbitrate, etc). Do they also have the capacity to manage aspects of governance (do they perform their role as elected officials without interfering in municipal administration, are the able to run public meetings, guard against pressures, etc).
- The organizational field or organization and operation of the municipality. What is the role of the supervisory body with respect to the recruitment, selection and remuneration of managers? What human resources are available? (workforce, managerial staff, age of the managers, allocation of work, wage bill). What is the role of the General Secretary and how is this exercised? What IT equipment does the municipality have and what is it used for? Does the municipality communicate internally/externally?
- The technical field or initiatives led by the municipality in order to exercise its competencies. What are the cross-cutting capacities? Capacities for setting up a local policy? Competencies/skills for human resources management?
• The local sphere or the interactions of the municipality with other actors. How are users received and how does the municipality collaborate with them? How can civil society be mobilized and how can the activities of different local actors be harmonized? How can the municipality be active in dealings with international actors?

The resulting diagnoses show that the cities in question have considerable room for improvement in the four areas cited, to varying degrees. The implementation of the CDS supposes radical improvement in working methods: in terms of management, human resources management, organization, planning, finance, and internal and external communications. All aspects of municipal management are affected.

When a CDS is adopted in a city, the municipal authorities are forced to see their situation in a new light and respond energetically. If there is no such response, the CDS will fail.

3.4. The CDS will function as drivers of change in the municipalities

The implementation of a CDS requires a structure that is capable of working strategically. This means that it must be able to mobilize internal and external actors and partners; ensure consistency and compatibility with other local or national projects; plan and coordinate the work of the various departments within the municipality, State departments and other actors (international cooperation, civil society, consultancies, etc); ensure regular monitoring; take decisions to reframe or update projects that are underway; and provide a monitoring and forward planning function.

All these functions will be performed by the municipality of tomorrow.

In consequence, the structures charged with the implementation of the CDS must be removed from the municipality’s traditional organization and operate directly under the authority of the General Secretary (in Sfax and Marrakesh at least). The final report of this study presents new organization charts. These structures will push the municipalities to work differently: for the cities concerned there will therefore be a pre-CDS and a post-CDS period.

The CDS structures prefigure the new municipalities. They will encourage innovation and continuous improvement. Their role will be to capitalize on the lessons learnt by contributing to the analysis of problems and consultations about internal organization. They will provide the decision-makers (elected officials, General Secretary) with feedback on the results and performances of the operational entities, which will involve discussions about internal organization, job profiles, specific recruitment needs, internal procedures and processes.

The structures will have a multi-purpose function with core members working as a project team, in an open and flexible way. This core should include four to five managers. The head of the structure should be a strategic manager, with experience of strategic planning and a participatory approach, with proven inter-personal skills and acknowledged credibility. This person will work with a planning manager, mediator manager (public relations and marketing in the local area), a financial manager/management controller and a personal assistant. When required, this structure will call upon specialists to deal with particular problems, who will be either managers from operational departments or external experts.

The operation of the CDS structures, which will be fluid and flexible according to needs, will be a model from which the municipalities may draw inspiration in their efforts to modernize all their departments.

The report also includes job descriptions, particularly for the city of Sfax: six for the LDO or for the structure that will implement the GSDS; five to make up a human resources
department; three to better define the decentralized cooperation department; two to better describe municipal communications roles. The Local Governance project in Morocco, which was initiated by the Canadian International Development Agency and the DGCL (Direction Générale des Collectivités Locales), includes close to 200 descriptions of jobs with municipalities, which can be accessed online.

3.5. Appropriate assistance will be required to ensure the success of the CDS and the municipalities’ credibility

The CDS structures will require three kinds of assistance when they are set up and when they become operational: from the municipality itself, from external technical experts and from the national ministry with responsibility for local authorities and decentralization.

The municipality, i.e. the elected officials and, depending on the countries, the General Secretary must commit to initiating their own "cultural revolution". Waiting and not making a decision is counter-productive and impacts negatively the population, increasing the suspicion that people often feel towards the city authority. Courageous decisions, i.e. decisions that are innovative and counter to ingrained habits, must be taken regarding the best structure to adopt to implement the CDS, and to clean up the current situation in the municipalities.

The municipality of Sfax has decided to set up a Local Development Office (LDO), or a CDS structure. The managers in Sfax and Marrakesh have prepared a series of precise action plans, which are both realistic and participatory. They must be implemented without delay, especially as some of them involve little or no financial cost.

The action plans are intended to deal with the main problems and malfunctions that have been identified by the managers themselves.

In Sfax, the action plans cover the following areas:

- Management of human resources (training of municipal officials; motivation; recruitment; allocation and reallocation; better communication).
- Internal organization of municipal departments (setting up of a geographical information system; creation of an electronic helpline for all departments; improvements in work organization in the departments; improvements in internal communications between departments; creation of remote services for citizens; gaining a better understanding of the costs of certain municipal activities).

In Marrakesh, the action plans deal with the following areas:

- Internal communications and access to information
- PCD: structure, cross-cutting and the future
- Creation of a system for the sharing of technical information prior to computerization
- Strategic management of jobs and job descriptions (HRM)

Saida is still preparing its CDS and the actors are now more interested in the construction of a strategic vision for the city and the surrounding areas, which have yet to be defined. It would however be unwise to neglect the issue of the implementing structure. The small number of municipal employees and extremely small number of managers means that an innovative structure must be found, which could be both outside the municipality and under its control, as a kind of municipal consultancy led by representatives of civil society. Possible structures are suggested in the final report, with an explanation of their advantages and disadvantages. There is no doubt that thought must be given to this structure now, in order to avoid a period of inactivity between the delivery of the strategy and the commencement of the work, which could last for several years, as happened in Sfax.
External technical assistance must be envisaged
While the municipalities do not have enough managers, the ones they do have are responsible, competent and devoted to their city. They are ready to begin the change and have been involved in the preparation of the action plans. They need technical assistance. The external experts will enable managers to take their plans further or complete some of them, they will assist with and encourage the implementation of the plans, they will persuade the individuals concerned to commit to the change, they will provide practical training on the ground, help to resolve blockages and find objective solutions in a dispassionate climate. Finally, they will provide advice and expertise in a field which, for some of those on the receiving end, will be new.

Sfax is beginning to receive technical assistance from a national expert, who is financed and supported by the French Caisse des dépôts et consignations. Marrakesh will have to seek assistance from international sponsors. Technical assistance will only be of interest to Saida when it turns its attention to the system it will use to implement its CDS, which will have to be sustainable, objective and under the responsibility of the municipality.

The cities must also be assisted by the State
Up to now, the States, acting through their Interior Ministries which have responsibility for local authorities, have provided little assistance for the cities that have embarked upon a CDS, which is surprising. In Morocco, the obligation to prepare a Plan de Développement Communal is included in the Charte Communale; this gives municipalities a local development function which will contribute to national development. But, at the same time, the orders implementing the Charte with respect to human resources management have still not been issued. These concern, for example, the role to be played by elected officials in the recruitment, allocation and appointment of managers or the allocation of responsibilities between the Leader of the municipal council and the General Secretary. The fact that they have not yet appeared only increases the municipalities' difficulties.

In Tunisia, municipalities are seeking a framework law. A structured national debate could be launched to consider this issue. The ideas generated could be included in the future decentralization policy.

Generally speaking, in all three countries (especially Lebanon and Morocco), the State must improve the status of municipal employees. Why are managers of municipalities paid less than their counterparts in the national civil service? How can this be justified? At the present time, the working conditions (salaries, career prospects) do not attract either the best specialists or the best managers. This trend must be reversed. Otherwise, the municipalities, which are already considered to be minor institutions, will be even less able to fulfill their basic role on behalf of the population and will be incapable of participating in local development. Social peace has a price.

The human resources management function (HRM) in the municipalities must be reviewed, recognized as a profession and established. Why is this function, which is considered to be so important in the private sector, totally neglected in the municipalities, some of which employ several thousand people, and of which greater expertise is demanded? National decision-makers are therefore asked to professionalize and decentralize human resources management in the major municipalities. In Tunisia, the Local Authorities Code (Code des Collectivités) must be revised in order to allow the municipalities to have their own recruitment plan.

Training must be adapted to the municipalities’ real needs, in three areas particularly: human resources management; the systematic practice of management techniques; the new jobs
introduced by the CDS (strategic planning, program management, project management, mediation, marketing in the local area, external communications, organization of committees and working groups, etc). The training centers (CFAD in Tunisia, the center run by the Lebanese Ministry of the Interior and DFCAT, run by the Moroccan Ministry of the Interior) may play a major role.

Finally, if the principles of strategic workforce planning (GPEEC in French) are more widely known, some political and administrative decision-makers should find it easier to resist the pressure of requests for positions in the civil service from some members of the public. Poor recruitment practice has negative repercussions for the municipality which may last up to around 40 years.

3.6. Impacts of the study on the municipalities concerned

The consultants' two assignments, which were carried out successively, have had an initial impact in two of the three municipalities.

The municipalities’ decision-makers have begun to implement the CDS and take action to deal with the administration's inadequacies and malfunctions on many fronts: role of the elected officials; organization chart; human resources; human resources management; capacity to set up a local policy; organization and internal communications; deployment of IT across the board; interactions between the municipality and the external actors and partners, etc. The consultants have produced a complete diagnosis which provides a snapshot of how the municipalities function. In future, the decision-makers will have to use the scorecard every two or three years.

During the second assignment in Sfax (March 2013) and Marrakesh (April 2013), a dynamic process was set in motion.

The creation of a strategic committee with clear responsibilities

In both cities a strategic committee has been set up. The Sfax committee has seven members, who are representatives of the special delegation (including the Leader and Deputy Leader) and senior managers. The Marrakesh committee has four members to drive the process of change. They consist of one elected representative, the General Secretary and two senior managers.

In Sfax, the strategic committee has taken some decisions: it has set up the Local Development Office (LDO), and decided that it should report directly to the General Secretary; it has provided two managers to get the process going, a workspace and equipment, and stipulated the first assignments to be completed. It should be understood that the French Caisse des dépôts et consignations had already prepared the ground and raised the awareness of the decision-makers during previous assignments.

In Marrakesh, the strategic committee has taken on three tasks. The first is to lead a consultation on the outsourcing of municipal services and enhanced project management. In consequence it has chosen the subjects that are studied at the workshops at which the preparatory work is done. The second is to oversee the work that results from the action plans that are produced at the workshops. The third is to identify the most costly operations which require technical assistance or funding from outside the municipality.

It is therefore clear that the mission has enabled the decision-makers of the two municipalities to gauge the breadth of the necessary reforms and, more importantly, to seize the opportunity to launch the work.
The preparation of the action plans

In both Sfax and Marrakesh the action plans were produced by 25 managers who came together at the workshops. The content of these plans, which are reasonable and realistic, are innovative in that they are the first to have been drawn up, thanks to the mission. The workshops generated a great deal of enthusiasm as they relaunched the interest and involvement of the managers in both the implementation of their CDS and in improving the ordinary functioning of the municipal administration.

If the action plans are implemented by the municipalities, the mission will have helped to launch the reform process, with the assistance of the decision-makers. However, technical assistance must also be provided, as the process must not be allowed to flag.

In Saida, the situation is different. Firstly, the municipality has only a skeleton staff and secondly, the consultants were only able to meet a very small number of its representatives (particularly during the second visit in March 2013). Finally, it is the consultants' understanding that the remit of the European Union team is to prepare a CDS and not to anticipate the structures by which it should be implemented. The consultants regret that the possible different structures that are presented in the report were not prepared on a collaborative basis. They only hope that their request to include the implementation of the CDS in the current consultation is heard.
4. The study's final report

4.1. The terms of reference

"The Final Report will provide the final diagnoses and recommendations in terms of human resources requirements, current capacity and competences, constraints, institutional issues, and action plans to bridge gaps. It will identify ‘prerequisite’ actions that are non-controversial or ‘quick wins’, if any."

4.2. A distinct approach for each of the three cities

a. Sfax

The program of meetings was prepared by the municipality of Sfax on the basis of exchanges with the consultants before the mission began.

The following structures were put in place to ensure the success of the second mission:

A strategic committee

Purpose of the committee:
- To comment upon the diagnosis and approve it
- In order to help with the diagnosis, to choose the priorities that will allow the municipality to implement the GSDS successfully
- To facilitate the workshops in the municipality’s offices and to approve the action plans produced by the workshops

With six members, the committee brought together the municipality's main decision-makers: Deputy Leader of the Special Delegation, General Secretary, Director of International Cooperation, Finance Director, Director of Works, Deputy Director of Administrative Affairs and Human Resources. The Leader of the Special Delegation took part in the work of the committee on several occasions. Ms Maryse Gautier of the French Caisse des dépôts et consignations, Urban Program / CMI, also took part in the work.

Three workshops were organized on the following subjects

- Implementing Structure for the GSDS or the Local Development Office(LDO)
- Organization
- Human Resources

The objective of each workshop was to formulate concrete proposals, to be submitted for the approval of the strategic committee. At the Organization and Human Resources workshops the proposals took the form of precise action plans that will have to be developed further by each workshop, after the mission, while the LDO workshop produced proposals and ideas for development.

The workshops were attended by between four and ten managers and were led by consultants. Ms Gautier led the LDO workshop.
b. Saida

Because of the current situation in Saida it was not possible to deploy a methodology that would be suitable for a concerted consultation on the implementation of the city's strategy.

There are many causes: the very small number of municipal managers; the non-availability of elected officials; the perception that the subject is not yet of current interest given that the city strategy is still in its infancy. The municipality therefore allocated the program of the second mission to the project charged with preparing the strategy.

c. Marrakesh

A strategic committee was set up at the start of the mission's second trip. It assumed the following responsibilities:

- Oversee the implementation of the PCD (monitoring-evaluation)
- Overall planning and harmonization of the various projects relating to the city
- Prepare specific institutional and financial arrangements and mobilize the actors and partners
- Provide a monitoring and forward planning function. For the second function its purpose will be to devise municipal structures and identify the human resources required to build the city of future generations, i.e. its role will be to modernize and innovate.

Its four members are: an elected representative who is charged with the Cities for a new generation project; the General Secretary; and two senior managers who were previously responsible for preparing the PCD.

Four workshops were organized on the following subjects:

- Internal communications and access to information.
- PCD: structure, cross-cutting and the future.
- Creation of a system for the sharing of technical information prior to computerization (GIS).
- Strategic management of jobs and job descriptions (HRM).

The objective of each of the workshops was to formulate concrete proposals, to be submitted for the approval of the strategic committee. The proposals took the form of precise action plans that will have to be developed further by each workshop. The workshops were attended by between four and ten managers and were led by consultants.

5. Discussions about the cities of tomorrow and the competencies/skills required to manage a specific area

5.1. The cities of the new generation

What will the cities of Sfax, Saida and Marrakesh be like in 2030?

There is general consensus on this question. The cities will have to meet a formidable development challenge and adapt to an ever more demanding environment with more
people, more needs and more requirements. In addition to the current difficulties, which will only be partially resolved, new problems and new needs are likely to be added to the existing problems: habitats; transportation; the production and distribution of energy; the supply of water, complicated by the impacts of climate change; interconnectivity of IT systems; etc; and, above all, social cohesion in a brutal economic environment.

At the same time, the cities will have to take even more account of what the World Bank calls the Brown Agenda. This is concerned with water pollution due to untreated municipal and industrial waste water; the lack of sanitation; the absence of adequate resources to collect solid waste; the pollution of interior and exterior air; and the contamination of groundwater due to the inadequate treatment of dangerous, solid waste. The concept of "sustainable and green", which is in vogue among designers and architects, often seems very fragile when the reality is chaotic and polluted.

What will the municipal services of Sfax, Saida and Marrakesh be like in 2030?

The question is not easily answered. It is troubling and perplexing. How can this question be answered when the municipalities barely manage to collect household waste within an area of a few square kilometers. At the moment, these cities are places where things happen, not where things are planned. The municipalities barely manage to deal with day-to-day emergencies.

However the presence of the city strategies is beginning to change the game.

Thanks to the exercises and consultations with the various actors involved we can now begin to construct a vision based on present and future needs. The elected officials and municipal managers, as a whole, are moving from an operational concept of the management of the municipality to a strategic concept (i.e. they are now preparing for the future).

In 2030, there is a good chance that these cities will be staffed by highly qualified managers, specialists, strategists and managers. New jobs will appear. The job profiles must be defined now, so the right people can be recruited. Human resources management becomes key.

This does not exist at the present time. Although the cities' depend on the skills of their managers, nobody now knows how many managers they will need, nor what skills the managers will need to have. It is a shame to note that, despite the current difficult job market, some municipalities continue to hire people whose profiles do not meet the needs of 2030, even though they will be in their positions for around 40 years.

5.2. Management, the basis of any organization

Before any consultation on the new municipal jobs can be conducted, modern management practices must be in place.

Generally speaking, the management of many municipalities is archaic and the most elementary management techniques are either ignored or not applied: there is a lack of direction and no means of imposing discipline; no planning; retention of information; no or restricted communications; work not supervised or assessed; no recognition; lack of fairness; etc. The consequences are considerable for the importance that people attach to their work and productivity is very low.

All organizations are based on management. The best, most competent human resources will be impaired if such a climate persists in a municipality. As the status of municipal officials
is often low, there is no point in discouraging managers even more by employing working methods that motivate them even less.

Therefore working conditions must be improved urgently, by introducing management techniques across the board. The following chart shows what municipal managers must do.
5.3. **What do municipal managers do?**

**Manage human resources**
Contribute to the recruitment and selection process. Encourage team working. Provide appropriate information and consultations. Take part in decision-making. Ensure the organization has the necessary competencies/skills and knowledge. Train and supervise. Monitor performance. Recognize and congratulate. Provide personal support.

**Manage information and communications**
Assess ideas and information received from both inside and outside the municipality. Forward information. Communicate adequately. Store information and make it accessible to all.
Manage external relations
Maintain links with other teams and organizations. Ensure links with sources of finance. Represent the team. Promote the municipality. Manage public relations.

Manage finances
Plan budgets. Monitor finances. Carry out an initial audit. Manage financing and budgets. Manage the search funding sources.

Manage material resources
Manage the premises. Manage the equipment/supplies. Manage the plant. Manage the stocks.

Manage work
Set clear and realistic targets. Ensure appropriate resources. Plan. Set up quality systems and procedures. Manage time. Suggest improvements and changes.

Malfunctions in a municipal administration are most often caused by:

- Unsuitable authority or lack of authority and direction or failure to set direction
- Lack of clarity when setting objectives
- No team planning
- Team not involved in resolving difficulties
- Unsuitable communication competencies/skills
- Unsuitable technical competencies/skills
- Unsuitable administrative competencies/skills
- Schedule of activities unrealistic

5.4. Territorial engineering

Territorial engineering\(^2\) refers to all of the concepts, methods, tools and systems provided for local authorities to assist with the design, execution and assessment of local projects, particularly city development strategies.

It therefore concerns all the actors who deal with the challenges of local development, such as the technical departments of local authorities, State technical departments, research bodies and consultancies.

The emergence of territorial engineering is linked to the changing nature of the jobs of those involved in local planning and development.

Competencies/skills

Some competencies are generic and apply in many fields (such as setting up, managing and evaluating projects or networking), while skills involve subject knowledge or technical know-how.

Territorial engineering encompasses many different issues: water; services; employment; economic development and change; tourism; climate change; risks; etc.

In practice, the actors combine both competencies and skills, which are equally important.

If the analysis is taken further, the main components of competence are as follows:

\(^2\) According to the work of the Projet IngéTerr Auvergne, in the Les Focus series PSDR3 (2011)
• Theoretical knowledge: which enables individuals to understand and interpret.
• Procedural knowledge: i.e. “how to” particularly the design of a procedure or step.
• Procedural know-how: knowing how to deploy a procedure or take a step.
• Experience based know-how: knowing how to do something, which comes from experience, knowing how to behave.
• Social know-how: knowing how to behave appropriately in the circumstances.
• Cognitive know-how: knowing how to process information, to reason and add value through thinking.

Know-how can be learnt and tried out in the course of training, whether in the office on the ground, or through experience.

These types of know-how vary according to the individual concerned and the person's professional career and training. The richness of the profiles of the actors involved in territorial engineering derives from this variety.

**Competencies required in territorial engineering**

The usefulness of a reference framework in territorial engineering

Once the competencies required in territorial engineering have been determined, a reference framework can be prepared. It may then be used as a methodological tool with a view to:

• Checking and determining whether these competencies already exist within an existing team (or structure expected to implement a city strategy).
• Identifying any missing competencies or that need to be enhanced within the team, by recruiting new managers, who will be selected on the basis of the competencies required, or by enhancing capacities (in-service training, training on the ground, etc.).

• Devising links between the implementing structure and other entities (within the municipality or external actors) where such competencies might exist.

Reference framework for territorial engineering

The reference framework comprises firstly a set of basic competencies and, secondly, the basic knowledge required of all those working in territorial engineering.

Basic competencies

These include various personal attributes and inter-personal skills that the manager must have, such as, the capacity to connect with people, the ability to listen, adaptability, etc. Working with elected officials, for example, is a specific kind of work in this field.

Basic competencies also include certain areas of knowledge. People working in this field should have a knowledge of several disciplines such as geography, political science, sociology, economics and management science. They should also be familiar with spatialization, game theory, the major positions of political philosophy, the principles of economic development or customer orientation.

Finally this body of knowledge relates to the manager's capacity [for self-improvement], not only in terms of lifetime learning and adaptability, but more widely in terms of reflexivity, or the capacity to analyze one's own professional practice.

Managers must not perform their new tasks in "the same old way". They must become aware of their role and place in the organization and its systems, and of the organizational and wider environmental changes. This will give them a new perspective on the organization and help them to work in new ways.

Four macro-competencies

For job profile purposes, four macro-competencies can be identified: project management, mediation, the production and control of knowledge and, finally, management.

Project management involves all the competencies and covers the whole life of a project from set-up, through implementation and assistance, to evaluation, as a project is a plan of action with a limited life span.

The purpose of mediation is to build and maintain connections, and coordinate with various actors in civil society and current, projected and potential projects, and to ensure that all the actors take account of changes in the environment. Mediation is at the heart of a project and the oil that keeps it running smoothly. While Leadership is one of the key components of this role, another of the main functions of a mediator is to enable diverse groups to understand each other, acting as a cultural go-between: between public and private sectors; different areas and different municipalities; elected officials, technicians and the population; and between national and international entities.
The **production and control of information** relates to knowledge of the area, which can be seen as the area's cognitive capacity. This involves monitoring, drafting summaries, putting together and distributing information and media communications in the local area, for the local area and its partners, including the beneficiaries of local services. It also involves setting up and leading a network of economic, social and environmental intelligence, and benchmarking. Its aim is to assist the elected officials in the decision-making process, to enable them to make the most appropriate choices.

Finally **management** involves turning policy directives into reality, by preparing action plans, including projects, and coordinating material, financial and human resources. The aim is to implement the directives effectively, efficiently and consistently in the areas concerned.
## Table of competencies deployed in territorial engineering

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sets of competencies</th>
<th>Main competencies</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Project implementation** | • Setting up, assisting and implementing projects and designing or conducting the evaluation  
• Steering  
• Building partnerships  
• Lobbying  
• Project promotion (marketing) |
| **Mediation** | • Creating a group dynamic  
• Developing mobilization mechanisms  
• Getting the actors to take part  
• Managing conflicts  
• Using different forms of governance  
• Mobilizing the area's resources  
• Acting as a go-between between different groups and cultures, mediating, setting up dialogues  
• Mobilizing the network's culture  
• Encouraging dialogue  
• Communicating  
• Conciliating  
• Guiding |
| **Production and control of information** | • Organizing the collection of information  
• Carrying out studies  
• Organizing monitoring schemes  
• Monitoring  
• Forward planning  
• Combining areas of expertise  
• Developing new areas of expertise  
• Experimenting  
• Mobilizing and adapting one's own expertise  
• Demonstrating teaching skills  
• Understanding decision-making processes  
• Adopting supportive and advisory positions  
• Encouraging conversations about ethics  
• Remaining at a distance from the elected officials  
• Acting as an interface, setting up dialogues between the public and private sectors  
• Subject expertise: water management; tourism; town-planning; law; etc. |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Management</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Turning intentions and policy directives into strategic plans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Devising, running and connecting plans including projects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Human resources management at the level of the organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Taking part in the inter-organizational management of the human resources deployed in territorial engineering at local level</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Ensuring consistency between plans and actions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Creating, running and linking up planning chains</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Setting up development strategies</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Basic skills</th>
<th>Fundamental competencies and knowledge</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Personal aptitude and interpersonal relations</td>
<td>• Adaptability, versatility, rigor, creativity, sense of organization, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Ability to work with others</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Good interpersonal skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Diplomacy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Negotiation skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Ability to listen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reflexivity</td>
<td>• Learns continuously</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Is aware of their own practices, their role and place in an organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Notices changes in the organization and its environment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Adapts their practices in response to the changes, so they are appropriate for the tasks to be performed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Acknowledges and analyses needs / changes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic knowledge</td>
<td>• Geography, political science, sociology, economics, management, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Spatialization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Game theory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Customer orientation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Political philosophy and principles of political economy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Principles of economic development</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Marrakesh

A  Decisions taken by the municipality

B  Challenges facing the city of Marrakesh and its strategy for the new generation

C  Work required to improve the municipality’s structures

D  Recommendations at national level

E  Conclusion

Appendices
A. Decisions taken by the municipality of Marrakesh

1. Validation of the diagnosis

   a. The diagnosis was sent to Marrakesh on March 5, 2013

   The World Bank gave its agreement on March 5, 2013 for the intermediary report to be sent to the three cities and the section about Marrakesh was emailed the same day to Deya Benjelloune, head of the international relations department and of decentralized cooperation.

   b. The diagnosis received a very limited distribution among the municipality's elected officials and managers

   Deya Benjelloune forwarded the diagnosis to the “PCD unit”, namely Abelkrim Khatib, head of the economic and service quality department (and PCD preparation coordinator), and Samir Laâribya, head of the operational department (charged with implementing the PCD).

   Unfortunately distribution was very limited as it seems to have excluded Mohamed Benchakroun, the elected official with responsibility for the Cities for a New Generation project, the municipality's General Secretary, and the managers charged with human resources management.

   Samir Laâribya distributed the document to his colleagues.

   c. Comments by the municipality’s representatives and validation of the diagnosis

   The consultants presented the diagnosis to Mohamed Benchakroun, the elected official with responsibility for the Cities for a New Generation project, Achlaf Abdellatif, the General Secretary of the municipality of Marrakesh, Abelkrim Khatib and Samir Laâribya,

   The diagnosis gave rise to few comments. Those that were made related to precise points, about which there was consensus, such as the fragility of the current structure for the implementation of the PCD, difficulties in the communication, dissemination and transfer of information among administrative departments, and the difficulty of obtaining regular and updated technical information from the sectors concerned by the GIS. These difficulties made project coordination slower and more difficult and may have a negative impact on the decision-making process for the technical managers and elected officials.

   The diagnosis is an accurate reflection of the daily reality on the ground as experienced by the managers. It was widely accepted and well received by the people who attended the meeting who met in their capacity as members of the strategic committee.

   The committee members acknowledged that the PCD structure, which is intended to have a planning function involving a number of different departments, was finding it difficult to operate in this way. The recognition of these difficulties is salutary as it means that if the PCD is to succeed, the PCD structure must shift its focus from day-to-day management to coordinating and planning the work of the various departments.

   The municipality’s operating methods must therefore change. At the moment its functions, which it performs “mechanistically and repetitively”, are stable and repetitive. It must become
forward-looking and constantly update itself ("organically like a living being"), so that constant change becomes the norm. This capacity for change and forward planning must incorporate the new technologies. However, the competencies are not the same for the two types of organizational structure.

The diagnosis has given rise to expectations among the members of the strategic committee that the functioning of the municipal administration will improve. The municipality has a pool of human resources that are currently under-used. If they are better equipped and better managed the municipality's capacities may be considerably improved. The resulting improvement must be enhanced by the addition of an overarching information system.

d. The comments made by the consultants at the meeting

The success of the PCD project depends upon all the municipality’s departments functioning well. The diagnosis provides a snapshot of the municipality's operations; it shows that many functions must be improved if the city is to make a success of the PCD.

The scorecard included in the diagnosis is a means of self-diagnosis to be used as an aid to decision-making. It is one of a number of indicators available to the municipality. It must be used by the elected officials and managers as a permanent tool, and should be completed every year.

The diagnosis should be distributed to all the municipality’s departments.

2. The decisions confirmed by the municipality related to the implementation of the PCD

2.1. The creation of a strategic committee to guide the PCD

The committee began to be set up during the consultants’ second trip to Marrakesh. It has four members so far:

- Mohamed Benchakroun, elected official with responsibility for the Cities for a New Generation project
- Achlaf Abdellatif, General Secretary of the municipality of Marrakesh
- Abelkrim Khatib, head of the economic and service quality department
- Samir Laâribya, head of the operational department, charged with implementing the PCD

The composition of the group satisfies the objective, which is to optimize the implementation of the PCD. It has one member representing the governing body, two members who are the technical managers of the PCD and finally, the General Secretary, who has authority over all the municipality’s departments.

However, the consultants consider that a representative from the department charged with upgrading the municipality’s administration, with responsibility for IT equipment and the strategic management of human resources, among other things, would be of benefit to the strategic committee, as the mission is focused mainly on human resources management.

Most of the difficulties and malfunctions noted in the diagnosis are the result of several decades of weak human resources management, which are reflected in: inappropriate appointments; failure to match the workforce to the amount of work; no clear vision regarding
the responsibilities of each individual; no awareness of the role of each person due to posts not being defined and no sense of the purpose of each individual's tasks; demotivation; absenteeism; difficulty of making a career with the municipality; the low impact, sometimes even a negative impact, of the municipality's investment in training. It was in response to this situation that it was decided, on the initiative of the Leader of the Municipal Council, to create a department to be charged with modernizing the municipality's administration. The aim was to improve the performance of its various departments.

2.2. Role of the strategic committee

a. Consultation and the search for relevance to be a driving force

The committee has decided to lead a consultation on how to enhance project ownership and the professional level of the municipality's workforce. Various concerns have been identified:

- Delegated management (how to prepare a CPS, monitor and evaluate the work of the contractor)
- How to set up local development companies
- The modernization of management using IT systems that coordinate internal and external actors; the introduction of IT tools along with monitoring and data collection procedures
- Introduction of a monitoring and evaluation system using a scorecard
- Increase in local revenue through better recovery

To facilitate the rollout of the PCD, the strategic committee has decided to organize workshops on four different themes, to be led by the consultants:

- Theme 1: Internal communications and access to information
- Theme 2: PCD: structure, cross-cutting and future
- Theme 3: Introduction of a shared IT system, as a preparation for computerization
- Theme 4: Strategic management of positions and profiles (HRM)

The aim of these four thematic workshops is to produce realistic, ambitious action plans that will be fleshed out and implemented internally, within the municipality's own departments. This work is compatible with the new Charte communale which gives municipalities a large measure of autonomy with regard to their internal organization, in order to improve efficiency.

b. Monitoring and evaluation of the work undertaken inside the municipality

The strategic committee will monitor the rollout of the action plans. This will involve evaluating the actions undertaken, redirecting them, resolving any problems, negotiating with the actors, mobilizing them and creating an obligation to achieve a specific result.

c. Identifying more complex/wider-ranging operations that require technical assistance or funding from outside the municipality

The strategic committee will have to identify operations which, due to their complexity or scope, exceed the municipality's human resources or finances. It will be charged with overseeing applications for technical assistance (from national and international partners) and for funding from national and international sponsors. Finally, it will be involved in the search for external funding, negotiating and ensuring that applications are successful.
3. The strategic committee's decision is well-timed as it satisfies two requirements

The decision to launch these initiatives immediately is well-timed, as it provides a response to two requirements:

- Firstly, certain elected officials have recently questioned the municipality's managers about the implementation of the PCD projects.
- Secondly, as the PCD is now in the third year of its six year term, an intermediate evaluation must be organized. While some projects, funded out of the municipal budget, have been completed, others, which are more comprehensive, have not been implemented as they do not satisfy all the conditions.

The action plans are therefore the municipality's response to the elected officials and will be incorporated in the intermediate evaluation of the PCD.
B. Challenges facing the city of Marrakesh and its strategy for the new generation

1. A vision of the city of Marrakesh in 2030

While the PCD offers a shared vision of the city and its development challenges, it also shows the extent of the changes that must be made within the municipality.

It reveals the gap between the city’s development ambitions and the reality of its human resources, which are inadequate. The municipality’s operating methods do not allow for the PCD to be implemented effectively or in full. Nor does it prepare a response to the needs of the new generation.

The PCD is a trigger that is forcing all the municipality's actors to take stock of the challenges faced.

Several points have arisen from the strategic committee's analysis of the situation:

- The state of the municipality, in terms of its organization and human resources, is concerning but not beyond repair.
- It is still possible to react to the situation as the existing managers have some competencies.
- The PCD cannot be implemented without radical reform of the city's operating methods.
- The implementation of the PCD provides an opportunity to rethink structures and jobs. There will therefore be pre-PCD and post-PCD periods.

Therefore the overall aim is to prepare the city's structures for 2030, starting as soon as possible.

2. The city must begin to prepare for the future now

The city must begin to prepare for the future now. A strategy on how to do this was sketched out on the basis of discussions with the strategic committee. Its main features are as follows:

- Remain within the legal framework, but without being trapped by psychological barriers. Some individuals may think that the local authority’s existing statutes or the failure to pass provisions implementing the Charte communale hinder change, and may see this as an excuse to do nothing.

- Understand the challenges. Some elected officials find it difficult to see beyond their own term of office and see only the present, without understanding that they are also responsible, as of now, for the city of tomorrow. They must therefore be informed and made aware of what is required.

- Be courageous and take decisions, even if they are not necessarily comprehensible to the voters. The actors must know how to explain the reasons for the change. The municipalities must change like other Moroccan institutions, such as the customs
service, which have been able to change in order to satisfy users’ expectations and seize opportunities.

- Be aware that it is better to prepare for the future calmly and carefully than under pressure with a sense of urgency. If preparations are not made now, or if decisions are put off, serious problems may ensue, and it may be necessary to take serious risks and load the next generation with debt.

- Find a person who can "own" the change, i.e. lead and be identified with it: this may be an elected official or a representative of the Municipal Council and the Council office. They may work in tandem with one of the municipality's senior managers. The intermediate evaluation of the PCD provides a suitable opportunity to set out future problems. Seminars with the elected officials, civil society and the State's own external services will enrich the consultation.

- Make Marrakesh a pilot municipality, or laboratory, in which to initiate a change process. Naturally, this requires the agreement of the DGCL. This process of change and modernization must have the support of the Municipal Council, which must show strong willingness and prepare the decision.

- Set up a partnership with the DGCL to upgrade the city's services through better human resources management.
C. Work required to improve the municipality's structures

The strategic committee identified four themes or areas in which immediate change is possible. Realistic and feasible action plans have been produced in workshops organized around these themes and they must now be fleshed out. The department charged with modernizing the municipality must play a major role in the implementation of the plans.

1. Many improvements may be made rapidly

1.1 Workshop 1: Internal communication and access to information

a. Participants

This workshop was attended by five participants out of the 12 expected. A list of attendees is included in the appendix.

The consultants regret the fact that no HRM manager was able to attend.

b. Challenges

The aim of this workshop was to identify actions to facilitate the implementation of the PCD. One of the major difficulties for the PCD structure is the lack of communication between the municipality's departments, along with the difficulties of accessing information. This problem, which applies to the whole of the municipality, is a considerable hindrance to the operation of the various structures. A PCD can only be rolled out effectively if the municipality operates effectively.

c. Action plan

The participants prepared a joint action plan which is included in the appendix. It must be fleshed out jointly with other actors before it can be rolled out.

The main actions to be taken were identified as follows:

- Clarify the respective roles of the political and administrative actors
- Strengthen motivation and staff commitment through modern HRM (giving the staff a sense of the importance of their work)
- Upgrade the IT equipment
- Inform all the internal actors about the role of the PCD
- Revise posts and the workforce (this theme was covered in the human resources workshop)

d. Structure with responsibility for the action plan

The action plan falls mainly within the remit of the human resources and modernization department (who were not able to attend the workshop).

e. Workshop conclusions
Communications and access to information have both HRM and technological dimensions.

- Human resources
  The deficit in communications is not merely a problem of technical resources and procedures. The human element is key. Each individual, regardless of their place in the hierarchy, needs to understand their work and what is expected, and to understand the purpose of their activities, in order to have a sense of the importance of their work. They also need to be recognized and may have to be transferred to other duties if necessary.

- Management
  Management is the means to improve the exploitation of an organization's human, organizational, IT and material resources. It involves exercising authority and setting directions.
  
  Management also involves using tools with which to plan, organize, lead and control. These functions must be fully exercised at every level in the hierarchy. The municipality's managerial capacities must be strengthened.

- IT equipment
  In spite of the efforts made in terms of providing equipment and assistance for users, needs are very far from being satisfied, even for minimal use.

  The municipality's operations must be fully computerized and archaic practices jettisoned, so the city can enter the 21st century.

  f. Warnings

First warning

Efforts must be made to improve the organization, tools, coordination mechanisms, procedures and IT equipment. However, such efforts will only be effective if there is a willingness on the part of management to share information and if the staff agree to the changes. Communications and access to information are built on human resources management.

Second warning

This second warning relates to the strategic impacts of human resources management.

An unsuitable appointment today can burden the municipality for 30 or 40 years. In economic terms, the employee concerned increases the wage bill and prevents the municipality from appointing a more suitable person who could fulfill current or future needs. In terms of organizational culture, the inappropriate appointment may disturb the organization and lead to demoralization and demotivation.

The recruitment process is important, with repercussions on the future of the municipality. This process must be made professional, fully transparent and subject to control mechanisms.

1.2. Workshop 2: PCD: structure, cross-cutting operation and future
a. Participants

The workshop was attended by nine people, including the coordinator and other key members of the unit charged with preparing the PCD, and other colleagues from three urban districts. A list of the participants is included in the appendix. All the participants were directly involved in the preparation of the PCD and are keen to see it succeed.

b. Challenges

Once the PCD had been prepared, the members of the initial unit, which had been charged with the preparation, had to return to the day-to-day management of the municipality, in a variety of locations.

The projects included in the PCD were effectively carried out, but only those that could be financed out of the municipality's own budget. They were supervised by a group of managers from the municipality's own departments. The projects requiring funding to be sourced and set up or requiring a combination of several actors, are currently pending.

This is partly due to the fact that no one unit is dedicated to driving the PCD. Implementation requires a structure that is capable of working strategically: mobilizing internal and external actors; checking consistency and compatibility with other projects; planning and coordinating the different departments concerned; ensuring regular monitoring; changing focus in midstream; etc.

The PCD was set up by a group of people who were officially appointed by order of the Leader of the Municipal Council. The order is still valid, but circumstances have changed and the initial group, or unit, is no longer in operation.

It must therefore be re-activated and adapted to the municipality's new present and future needs. It must be sustainable and able to operate in the long term. The PCD has forced the municipality to change its focus: in the past it merely managed day-to-day operations; now it is committed to forward planning and strategic thinking.

However, the municipality does not have a real strategic unit able to identify current challenges and prepare for the future.

c. The functions of the PCD implementing structure or "PCD unit"

The aim of the PCD unit is to ensure that the city operates strategically. The workshop participants identified four main functions:

1. Supervision and evaluation of the PCD

   The unit will not carry out the projects included in the PCD. Its function is to monitor the PCD and keep track of progress. This function involves the preparation of tools, procedures and mechanisms with numerous internal and external actors. The unit will operate with the information systems that feed the scorecards (GIS). These will allow the unit to monitor implementation, identify hold-ups and various constraints, help in the search for solutions, inform decision-makers of the progress made, warn them when necessary, assist in the decision-making process, and generally provide information.
The unit will operate with all the municipality's departments and districts, as a cross-cutting entity. It will also work with external partners.

2. Overall planning and harmonizing the different projects

Depending upon the directions laid down by the decision-makers and any possible constraints (often linked to realities on the ground), the unit will be responsible for updating the plan.

It will also be responsible for harmonizing the various projects and major activities involving other actors. This will involve assembling diverse elements in order to give meaning, avoid gaps and overlaps, etc.

3. Setting up specific arrangements and bringing in actors and partners

The unit will help to bring in local, national and international actors. It will suggest complex strategies involving several actors on the same project, and will finalize agreements and complex legal arrangements.

It will be capable of assisting with the drafting of technical specifications and supervising the preparation of funding applications.

It will have to prepare and initiate local marketing campaigns, draft arguments, persuade and attract support. This will involve using information materials and municipal and local marketing plans (multimedia, websites, etc).

4. Monitoring and forward planning

The PCD unit will make proposals based on information gathered, the evaluation of the city's problems and citizens' expectations. It will trigger change and help to reinvent the city.

The current plans may be reformulated depending on changes in the environment and circumstances. The unit will give warning of the variables of the changes and of opportunities or external expectations. It will not be forced to stick to a rigid plan.

The unit will enable the municipality to show that it is responsive, flexible and adaptable.

It will be in contact with other similar units working in other municipalities. Through benchmarking, it will keep decision-makers informed of best practice.

The unit will encourage innovation in the municipality's departments and strive to ensure constant improvement. It will monitor and evaluate the municipality's work on a regular basis, and make proposals for improvements based on its findings. It will make further use of the information gathered by contributing to analyses of problems and discussions about internal organization. The unit will therefore provide feedback on the results/performances of the municipality's operational entities, particularly: internal organization, training, job descriptions, new procedures, improvements in internal processes, etc. In liaison with the modernization department, it will propose areas to explore for future PCDs.
d. Entity's position in the municipality's overall structure

Under the Charte communale it is possible set up a committee with members appointed by the Leader of the Municipal Council, and chaired by the General Secretary. The unit that set up the PCD was created by this means. It may therefore continue to operate during implementation, within the same framework.

Having no operational functions, the unit must operate outside the departments included in the organization chart in order to perform a cross-cutting function. It should report to the General Secretary who will ensure that its role is sustainable in the long term. It will be neither superior nor subordinate to the other departments, but will have functional links with them.

A diagram of the unit is included in the Appendix.

e. Human resources

The unit will be multi-functional. Its core members will operate as a project team with a high degree of flexibility. They will devote all their time to the unit and have no operational responsibilities in the municipality's other departments.

The composition of the unit will not be fixed. It will bring in specialists to work on specific problems for limited periods, as needs arise; they may be managers from other departments, consultants or outside experts. The unit will be a living organism whose composition will change in line with needs.

The core of the unit should be recruited internally. The core team should consist of:

- A unit leader, who should be a strategic senior manager with experience of strategic planning and a participatory approach, who is open to the external environment (external actors, civil society, State's external departments), with strong interpersonal skills and recognized credibility.
- A project planner, who will be recognized by the various departments charged with operations.
- A mediator, specializing in public relations at national and international level, who will develop local marketing strategies.
- A finance manager/ management controller.
- A PA who will assist the unit leader.

The team may be joined by managers from the municipality's operational departments for the period of a specific "mission". They may, for example, coordinate the setting up of a "ready to go", fundable project.

The structure of the unit will serve as an example of a type of modern structure that may inspire the municipality as they move to modernize all their departments.

f. Financial and material resources

These new positions should come with attractive working conditions; the level of compensation particularly should reflect the responsibilities involved.

The unit must also be provided with modern, efficient equipment and material.
The unit should operate like a research department, in an open-plan office, in a single location. The members of the unit will work together using IT equipment with Internet access.

**g. The functional links with the municipality’s departments**

Each department/section within the municipality will appoint a person to act as a **focal point**. The focal points will be linked to the PCD’s action plan. Operating from within their own department, they will be the interface between the PCD unit and the departments involved in the implementation of the PCD. The focal points will form an extension to the PCD unit. They will pass on information, supervise projects and prepare decisions. They will be responsible for the performance of actions subcontracted by the unit to the technical departments.

For practical and administrative cultural reasons, it is recommended that the focal points should initially be the heads of the various departments.

**h. Action plan**

The action plan, which is included in the appendix, relates to the processes that must be implemented for the setting up and recognition of the unit.

**i. Workshop’s conclusions**

The workshop generated a great deal of enthusiasm, reawakening the interest and commitment of the managers involved in the rollout of the PCD. Coming in the run up to the next intermediary evaluation, it was particularly well-timed.

**1.3. Workshop 3: Setting up a system for the sharing of technical information, preparatory to computerization**

**a. Participants**

The workshop was attended solely by operators from the GIS and their manager, the head of project planning. They gather technical information, feed it into the GIS, process the data and help with the work and monitoring of the PCD.

Unfortunately, despite having been invited by the General Secretary, neither the representatives of the departments that supply the information for the GIS, nor the person with responsibility for upgrading the IT systems were able to attend the workshop.

**b. Challenges**

The composition of the group and the representativeness of its members is symbolic and illustrates the difficulties involved in sharing information. The only people present were the receivers of information, the producers were absent. This problem is central in the setting up of the information system. The composition of the workshop epitomizes the difficulties encountered in managing cross-cutting processes, in disseminating information, in bringing managers together to look at common problems and in getting departments to cooperate. It means that if inter-departmental interactions can be improved, if employees can be brought together within projects, and teamwork developed, the municipality may discover that its employees have **immense performance potential**, creativity and the ability to go beyond constraints.
The problem is not technical but human, managerial and organizational. The best information technology is useless without a human contribution. The real struggle lies in getting all the municipality's elected officials and public servants to understand the utility of information systems, the value of sharing information and transparency.

The GIS is one of the tools used for the PCD. It is managed centrally by a team of four. The strong points of the team are: 1) the fact that it operates in a single location; 2) the team work with their own personal computers and are very motivated and cohesive; 3) they are very keen to overcome difficulties with very few resources: they are self-trained, they organized a voluntary visit to the GIS in Casablanca, and they use their own, personal equipment; 4) human contact points have been appointed in the municipality's departments; contact points have already been appointed in each of the five districts.

The GIS team have experienced three major difficulties in operating the PCD implementation and monitoring system:
- Lack of support from some elected officials who do not understand its utility
- The feeding-in of data from other departments and departments outside the municipality
- Mediocre performance of the IT equipment

The GIS should also be linked up with the Intranet (whose budget was recently set by the Municipal Council). Collaboration between the modernization department, which has responsibility for IT, and the GIS unit is essential.

1.4. Workshop 4: Strategic management of jobs and staff profiles / HRM

a. Participants

Seven people took part in the workshop including four representatives from the personnel administration department, a municipal architect from one of the districts and the coordinator of the (INDH) (a social program).

The fact that there were no representatives from the modernization department, which is responsible for HRM, is regrettable.
b. Challenges

If the PCD unit is to survive in the long term the problem of the lack of suitable staff in the operational departments must be resolved. At the moment they lack both senior and middle managers, particularly the latter: either they simply do not exist or they have been wrongly assigned.

The municipality has two challenges: firstly, it must deal with present needs as soon as possible, and secondly it must prepare for the future.

- In the short term, suitable personnel must be found to implement the PCD.
- In the medium term, the loss of staff through retirement, which will occur over the next few years, will only aggravate the situation if plans are not made now. By way of example, the consultants were told that the city of Marrakesh will soon have only two architects.
- In the long term, the municipality must totally rethink its human resources needs. First and foremost it will need high level managers, highly specialized in urban problems (transport, management of social infrastructures, environmental management, urban energy management, etc.), and administrators.

The participants imagine that in the future the municipality will delegate operational tasks and no longer concentrate upon design, planning, management and control, within the framework of a strategic vision for the city. This city vision could go well beyond the municipality and be included in the regional development strategy, as part of the national policy of advanced regionalization.

At the present time, the municipality is not making sufficient preparations for the change, according to the participants. There is a real risk that the situation will deteriorate and that there will be an imbalance between the needs of the population and the municipality's capacities.

Energetic action must be taken in the short term and the municipality must adopt a comprehensive adaptation strategy, supported by a strong political will.

c. Action plan

The action plan, which is still general, offers a certain number of objectives which must be broken down into activities.

**Short term action plan for the PCD unit**

**Objective 1:** Provide the PCD unit with human resources without taking too many staff from the operational structures.

A list of the human resources required for the PCD is included above. Job descriptions need to be drafted then applications invited from internal candidates.

For the operational departments whose managers have been moved to the PCD unit, draft job descriptions then invite applications from internal candidates. Accelerate transfers and redeployments for managers in the districts whose positions are no longer justified or who may be surplus to requirements.

**Objective 2:** Strengthen the capacities of the PCD unit and the operational departments
The mission was informed of the existence of a training plan, prepared by the modernization department, but was not able to consult it.

In view of its mission, the following training courses should be organized for the members of the PCD unit:

- Balanced scorecard techniques for municipal management
- Project management using the logical framework approach
- Project management software, such as MS Project
- Management techniques (all heads of department and some elected officials should also receive this training)
- Results-based management
- Presenting arguments, mediation, communication techniques
- Local marketing
- Quality control
- Delegated management of a local development company

**Objective 3**: To see the organization and functioning of the PCD unit like a pilot entity, setting an example by disseminating information, operating transparently, spatial organization and [shaping] the image of the municipality of tomorrow.

**Action plan specific to HRM**

**Objective 1**: To train the managers of the HRM department in human resources management: self-training, training course at the DGCL (structure responsible for HRM) and training course in decentralized cooperation.

**Objective 2**: Identify key vacant positions or positions that soon will become vacant due to retirement: set up a forward management system for managerial staff (positions/competencies).

**Objective 3**: Write job descriptions; identify internal candidates who are available or who could be moved.

**Objective 4**: In the event of any recruitment, whether internal or external, formalize the recruitment process, call upon internal candidates, make the procedure transparent; prepare the switch: period of dual command/training by the departing member of staff; training periods in other municipalities, etc.

**Objective 5**: Create an HRM structure within the municipality to work alongside the personnel administration function. This decision must be negotiated with the DGCL within a partnership that could make Marrakesh a pilot municipality, particularly for HRM. As this field is still subject to oversight, an experience of decentralized human resources management may be launched.

Within the framework of decentralized human resources management, Marrakesh, which is a large Moroccan municipality, should anticipate its own human resources needs and assume responsibility for managing them. It could be involved in drafting the terms and conditions of employment and assume responsibility for implementation. It will therefore be responsible for
selecting and recruiting managers, giving them permanent positions and developing competencies. It will satisfy the need to allocate or redistribute resources fairly, through staff transfers and redeployment. It will take every effort to maintain harmonious relations between management and labor.

In 2009, a consultation on this subject between the DGCL and the Canadian International Development Agency was initiated by the *Gouvernance Locale au Maroc* Project. An excerpt from this consultation is included in the appendix.

2. HRM tools and training

1.1. Many HRM tools, adapted for Morocco, can be accessed on the Internet

All the HRM techniques can be found on the website of the *Gouvernance Locale au Maroc* project, which was set up by the DGCL and the Canadian International Development Agency. [www.glmaroc.org](http://www.glmaroc.org)

The website includes a compendium of positions and competencies, with 201 job descriptions, at [www.glmaroc.org/pages/grh_rec.html](http://www.glmaroc.org/pages/grh_rec.html). Each job description includes a list of competencies specific to the position and the qualifications required in terms of basic training and professional experience.

The section entitled “Pilotage, planification et contrôle interne” (Steering, planning and internal control) includes 20 job descriptions. The site’s homepage is cited in the appendix.

Numerous tools are available at [www.glmaroc.org/pages/documentation.html](http://www.glmaroc.org/pages/documentation.html), such as:

- Guides to strategic communication (training for PCD communication, communication policy guide, guide to communications plans, etc.),
- Guides relating to local authority cooperation and partnerships: good practice, training in project delegation and working with local development companies and many more.

1.2. Training and assistance with change

a. Self-training

The *Gouvernance Locale au Maroc* website has an exceptionally wide range of materials, with practical documents that are easy to understand. Many of the tools can be used immediately.

Managers who wish to learn more about HRM should pay close attention to the documents available on this site.

b. Need for a more effective approach to training
On the whole, the types of in-service training offered by the municipality are not satisfactory. In some cases, the content is too theoretical and of no great use to the attendees. In others, the training is delivered in short sessions and much too superficial: the results are sparse, managers waste their time and the experience only increases the frustration they feel vis-à-vis the implementation.

A new type of training should be introduced in Marrakesh, per department or section. Training for a single individual has a very limited impact. Joint training for a group of individuals who work together has a real impact, as they learn new practices that they will introduce together in their workplace. This should be discussed with the Ministry of the Interior’s Administrative and Technical Managers Training Department (DFCAT).

D. Recommendations at national level

A number of recommendations have been made following the work done with the elected officials and managers of the municipality, and with the representatives of the local authorities (particularly the Directorate of Local Authorities).

1. Recommendations relating to the national statutory and regulatory framework

- Publish the orders implementing the Charte communale, particularly those relating to human resources management. These are mainly in articles 54 and 54 bis. The role of elected officials in human resources management and municipal administration needs to be clarified. The exact role of the elected officials in recruitment, allocations, appointments, and even structural changes to the authority should also be made clear.

The respective responsibilities of the Leader of the Municipal Council and the General Secretary must also be clarified, if not changed. Would it not be appropriate for the General Secretary to be the head of the municipal staff, a role which is currently performed by the Council Leader?

These clarifications and changes will enable the city’s officials to work with less stress, shielded from petty political interventions and within more sustainable structures.

- Make the status of local authority employees more attractive

The country’s development depends heavily upon local development and the cities can make a major contribution. Unfortunately the working conditions they offer do not attract either the best managers or the best specialists. This trend must be reversed, so that local officials are paid better, with compensation at least equal in all respects to that of their national counterparts. Otherwise Moroccan cities will become impossible to live in, and will be incapable of participating in local development.

- Change the status of elected officials to improve their quality
Some elected officials have difficulty in understanding their role and responsibilities within the Municipal Council or on committees. Sometimes they hold back the municipality rather than driving it forward. Changing the status of elected officials is a sensitive subject because it means tinkering with democracy and political parties. Nevertheless, the quality of the elected officials could be improved. A consultation with the political parties needs to be considered so that internal selection criteria can be introduced for candidates in municipal elections.

Furthermore, in order to improve transparency and raise moral standards in local political life, it would be highly desirable if elected officials were required to declare their assets. The declaration would also cover the official’s wife and children and would be made before and after the municipal term of office with the intervention of an independent committee.

- **Set up a voluntary retirement scheme for non-managerial staff within local government**

  The municipalities have many officers below managerial level who were recruited by successive municipal teams. They help to inflate the wage bill, while their productivity and performance are questionable; because they are unskilled, they contribute little to the municipality. What is more, their presence blocks the recruitment of administrators and specialists to managerial positions.

- **Encourage non-managerial officers to set up businesses**

  This policy would reduce the municipal wage bill by promoting the outsourcing of certain services. Non-managerial officials would be helped to set up their own business such as gardening, building and park maintenance, cleaning or caretaking work, etc. The municipality would invest in their start-ups and guarantee them a minimum volume of orders during the first five years.

### 2. Recommendations relating to human resources management at national level

- **Decentralize the strategic management of human resources within large municipalities**

  Discussions on this subject began many years ago. Since then, human resources management in the municipalities has deteriorated, but the municipality’s employees are now expected to pursue activities (setting up the PCD) that require more expertise and more specialists.

  While waiting for the decentralization of HRM to become more general, a pilot scheme can be set up in the city of Marrakesh. This must be prepared, managed and made the subject of a partnership between the DGCL, the city and an external partner operating directly with local government (under a decentralized cooperation scheme), which could contribute its expertise. Everything needed for the success of the scheme must be put in place.

- **Continue to adapt training to the municipalities’ needs**
New training needs have been brought to light by the PCD. Training to accompany the implementation of the PCD is to be provided in the following three fields:

**Human resources management.** This includes all aspects of human resources: analysis and diagnosis of human resources; management of jobs, the workforce and competencies; definition of recruitment and mobility policy; performance evaluation; staff development plan; training plan; internal communications plan; dialogue between management and labor; method for managing change, etc.

**The new municipal jobs resulting from the PCD.** The training bodies must prepare modules for jobs in territorial engineering: strategic planning and cross-cutting work; the implementation of the municipality’s strategies; the running of the authority’s assistance programs; project delivery and preparation; the leadership of the steering committees; mediation; local marketing; etc.

**Management practice:** lay down guidelines, provide leadership, supply clear objectives, be in control, communicate, monitor, redefine, motivate, mobilize, delegate, settle disputes, etc. These tasks underlie all the work of municipal organizations.

- **Offer individuals who have been successful in now obsolete lines of work the opportunity to retrain**

- **It would also be advisable to adapt training programs to the needs of the labor market and the jobs of tomorrow by offering individuals who have been successful in now obsolete lines of work the opportunity to retrain.**

In the same vein, grants for occupational retraining could be offered to unemployed graduates in local or national, public or private initiatives, after the needs of economic actors have been identified. The applications must be filtered through a rigorous and transparent selection process.

- **The principles of strategic workforce planning (GPEEC) must be more widely known**

Elected officials, political decision-makers, and administrative officers are often under great pressure from people in general and from those around them to offer positions in local government to young graduates, on the assumption that their suitability for the position is of secondary importance. It is sometimes difficult for them to resist this pressure.

Apart from the need to control the wage bill, it should be understood that poor recruitment causes many problems. For example, it often does not allow the employee concerned to reach their full potential, and places a heavy burden on the recruiting entity for forty years or so. Furthermore, the quality of services provided to thousands of citizens, especially the most disadvantaged, is likely to suffer greatly.

It would be beneficial if the GPEEC principles were accepted by ordinary people, political parties and civil society. This could be achieved through awareness-raising programs and advertisements in targeted media. These efforts would only bear fruit if the recruitment processes in public organizations were truly irreprouachable, transparent and fully controlled. If the formal recruitment procedures, job descriptions and the requirements of the specific person profile were understood, decision-makers
would be able to explain that, in spite of their desire to do their relatives and voters a service, they were unable to influence the recruitment decisions made by their organization.

3. **Take better account of the global nature of local strategic factors**

The global strategic factors are beyond the scope of the PCD, whose aim is to ensure management consistency in the medium term and is, as such, relatively restrictive. A city strategy must be based on a long term vision that meets the challenges of real and sustainable development.

The rapid development of the city of Marrakesh has been centered mainly on the economic dimension, without sufficient control of the social impacts, and to the detriment of environmental sustainability.

This economic development is built on fragile foundations as it derives essentially from the city’s heritage and its appeal as a tourist destination.

A real urban development strategy must also be linked seamlessly with those of the adjoining rural municipalities and the new satellite towns.

Internally, the municipality must identify its strategic areas of activity (DAS), clarify its core strategic tasks, and determine, for every DAS, which activities it must outsource, and which it will carry out either alone or jointly with neighboring municipalities.

This work would require a Strategy Department staffed with high level specialists to lead or supervise forward studies, draw up scenarios and present them to the elected officials in simple terms to facilitate the decision-making process. Such an undertaking would also require the elected officials' capabilities to be enhanced and forums created for debate and reflection on the development of the city, which would be open to all interested parties.

**E. Conclusion**

The mid-term evaluation of the PCD is an opportunity to share thinking about the municipality of tomorrow. Decisions about the structure of the PCD and improvements in the running of the municipality’s departments must be taken without delay.

The institutional situation, which is due to the absence of implementing provisions for the Charte communale, is restrictive, but should not be seen as an insuperable obstacle. The municipality’s decision-makers have some room for maneuver. The human potential, with real competencies, does exist. What is needed is rationalization, development and a proposal for a gradual and controlled approach to change. The existing action plans will make a big contribution. Without major improvements, the structure of the PCD will continue to experience many difficulties, the municipality will lose credibility and the population will be disappointed.

Two initiatives could, if developed, have considerable impact at local as well as national level, effectively transforming the municipality and preparing cities for a new generation.
The first is to make the PCD structure the driving force behind the development of both the city and the municipality. By functioning in a modern, innovative way "outside traditional structures", it will prefigure the municipal government of tomorrow. This operational structure will lead the other departments in the direction of change. This initiative depends on the municipality’s decision-makers, particularly the elected officials.

The second initiative, which would make the municipality a pilot city for a new style of human resources management, depends upon the construction of a partnership between the city of Marrakesh, the DGCL and preferably, another partner operating directly with local government (under a decentralized cooperation scheme). The municipalities, particularly the largest ones, are awaiting decentralizing reforms that have been debated for many years. Putting these ideas into practice in the city of Marrakesh, starting with the managed, gradual reform of human resources management, would send out a strong message to all the municipalities. This decision is also consistent with the municipalities' obligation to prepare their PCD, which is laid down in the Charte communale. The PCD has triggered a process that can no longer be stopped and must now be followed by serious reform.
GENERAL APPENDICES

Statement/summary by city: Sfax

Sfax, Tunisia’s second largest city, has 265,000 inhabitants (2004) in a metropolitan area with an estimated population of approximately 600,000. This economic capital is located 270km from Tunis.

Since the Revolution in January 2011, the electoral process has been interrupted. The municipality of Sfax is currently run by a second special delegation, appointed by the Ministry of the Interior in October 2012. The date of the next municipal elections is not yet known. The present unelected municipal team lacks legitimacy in the eyes of the population.

The General Directorate of Local Authorities (DGCL) still exercises strong external control at the present time. In the absence of new provisions, the provisions of the previous regime still apply. Decentralizing reforms, which had already failed to materialize before the Revolution, are still awaited. Although all the municipalities very much want these reforms, their principles are still under discussion by the committees of the National Constituent Assembly; it is not certain that they will be published in the near future.

The General Secretary of the municipality is the head of the municipal administration. This has about 1,644 staff (all categories combined), with 274 senior and middle managers. They have an average age of over 50, which means that replacing them will cause difficulties before long. Many managerial positions (71) remain vacant. The percentage of managerial staff is 5.5% to 9% depending on the calculations. There are proportionally too few technical managers.

The wage bill accounts for 67% of the total budget, 17% over budget. The municipalities do not control recruitment, which is the responsibility of the supervisory body. At the present time recruitment is frozen and managerial staff salaries are paid from the municipality’s own financial resources which have been significantly reduced in the last several years.

There is a single salary scale for the whole of the Tunisian public service, no distinction being made between central and municipal management. The approximate net monthly salary for a junior engineer is TND 900 (€420) and for a senior engineer, TND 1,500 (€700). At the outset of their careers, the salaries earned by municipal engineers and engineers working in the private sector are not very different. A newly qualified IT/telecommunications engineer in the private sector earns TND 950 (€450), an electrical/energy engineer TND 750 (€350) and a civil/mechanical engineer, TND 1,050 (€500). But in the private sector salaries rise much more quickly than in the public sector; after 10 years’ service, private sector engineers earn on average TND 3,000 (€1,400), double the salary of a senior engineer in the public service.

A career as a municipal manager is not attractive (salary, a lack of working facilities and means of communication, political interference in departments, lack of information, lack of management, little possibility of internal mobility). The municipality administers its staff but has no human resources management department.

Sfax, like all Tunisian cities, is well equipped for delegated project management (calls for tenders, terms of reference (TOR), specifications, evaluation of tenders). The technical departments (Ministry of Infrastructure) provide assistance, usually of high quality. Outsourcing solid waste management has been a positive experience for many municipalities.
Efforts have been made to computerize services, in spite of staff reluctance. An Intranet system linking the districts and the city hall departments is being installed; the obsolete city hall site is about to be modernized. The GIS, having only three layers of information, is little used; information is not added to it nor is it updated regularly.

The departmental management system is described as "archaic" by certain members of the special delegation: no management, no authority, no inter-departmental meetings, poor internal and external communications.

On the other hand, the diagnosis has identified a desire to change and modernize, as reflected in the efforts to set up a complete IT system and the desire to communicate better with the citizens. It is noteworthy that Sfax has a strong, competent civil society, which is ready to collaborate with the municipality. The presence of international sponsors ready to collaborate is also a positive factor.

Begun in 2002, the Greater Sfax Development Strategy (GSDS) was completed in 2008; it was a long-term strategy that had been prepared on a voluntary basis and was Tunisia’s first city strategy. It involved Greater Sfax, made up of Sfax and its seven surrounding and partner municipalities; this entity has no legal status. The authors of the Strategy were the municipality at that time (whose members are no longer in office) and civil society. The GSDS, which received many international contributions, is considered relevant but deserves to be updated. For the present municipal team, this document is an inheritance by default. Its sustainability is poor.

The implementation of the GSDS has not yet begun. However, the municipality has just taken several decisions: to set up a strategic committee to instigate internal reforms and promote the implementation of the GSDS; to establish a Local Development Office (LDO)—the engine of the strategy—its composition and place in the organization chart; and lastly to finalize about ten action plans to modernize services and eliminate numerous internal malfunctions. These action plans have been prepared in consultation with local authority managers; they can be put into effect immediately, and do not require either particular skills or a specific budget.

The French Caisse des Dépots et consignations has begun to provide the LDO with regular technical assistance, which will continue for at least a year.
Statement/summary by city: Saida

Saida, Lebanon’s third largest city, has a population of 60,000, including 40,000 Palestinian refugees (for whom the municipality does not accept responsibility) in an area covering 7 sq. km. Located 40km south of Beirut, its metropolitan area has a population of 266,000 in a space covering 25 sq. km.

The last municipal elections took place in May 2010; the next elections will take place in 2016. The municipal council has 21 members and 13 municipal committees.

The Lebanese system of local government is highly centralized. The Ministry of the Interior exerts rigid control over the municipalities (by, for example, supervising them a priori and a posteriori). Decentralizing reforms are not being considered.

Lebanese municipalities do not have a general secretary. By law, the mayor is the head of the municipal administration, which creates a risk of political interference in technical matters. Local government in Saida has 190 municipal employees (all categories combined) including a single senior manager and four category 2 managers. The percentage of managerial staff is less than 3%. The number of employees working on [short-term] contracts is greater than the number of permanent staff. Recruitment is possible, but slow and difficult, salaries being payable by the municipality, from its own financial resources. The wage bill currently represents 67% of the total budget.

In Lebanon there is a single salary scale for all public service employees, but the pay of municipal managers is one grade below that of the national public service. There is a notable difference between the salary level of a municipal engineer (from USD 800 to 1,200 /month) and an engineer in the private sector (from USD 1,200 /month at career start to USD 8,000 /month at the end). It is generally recognized that a municipal career is not attractive; there are very few candidates for a municipal manager’s job. It is not possible to move from one town to another and denominational membership is one of the selection criteria. The same manager runs the administrative and finance departments; he administers the staff, but human resources management is not part of his job. The municipal departments are computerized (but the computers are obsolete) and there is no Intranet. The GIS is not operational; the city hall website is also obsolete and has not been updated. After the diagnosis, a project financed by USAID proposed a new organization chart, produced job descriptions, issued concrete proposals for departmental modernization, established a data processing scheme, and in particular, set up a scheme to improve public access. Apparently few of these proposals have been put into effect.

Given the limited number of employees and the managerial culture of the elected officials, urban services (waste disposal, street sweeping, parks, upkeep of the stadium, emergency services, etc.) are mainly outsourced.

A development strategy cannot be implemented in-house because of the weakness of the municipality’s structures and the shortage of managerial staff. On the other hand, civil society is very strong in Saida.

The City Development Strategy, begun in October 2012, is due to be completed in April 2014. It is the subject of a European Union project, in partnership with the Hariri Foundation and with methodological support from Medcities. A team of consultants is organizing the activities involved. It will be a long term strategy, undertaken on a voluntary basis. The CDS was initially planned to cover only the city of Saida, but discussions are currently taking place about the enlargement of the area covered; indeed, it has become obvious that development
projects must involve the metropolitan area as well as the city itself. This enlargement is not without its problems as there are disputes between the city of Saida and the surrounding municipalities which have led to a breakdown in relations between Saida and the Union of Local Municipalities of which it was a member.

The strategy is not about to be rolled out. The municipality’s few managerial staff, the representatives of civil society, the members of the project and the experts are currently focusing on the preparation of the strategy and its many political implications. The consultants for the mission have only been able to make proposals on how to structure the implementation of the strategy which it has not been possible to discuss. They have only been able to warn of the need to discuss the realities of implementation as soon as possible, in order to avoid a potentially damaging time lag between the adoption of the strategy and its implementation.
Statement/summary by city: Marrakesh

Located 350 km from Rabat, Marrakesh is the Morocco’s fourth largest city with a population of 830,000 (2004) in a metropolitan area covering 181 sq. km.

Recently, the five municipalities surrounding Marrakesh have become districts and have been absorbed into the municipality of Marrakesh. The last municipal elections were held in 2009; the next are due in 2015. The Urban Municipal Council itself has 96 elected officials, or 199 including the five districts.

Municipalities are governed by the Charte communale, but its implementing provisions have not yet been published, which hinders the municipalities’ effectiveness. Numerous decentralization measures are ready or under consideration. Decisions are expected but the decision-making process on reform is slow. Meanwhile, the DGCL is exercising strong external control while providing the municipality with not inconsiderable technical support in developing and rolling out its projects.

According to the Charte communale: “the Leader [of the municipal council] runs the municipal departments. He is the head of the municipal staff”. There is therefore a risk of political interference in technical matters and of managerial instability if the municipal teams change as a result of the elections. The General Secretary has a purely coordinating role.

The municipality has a total of 3,124 employees (in 2012), including 1,705 for the urban municipality and 1,400 for the five districts. There are only 151 senior managers, so the percentage of managerial staff is low, at 4.7% to 8.3%, depending on the calculation. There is a big imbalance between technical managers (25% of the managerial staff) and administrative managers (75% of the managerial staff). The wage bill is 35% as against a percentage recommended by the DGCL of 25%. Recruitment is therefore frozen or subject to the authorization of the local Directorate of Local Authorities. The salaries of officers and managers are the responsibility of the municipality, which does not control recruitment and cannot select the managers it needs.

There is a single salary scale for all Moroccan public service employees. But the special status of local authority staff does not entitle them to bonuses (up to 30% of the salary) or other benefits (for example, employer provided accommodation). As the status of the local public service is not considered very attractive, the most competent managers, attracted by the conditions offered by national organizations or the private sector, do not continue to work there.

Whereas the monthly salary of a junior municipal engineer is about €650, an engineer in the private sector (IT, statistics, banking) earns a salary of MAD 10,000 to 13,000 (€900 to 1,170), during his first few years. The difference in salary between the public and private sector is about 50%.

The municipality has a personnel administration department. Conscious of the lack of human resources management, the elected officials have set up a modernization department, one of whose tasks is to make proposals for HRM. This has led to certain relational difficulties between the two departments.

In spite of the efforts made so far, there are too few computers in the departments; many managers work with their own personal computer. The departments are not connected via an Intranet. Access to the Internet through Wifi is difficult and limited. The city hall’s website is
undergoing modernization. On the other hand, the GIS system, run by four enthusiastic technicians, performs reasonably well in spite of the difficulties in collecting information.

The municipality’s main problems are: a lack of management, internal organization and authority (due to the statutory provisions); the problematic absorption of the districts into the urban municipality; the very small number of managers and, at the same time, the underuse of the skills of those in post in the districts; poor internal communication between departments; poor performance monitoring; lack of HRM and management training; lack of communication with the citizens.

Among the positive factors are the desire to modernize (on the part of the elected officials and the managers), and the wish to establish an HRM policy. The dynamism and expertise of some senior managers is remarkable. The municipal team has taken the initiative in a number of areas by: revising the organization chart (still awaiting approval by the DGCL); creating a team structured so as to implement the PCD; setting up structured coordination between the municipality and its districts; improving public access, etc.

The Plan Communal de Développement (PCD) was completed in June 2011. It is a medium term strategy (2011-2016), made mandatory for all the municipalities by the Charte communale; it is therefore the municipality’s road map for the next few years. The PCD, which covers Marrakesh and its five districts, is considered to be a success. The municipality initiated its preparation and managed the work, assisted by the local Directorate of Local Authorities, and a consultancy firm; civil society was also involved in the work. A group of municipal managers, very involved and still in post, think of themselves as owners of the PCD and are very keen to implement it. The likelihood that the PCD will be sustainable in the long-term is high.

The implementation of the projects presented by the PCD has begun, but only the projects already included in the municipality’s budget have been involved. An increase in capacity is therefore imperative.

Under the impetus of the mission, a strategic committee was set up to lead thinking on how to strengthen project management and professionalize the municipality’s departments. It decided the themes for the action plans that were produced in workshops, in order to improve the operation of internal administrative structures. It also made it possible to define the aims of the PCD’s implementing structure, its place in the municipal organization chart, the composition of its core in terms of human resources so that it has a multi-purpose function, the functional links with the municipal departments, and its financial resources.
An international experience: strategic plans in Turkish cities

The case of Turkish cities has often been cited as a benchmark: their city development strategies are thought to have been a success. It was therefore useful to get more information, and the reality has proved to be more complex.

Source:
Ula BAYRAKTAR, University of Mersin, Turkey and Élise MASSICARD, French Institute of Anatolian Studies (Institut français d’études anatoliennes), Istanbul, La décentralisation en Turquie, AFD, Collection Focales no.7, August 2011.

One aspect of the decentralization reform relates to modernizing the budgetary management of Turkish authorities. A multiannual strategic plan and an analytical budget are currently being prepared in the 205 municipalities with a population of more than 50,000 in order to manage municipal spending more efficiently (Law 5018 of 2003 on financial management and public supervision). The strategic plans and performance programs describe, by activity, the municipality’s objectives accompanied by quantitative and qualitative indicators. These documents, drawn up by the municipalities, have been adopted by the municipal councils and constitute commitments for the municipality concerned.

However, in practice the contribution of the elected officials is very limited, since these plans have to be adopted within about six months of the local elections (Law 5343, article 41). The newly elected officials are unlikely to gain sufficient knowledge of the plans and master the issues in such a short space of time.

Strategic plans do not fit easily into the culture of the municipalities

The introduction of an approach so unfamiliar to the Turkish public service is not without problems. Some municipalities have set up a strategy and planning department in order to pool financial and technical information about all the municipality's operations and to monitor, evaluate and control the implementation of the performance program.

However, according to a recent study (Songür, 2008), 10% of municipalities, including one metropolitan municipality, have not set up a dedicated planning department. Almost half the departments that have been set up have prepared their strategic plan with the help of external advisers (private firms or academics), and 36.5% of the municipalities that have called upon such expertise have totally outsourced the drafting of the plan. For the other municipalities, developing a strategic plan often amounts to no more than copying and pasting the plans of other institutions, if sources in city halls are to be believed. In this respect, the plan prepared by the district of Seyhan, which received high praise from a government minister, seems to have inspired many other municipalities.

There are frequent difficulties in reconciling these strategic plans with investment programs and the budget. While senior managers of municipal departments welcome the philosophy behind the reform in terms of traceability and effectiveness, they consider that putting such documents into practice in the Turkish context is unthinkable, mainly on the grounds that most city hall departments lack staff with any knowledge of accountancy, or that, in the light of current practice, multiannual financial planning is not a realistic proposition.
In general, these strategic plans seem to be seen not as a reference framework of relevance to the activities of local authorities, but rather as formalities with few implications. In the same way, the departmental authorities do not have staff sufficiently qualified to prepare such plans, which in practice are therefore prepared by the decentralized administration.

**Insufficient and technically unprepared human resources**

One of the main impediments to the local authorities' assumption of responsibility for their competencies is the staff. Staff management in local authorities underwent a radical change in 2007 with the introduction of the "standards for permanent staff" (norm-kadro) principle, that henceforth would set the limits. From then on, the Ministry of the Interior would determine the number, job titles and qualifications of staff who could be recruited by local authorities. These standards aim to regulate the quality and type of staff recruited by authorities in order to prevent the partisan and clientelist policies that were previously widespread (city halls recruiting large numbers of people with no specific qualifications, who were surplus to requirements, from the ranks of those supporting the team currently in power). Insofar as these standards limit the power of local authorities to recruit, they can be considered as restricting their technical capacity, particularly as these jobs, with their public service salaries, are not very attractive to qualified staff. Moreover the municipalities have inherited from previous practices permanent staff who often have few qualifications, and must wait for some of them to leave before replacing them. From this point of view, a measure has been introduced solely for the benefit of metropolitan municipalities, namely the creation of "mayoral advisor" positions, open only to graduates with four years' higher education. There are a maximum of five for metropolitan municipalities and ten for municipalities with a population of more than a million.

The law on municipalities (article 49, §3) also opens the way to the employment of [short-term] contract staff and therefore to more flexible ways of working. But—once again, to curb clientelist employment practices—spending on staff has been limited: it is capped at 30% of the budget (40% for municipalities with a population of less than 10,000). Most of the municipalities of the Justice and Development Party (AKP) even make it a point of honor to keep spending on staff at an even lower level, on the grounds that efficiency gains can be made by doing so.

In the end, while local authorities are being given more, and more technical, areas of responsibility (such as urban information systems, *kent bilgi sistemi*, and the new accounting rules), the human resources they have to work with, particularly the number of qualified staff, have been limited. In consequence, everything is pushing the municipalities towards sub-contracting. The municipality of Adana, for example, has most of its construction plans prepared by private firms.

**Towards the privatization of municipal services?**

One important aspect of the reforms involves the municipalities' room for maneuver in economic matters. It is even expected that the management of municipal services will be left to the discretion of municipalities. So, highway maintenance and public transport can be outsourced to private bodies from now on. After having received the approval of the Ministry of the Interior, the municipalities can also set up companies (water services, refuse collection, etc.). All these reforms show the way not only for the transfer of powers, but also for the privatization of local authority services and therefore, probably, for a reconfiguration of the relationships between the institutional, political and economic fields.
Municipalities can now choose the most appropriate management method for the services that have to be provided (direct management, delegated management, municipal economic institutions, concessions...).

The new law on municipalities extends the possibilities of cooperation between local authorities and the private sector. Municipalities are encouraged to delegate to the private sector. They can now appoint private sector entities to set up and run services such as the supply of water for drinking, for the drains and for industrial purposes; the collection of waste water and rain; the use of mineral water; public transport schemes; the collection, transportation, decomposition, recycling, destruction and storage of solid waste; and the construction of marinas and embankments. Such services can be totally delegated to the private sector for a maximum of 49 years, once the Council of State and the Ministry of the Interior have given their approval. From now on municipal councils can grant concessions, privatize businesses and companies and acquire holdings. Lastly, councils can sign contracts with private actors. Therefore, practically all municipal services can be delegated to the private sector in one form or another, through privatization, subcontracting, service contracts, etc. Other legislation relating to the public sector in general, and not necessarily specific to local authorities, encourages the use of private sector entities – as in the case of the incentives linked to urban renewal schemes.

**The municipalities can promote the creation of private companies**

There are four main reasons why municipalities are likely to support the creation of private companies:

- Private enterprises can adopt more profitable and efficient commercial policies; by comparison, public institutions must put the public interest first, ahead of economic profitability. Therefore, it is more efficient economically for a municipality to use a private sector company.
- Private entities can borrow from private banks, whereas municipalities can only take out loans from the Provincial Bank of Turkey.
- Private entities are not subject to the narrow framework of the public service and can recruit better qualified employees.
- The private sector has greater room for maneuver and does not have to follow slow and lengthy bureaucratic procedures.

The metropolitan municipalities can hand over the management of their kiosks, car parks and cafés to companies in which they have shares, without being subject to the legal requirements governing public contracts (article 26 of the law relating to metropolitan municipalities).

**The increasingly widespread use of subcontracting**

Labor Law 4857, promulgated in 2003, enables the public sector to recruit outside staff to produce goods and services for which expertise is "necessary for institutional or technical reasons". This law, which is intended to guarantee the socio-economic rights of subcontractors’ employees, has encouraged the use subcontracting, which is now widespread, since the conditions for such recruitment are still very vague. These "institutional or technical reasons" are too ill-defined to create a valid framework. Contracts of this type owe their popularity to the minimal statutory supervision they allow over the socio-economic rights of employees. Public employers are more favorably disposed towards subcontracting, which allows for more freedom when recruiting or dismissing staff, less room for maneuver for the unions, less pressure on salaries and working hours, and lastly, fewer obligations as far as health and safety at work are concerned.
In other words, subcontracting reduces the obligations that public employers must normally assume within the framework of the public service (Gökbayrak, 2008). In practical terms, one of the consequences of such developments is that there is more insecure, informal, even unregistered work in sectors formerly protected because the work was done by local authorities (road cleaning, refuse collection, public buildings, etc.).

Therefore, it is clear that partnerships with the private sector are no longer confined to infrastructure funding, but also cover the production, operation and management of services by (increasingly for) local authorities. Against this background, another initiative which is under consideration, namely the privatization of the Provincial Bank, should also be mentioned, because of the significant consequences it could have if it materializes. If the bank was privatized, the institution would move from the public to the private sector and its functions would be simplified. The Bank would become a purely financial institution, stripped of its role as an intermediary between the government and local authorities. Also it would no longer give technical assistance to local authorities in connection with urban investment projects, in fields as diverse as cartography, town planning, drinking and waste water, construction and surveys.
Proposal for South-South discussions

Theme
What changes do municipalities need to make in order to implement their city development strategy effectively?

City development strategies (CDS) have emerged recently in the Southern and Eastern Mediterranean regions as part of a decentralized approach to development. They have a critical role to play. There is certainly a multitude of innovative initiatives and processes but these ventures are still isolated, fragile and often incomplete.

The World Bank's Cities for a new Generation study (Review and evaluation of human resources at municipal level) suggests that the introduction of a CDS presupposes a radical reform of the municipality concerned at both the internal level, i.e. the necessary competencies, the implementing structures of the development projects, management methods and current administrative practices, and the external level, i.e. the supervisory body.

The local actors are largely unsupported by the national authorities in their desire for local development.

Those who participate in and carry forward the CDS (elected officials, municipal managers, members of civil society, etc), are strongly aware of their isolation. They lack visibility and institutional recognition. The local actors' involvement in local development processes and their desire for change are rarely accompanied by lasting changes in decision-making mechanisms and the traditional workings of governments. The Moroccan Charte communale stipulates that "the municipality undertakes all local community-based action that will get the citizen involved, and develop the collective consciousness for the benefit of local people", but this legal recognition of civil society actors and their influence on the local and especially on national decision-making processes remains pretty rare.

This lack of constitutional or legal recognition acts as a significant brake on the growing power of local actors and development processes, which are still faced with a lack of human and financial resources and a lack of technical and organizational expertise.

This state of affairs has already been identified by a certain number of actors in the field of international cooperation who have set up programs to assist and support the local actors. These programs bring international recognition to the process of transferring responsibility for public policy to local government. A certain number of local, regional and national actors, who are involved in various processes, are given technical support and training which enhance their capabilities and the quality of their projects. Nevertheless, the real impact of these programs often remains difficult to evaluate. What is more, these initiatives are often hampered by the lack of involvement of national authorities, who perceive them as irrelevant to their own strategy.

City development strategies will have little chance to blossom unless the fundamental responsibilities of municipalities are carried out to a higher standard

The diagnoses of the cities of Sfax, Saida and Marrakesh are revealing. The strategies are realistic and correspond to a development vision based on real needs, expressed by all the stakeholders in the population. But, given the way the municipalities are currently run, they will struggle to implement them while they cannot manage to carry out their fundamental
responsibilities to a satisfactory standard (local public services, highway maintenance and the upkeep of public amenities, refuse collection, transport, etc.).

Therefore the existence of the CDS assumes a radical improvement in municipalities’ working practices. All aspects of municipal management are affected. Many elected officials are becoming aware that they must inevitably bring about internal reforms in the municipalities so that they become operational, modern, in step with the needs of the population and credible in the eyes of the voters. The CDS have revealed the state of the municipalities and are driving change.

*The CDS are giving impetus to the change in the municipalities*

The introduction of the CDS is pushing the municipalities to work in different ways and to introduce change. Most of them have two internal obligations that must be satisfied:

- To improve the day-to-day management of municipal services in order to implement the CDS. Some cities have identified areas for improvement and have drawn up precise action plans (Sfax, Marrakesh) to improve the performance of their administration.

- To find the best structure to run the CDS. Several solutions are possible, provided they remain within the legal framework. For example, Sfax and Marrakesh have decided to create internal cross-cutting structures, whereas Saida is looking for an innovative type of structure that could be both outside the municipality and under its control, which would be led and funded by representatives of civil society.

*A meeting between the cities of the Southern and Eastern Mediterranean*

**Participants**

A meeting between a certain number of cities in the Southern and Eastern Mediterranean could be organized. The participating cities would belong to two groups:

- Cities that have already begun to implement their CDS and are ready to share their experiences.
- Cities intending to prepare a CDS, or on the point of implementing one, who wish to learn from the experience of the cities in the first group.

Representatives of decentralized cooperation schemes involved in the CDS would also take part. Hitherto, many actors have got involved in the design and methodology of CDS development; far fewer have taken an interest in implementation.

**Purpose of the meeting**

The purpose of the exchanges is to compare the experiences and good practice that facilitated the implementation of the CDS in the cities. This objective can be divided into three themes:

- The measures called for by the municipalities from the supervisory bodies and their replies
- The internal changes and improvements made within the municipalities to make them more efficient and facilitate the implementation of the CDS
- The types of structure set up within (or outside) the municipalities to implement the CDS

A meeting of this type would increase the capacity of the local actors in the following ways:

- It would reinforce the network of Mediterranean cities that meet together to discuss technical concerns linked to local development
- It would give actors access to technical tools that would release synergies and complementarities between cities
- By creating a forum for the cities and representatives of decentralized cooperation schemes and international organizations. The cities need international contacts who can provide the technical tools of cooperation, territorial engineering, training for local staff, etc., in order to implement their CDS projects.