Enhancing Social Accountability in Saida

May 2013

*Findings of research carried out in the context of the* Cities for a New Generation Project

Prepared by:
Carmen Malena: Lead consultant
Dany Haddad: National consultant
## Table of Contents

*Executive Summary* ........................................................................................................... 4

I. Introduction ....................................................................................................................... 8
   A. Objective of the study
   B. Research methodology
   C. Overview of the report

II. Context Analysis ............................................................................................................. 9
   A. National-level
      *Decentralized governance in Lebanon*
      *Electoral democracy challenges*
      *Municipal financing*
   B. Saida municipality
      *Geography and demographics of Saida*
      *Ain El Helweh refugee camp*
      *Political dynamics*
      *Municipal structures*
      *Municipal budget*

III. Stakeholder Mapping ................................................................................................... 21
   *Saida Municipal Council*
   *Political parties*
   *Civil society organizations*
   *Women in Saida*
   *Youth in Saida*
   *Media*
   *Private sector*

IV. Assessment of Social Accountability in Saida ............................................................. 25
   A. Survey findings
   B. Detailed assessment of key aspects of social accountability
      *Information sharing*
      *Civic education*
      *Citizens’ social and economic rights*
      *Citizen participation*
      *Participatory planning*
      *Financial transparency*
      *Citizen participation in budgeting*
      *Participatory monitoring*
      *Government responsiveness and accountability to citizens*
V. Recommendations

A. Recommendations for Saida municipality
B. Recommendations for national-level reforms
C. Messages for the World Bank

List of Boxes

Box 1 - Historical background of municipalities in Lebanon
Box 2 – Municipal Code Decree Law No. 118
Box 3 - Taef Accord 1989 on Administrative Decentralization
Box 4 – List of Saida civil society organizations
Box 5 - Cultural Heritage and Urban Development Project
Box 6 - The Renovation of the Saida Downtown
Box 7 - The Urban Sustainable Development Project (USDS)
Box 8 - Objectives of the School Network of Saida and Neighborhoods
Box 9 - Saida Fruit and Vegetable Market

List of graphs

Graph 1 – Rating of Saida local government performance
Graph 2 – Categories of survey respondents
Graph 3 – Principles of social accountability

List of Annexes

Annex 1 Bibliography
Annex 2 List of persons met
Annex 3 Survey results
Annex 4 Summary of workshop findings and list of workshop participants
Executive Summary

1. Objective of the study - The Cities for a New Generation project seeks to empower cities in the Middle East and North Africa region to exploit their potential for economic and social development. The focus of this study is on one specific aspect of the overall project – that of improving local governance through enhanced social accountability. Social accountability aims to strengthen the accountability of government and improve the efficiency of public agencies by involving citizens and civil society organizations in policy decisions and in monitoring public programs. The objective of this study is to assess current levels of social accountability in the city of Saida, Lebanon and to recommend actions for enhanced social accountability.

2. Research methodology - In completing this assignment, the study team used a range of research methodologies including: (i) document review and analysis, (ii) key informant interviews (with municipal staff members, members of the Saida Municipal Council and local political leaders; as well as interviews with representatives from political parties, civil society organizations, media, academia and the private sector), (iii) a small public opinion survey (of 88 respondents) and, (iv) participatory workshops with various groups of stakeholders. In all aspects of the research, special efforts were made to reach out to women and youth as key agents of change.

3. Context analysis – The report provides a brief description of the overall political context and state of decentralization in Lebanon, as well as background information about the geographic, socio-economic and political context in Saida and a mapping of key stakeholder groups in Saida, including: municipal council members, members of political society, civil society organizations (including women’s groups, youth groups and independent media) and the private sector.

4. Assessment of social accountability in Saida – The report assesses current practice and lessons learned regarding ten key aspects of social accountability: (i) information-sharing; (ii) civic education; (iii) citizen-state dialogue; (iv) financial transparency; (v) participatory planning; (vi) citizen participation in budgeting; (vii) participatory monitoring and evaluation of public services; (viii) complaints handling; (ix) government responsiveness and accountability to citizens, and; (x) citizen oversight/participation in anti-corruption measure. It finds performance in all of these areas to be weak and in some cases non-existent. For example, no examples could of prior experience or even experimentation could be identified in the case of: citizen participation in budgeting, participatory monitoring and evaluation of public services and, citizen oversight/participation in anti-corruption measure. Despite the current weak state of social accountability Saida, research found good potential for enhanced performance in this area and a strong level of interest on the part of municipal authorities and citizens alike to strengthen social accountability in their city.

5. Recommendations for enhancing social accountability at the municipal level – The report identifies a range of practical recommendations aimed at improving performance in each of the ten key aspects of social accountability in Saida. These are listed in the order of priority attributed to them by local stakeholders. Some key recommendation include the following:

(i) Information-sharing
   a. Design and implement a communication strategy, aimed at keep citizens informed about key public issues, decisions and developments.
   b. Publish a regular (quarterly) newsletter.
c. Convene regular (quarterly) townhall meetings - Ensure that the meetings are well-publicized to encourage public attendance and invite local media to attend.

d. Expand use of ICTs for purposes of information-sharing - Revamp the city’s Facebook page, in consultation with citizens to find out their information interests and needs, and use text messages to announce public events, etc.

e. Draw on the assistance of interns/volunteers - In particular, recruit a team of technologically-savvy young people to assist in improving the municipality’s use of social media tools such as the website, Facebook and Twitter accounts and text messaging.

(ii) Civic education

a. Clarify and build consensus around mutual roles and responsibilities - Through a participatory process involving citizens, CSOs, municipal staff and councilors, develop and disseminate a “Municipal Charter of Rights and Responsibilities”.

b. Conduct public awareness-raising activities - Address key topics such as: the meaning of “active citizenship”; the role of the municipality; the revenues and expenditures of the municipality; respect for public spaces and public hygiene.

c. Improve and support school-based civic education programs - Develop a learning module on local governance and active citizenship for use by primary school teachers, and encourage Municipal Council members to visit schools and talk to students about the role of the municipality and citizens.

d. Engage youth outside of school - Organize special events and contests to engage young people in civic/municipal affairs, and introduce a parallel youth municipal council.

(iii) Complaints handling

a. Establish and publicize clear processes and standards for complaints handling - Consider introducing a “one-stop shop” at the municipality, and establish and publicly disseminate standards for complaints handling, including, for example, limits for response time and measures of redress.

b. Involve citizens/civil society in overseeing and contributing to the complaints handling process - Establish a committee for complaints handling (made up of municipal councilors and civil society representatives).

(iv) Citizen oversight/participation in anti-corruption measure

a. Develop capacities and skills for citizen oversight and anti-corruption - Seek training/capacity development opportunities for citizens and councilors to learn about methods of social audit, procurement monitoring and other forms of citizen oversight and their benefits.

b. Support citizen participation in anti-corruption measures - Explore possibilities for citizen oversight over public procurement and the work of local contractors, and support independent social audits of public budgets, projects and services by citizen groups/CSOs.

(v) Government responsiveness and accountability to citizens

a. Publicize annually the specific goals and commitments of the municipal government.

b. Take concrete steps to better understand citizen’s priority needs - Conduct a survey to learn about citizens’ views and needs, initiate monthly neighborhood “walk-abouts” by the mayor and/or municipal councilors.

c. Develop capacities, skills and resources for government responsiveness and social accountability - Offer training in social accountability methods and tools to municipal councilors, employees and CSOs, emphasize the potential benefits.
(vi) Participatory monitoring and evaluation (M&E) of public services and projects
   a. Build capacities and skills for participatory monitoring and evaluation - Seek out and support opportunities for training in participatory monitoring and evaluation to municipal councilors, employees and CSOs.
   b. Better inform citizens and CSOs about ongoing and upcoming development projects - Promote transparency during the implementation of development projects (e.g. through the publication of quarterly progress reports).
   c. Support citizen/CSO efforts to monitor and evaluate public services - Develop service charters, and introduce the concept of performance evaluation through the adoption of social monitoring tools (e.g. such as social audits and Community Scorecards).

(vii) Financial transparency
   a. Facilitate citizen access to municipal financial information - Publish simplified municipal budget and project budgets, and organize an annual “general assembly” to directly inform citizens them about the municipal budget and to allow them to ask questions.
   b. Build “budget literacy” - Undertake public education activities to raise awareness about municipal finances and the benefits of financial transparency and participatory budgeting.

(viii) Participatory planning
   a. Sustain and deepen citizen participation in the ongoing development and implementation of urban development plans - Introduce even more inclusive and substantive forms of citizen participation (beyond information-sharing), ensure regular public reporting on progress and, introduce mechanisms for citizen/CSO participation in the implementation and monitoring of the USDS.
   b. Institutionalize the use of participatory planning methodologies - Use participatory planning methodologies (e.g. such as public opinion polls, focus group discussions, workshops, meetings and consultations with CSOs and other stakeholders) to involve citizens in planning processes.

(ix) Citizen-state dialogue
   a. Promote citizen participation and dialogue in the context of municipal committee work - Expand the representation of municipal council committees to include civil society and citizen representatives.
   b. Support meaningful and regular dialogue with citizens and civil society actors - Convene quarterly town hall meetings to share information, listen/respond to citizen concerns and debate issues of priority concern, and capitalize on the important role played by the Mokhtar in promoting social accountability and citizen-state dialogue.

(x) Citizen participation in budgeting
   a. Share budget information with citizens - Develop a user-friendly budget template for purposes of public disclosure - including revenue sources and amounts, as well as projected and actual expenditures for all municipal projects and activities.
   b. Consider introducing mechanisms of participatory budgeting - Set aside a portion of the municipal budget to be allocated to small-scale community development/improvement projects proposed by citizens/CSOs (and selected through a transparent and competitive process, potentially drawing on a “development marketplace” model).
6. **Recommendations for national-level reforms** - Municipal-level social accountability is strongly influenced by national-level factors. The following recommendations, aim to create a more enabling environment and more supportive national legal and policy framework for social accountability.

- Strengthen decentralization - *Reform the decentralization system of Lebanon to empower municipalities with (i) more authority and (ii) adequate financial resources to perform their duties.*
- Promote civic education and citizen participation – *Make national-level policy reforms to create space for citizen participation, and amend the civic education module of the Lebanese school curriculum to include components on municipal governance and citizen rights and responsibilities.*
- Expand access to information - *Ratify Access to Information legislation, and make policy reforms for enhanced budget transparency.*
- Fight corruption - *Fulfill the provisions of the UNCAC by ratifying access to information and whistleblowers’ protection laws, and establish an Ombudsman Office.*

7. **Messages for the World Bank** - Finally, local stakeholders suggested a number of messages for the World Bank, as the supporter and funder of this initiative. These are as follows:

- Support a social accountability capacity development program in Lebanon (and/or a smaller-scale pilot program in Saida).
- Explore the possibility of providing financial and/or technical support to the proposed Saida urban observatory.
- Encourage more active and meaningful forms of citizen and civil society participation in the design and implementation of new and ongoing Bank-supported development projects in Saida.
- Ensure that any new development project dedicates a certain percentage of its budget for purposes of citizen education, participation and oversight (e.g. monitoring of project activities and expenditures by citizens and the municipal council).
- Ensure that infrastructure projects include adequate provisions for ongoing maintenance, including support to the municipality to fulfill this role and support for citizen monitoring.
I. INTRODUCTION

A. Objective of the study

1. The Cities for a New Generation project seeks to empower cities in the Middle East and North Africa region to exploit their potential for economic and social development. Working with committed local governments in Sfax, Marrakesh and Saida and respective national institutions in Tunisia, Morocco and Lebanon, the overall project aims to establish city-specific diagnoses and action plans for urban policy reform and investment. In Saida, the preparation of an Urban Sustainable Development Strategy (USDS) - aimed at (i) developing the city’s descriptive memory, (ii) conducting a diagnosis of six key cross-cutting issues (including urban infrastructure; green/open space networks; cultural and natural heritage; employment in traditional industries and trades; institutional and legal frameworks, and; local economic development), (iii) developing a mission and vision for the city and, (iv) identifying strategic objectives for the coming ten to twenty years - is currently underway. The USDS is being developed in a participatory manner. In addition to a team of urban development experts, a wide range of municipal actors (including municipal staff, council members, civil society representatives, private sector representatives and citizens) have been invited to contribute to the process. The focus of this study is on one specific aspect of the overall project – that of improving local governance through enhanced social accountability.

2. Social accountability aims to strengthen the accountability of government and improve the efficiency of public agencies by involving citizens and civil society organizations in policy decisions and in monitoring public programs. It is a way to make government work more effectively by enabling citizens to articulate their needs, demand greater inclusiveness and equity in policymaking and service delivery, and express their satisfaction or dissatisfaction with government performance. Social accountability seeks not to replace but to reinforce and complement existing formal accountability mechanisms. The objective of this study is to assess current levels of social accountability in the city of Saida and to recommend actions for enhanced social accountability. These recommendations are intended to inform the content and process of the ongoing USDS project as well as the broader practices of the municipality.

B. Research methodology

3. In completing this assignment, the study team used a range of research methodologies including: (i) document review and analysis, (ii) key informant interviews, (iii) a small public opinion survey and, (iv) participatory workshops. Research was carried out from February to end April 2013.

4. First, key documents of relevance to social accountability in Saida (and Lebanon more generally) were reviewed and analyzed. A bibliography of consulted materials is attached as Annex 1.

5. Secondly, the study team carried out interviews with key informants from the municipality in order to identify current practices and assess the conditions for social accountability. This involved, for example: meetings with municipal staff members, members of the Saida Municipal Council and local political leaders; as well as interviews with representatives from political parties, civil society organizations, media, academia and the private sector. Special efforts were made to reach out to women and youth. A list of people met is attached as Annex 2.
6. Thirdly, the consultants conducted a small-scale public opinion survey (of 88 respondents), designed to assess perceptions of the performance of the municipality with regard to social accountability and the views and attitudes of citizens with regard to social accountability-related themes. Survey results are attached as Annex 3 and findings are cites in section 3 of the report.

7. Finally, the consultants conducted a series of participatory workshops, to discuss issues related to social accountability with various groups of key stakeholders, seek their assessment of the current situation and gather their recommendations. Research findings were also shared and discussed with municipal staff and elected representatives at a validation and feedback workshop. A summary of workshop findings and list of workshop participants is attached as Annex 4.

C. Overview of the report

8. Following this brief introduction, the first section of the study provides relevant background information regarding the context for social accountability in Saida. This includes a brief description of the overall political context and state of decentralization in Lebanon, as well as background information about the geographic, socio-economic and political context in Saida and a mapping of key stakeholder groups in Saida, including: the municipal council, members of political society, civil society organizations (including women’s groups, youth groups and independent media) and the private sector. Section three of the report provides an assessment of current policy, practice and lessons with regard to social accountability in Saida. This section presents the findings of the survey and assesses current practice and lessons learned regarding ten key aspects of social accountability: (i) information-sharing; (ii) civic education; (iii) citizen-state dialogue; (iv) financial transparency; (v) participatory planning; (vi) citizen participation in budgeting; (vii) participatory monitoring and evaluation of public services; (viii) complaints handling; (ix) government responsiveness and accountability to citizens, and; (x) citizen oversight/participation in anti-corruption measure. Finally, based on this analysis, section four of the report makes recommendations for enhancing social accountability through practical action in these various areas.

II. CONTEXT ANALYSIS

A. National-level

Decentralized governance in Lebanon

9. The administrative system in Lebanon is characterized by a strong presence of the central State, which includes 22 Ministries, and features a very limited level of delegation of powers to Local authorities or municipalities. Lebanon is divided into six governorates (Beirut, Bekaa, North Lebanon, South Lebanon, Mount Lebanon and Nabatiyeh). Governorates are divided into 26 districts, subdivided into municipalities. There are around 985 municipalities


2. Technically Lebanon has eight governorates. In July 16, 2003, the law No. 522/2003 was ratified setting the ground for the establishment of two new governorates, Akkar and Baalbek–Hermel (The Central Administration for Statistics, cited on: http://www.cas.gov.lb/index.php/en/about-lebanon-en) However, these new governorates only exist on paper, as the exact rules and regulations that dictate how they function have not been written. (Now Lebanon, March 12, 2009, cited on: https://now.mmedia.me/lb/en/commentaryanalysis/the_name_game).
regrouped into 48 unions of municipalities. These unions include a total of 660 municipalities as members (two thirds of the total number of municipalities) and they are home to two thirds of the resident population of the country.

**Box 1 - Historical Background of Municipalities in Lebanon**

The existence of municipalities in Lebanon dates back to the nineteenth century. During the Egyptian occupation, in 1833 an advisory council was established in Beirut. The first experiences of local government took place during the Tanzimat period, under the Ottomans. Promoted to the rank of capital of a wilaya, Beirut was to provide the wali of a board that looked after the affairs of the public health, safety and lighting.

The first municipality was established in Lebanon in Deir El Qamar in 1864 after the civil war and following the promulgation of the Organic Regulation of mohafazah Mount-Lebanon, while the municipality of Beirut was incorporated under the Ottoman Empire in 1867. The major cities of what became Lebanon, Saida (Sidon) and Trablous (Tripoli) in particular saw themselves become municipalities some years later in the wave of the Tanzimat.

Municipalities experienced a revival during the French Mandate, during which time public administrations were developed. Their role, however, only really gained significance during the tenure of the President of the Republic General Chehab between 1958 and 1964, who established a modern law that favored the formation of dozens of new municipalities.


10. **Decentralization in Lebanon remains limited.** Municipalities represent the only level of decentralized government. Governorates do not play a political role as they do not provide services to citizens, nor do they receive any financing. Municipalities in Lebanon are governed by the Decree Law No. 118 issued in 1977, composed of 139 articles and including details of the administrative and financial aspects of municipalities. According to the same Decree, the municipality is a local authority that fully exercises its powers within its geographical boundaries and enjoys administrative and financial independence. It’s an elected local entity with financial and administrative autonomy. According to articles 49 and 50 of the Decree Law No. 118, Municipal Councils should enjoy a certain level of administrative independence. In addition to the Municipal Council prerogatives, Article 74 of the law grants municipal Mayors decision-making authority in some administrative transactions, for example, with regard to urban planning and construction permits. The specific provisions of Articles 49, 50 and 74 are outlined below in Box 2.

**Box 2 – Municipal Code Decree Law No. 118**

**Article 49** - The Municipal Council shall be in charge, without limitation, of the following:

1. The municipal budget, including transferring and opening credits
2. Cutting off budget accounts
3. Different types of loans for carrying out specific projects that have been studied.
4. Assigning some of the municipal present and future returns to the borrower or the State in return for its guarantee of the debt and mentioning the annual due installments in the consecutive municipal budgets throughout the period of the said debt
5. Determining the rates of the municipal taxes according to the law
6. Specifications for deals regarding the supplies, works and services
7. Specifications for selling the municipal properties
8. Reconciliation
9. Approval and rejection of donations and ordered funds

---


10- Public programs for works, aesthetics, cleaning, health affairs, water projects and lighting
11- Naming the streets in the municipal area
12- Planning, improving and expanding the streets, establishing gardens and public places and executing
designs related to municipality as well as the Master Plan in cooperation with the Directorate General
for Urban Planning with the observance of the provisions of the expropriation law, provided that the
approval of both the Urban Planning Directorate and the competent municipality be bound to approve
the project. In case of contradiction between the municipality and the Urban Planning Directorate, the
Council of Ministers shall definitely decide on the subject
13- Establishing shops, parks, racing places, playgrounds, toilets, museums, hospitals, dispensaries,
shelters, libraries, popular residences, wash houses, sewers, waste drainage and others
14- Contributing to the tuition fees related to the public schools pursuant to the provisions of these
schools.
15- Contributing to the fees of projects of public interest
16- Transferring municipal public property to private municipal property
17- Regulating transportation of all types, determining its fees if necessary within the municipal area,
with observance of the provisions of the laws in force
18- Rescuing the needy and disabled people and assisting clubs, associations and other health, social,
sports and cultural activities
19- Organizing the systems related to the municipality servants and workers and determining the scale of
wages and salaries
20- Enjoying the right to enter into contracts to conclude agreements with municipalities
21- Controlling educational activities and work progress in public and private schools as well as drawing
up reports to the competent educational references.
22- Supervising public utilities and drawing up reports regarding the work progress thereof to the
concerned administrations
23- Approving the consideration according to which the streets resulting from a subdivision project, out
of which more than six real estate belonging to different owners benefit fall within the scope of
municipal public properties; the municipality shall be, therefore, entitled to carry out works
24- Ordering the beneficiaries of a construction project of which the study has been carried out to
contribute to the fees of the said project in the event of the approval of the majority of at least the
three quarters of the beneficiaries.

**Article 50** - The Municipal Council shall be entitled, within its area, to establish or manage directly or
indirectly, or contribute to or to help in the execution of the following works and projects:
1. Public schools, nurseries and technical schools
2. Popular residences, toilets, public wash houses and swimming pools
3. Public hospitals, sanitariums, dispensaries and other health establishments and institutions
4. Museums, public libraries, theaters, cinemas, amusement centers, clubs, playgrounds and other public
and sports shops as well as social, cultural and artistic institutions
5. Local means of public transportation
6. Public shops for buying food, refrigerators for keeping them and threshing floors.

**Article 74** - The Head of the Executive Authority shall take charge, including without limitation, the
following tasks:
1- Executing the decisions of the Municipal Council
2- Making municipal budget forecasts
3- Managing and supervising municipality departments
4- Managing the funds and real estates of the municipality and thereafter carrying out all the required
works in order to preserve its rights
5- Managing the revenues of the municipality and overseeing its accounts
6- Ordering the payment of the municipal budget, settling and controlling the charges and giving
notices of payment
7- Concluding contracts of rent, division and barter, accepting donations and ordered goods, purchases
and transactions after having authorized such works according to the provisions of this law
8- Acting the same regarding the purchases, agreements, transactions, undertakings as well as
<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Representing the municipality before the Courts according to the terms provided for in this law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Authorizing fees by virtue of a statement or an invoice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Issuing orders to take local measures regarding the issues entrusted to him and to his power according to the rules and regulations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Taking measures to fight against alcoholism, epidemic or infectious diseases, and animal diseases</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Demolishing insecure buildings and repairing them on the expenses of their owners, according to the provisions of the law on construction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Receiving donations and funds ordered to the municipality, if they are likely to be damaged or lost and keeping them until a decision is taken with respect thereto</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Taking measures to restrain begging</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Taking the appropriate measures regarding the insane people who may threaten ethics or people’s safety and goods</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Taking all the appropriate measures to prevent or avoid any accidents that might result from the escape of wild or dangerous animals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Ensuring the distribution of the necessary donations to help the victims of epidemics and disasters such as fires, floods, epidemic or infectious diseases, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Maintaining public health, safety and security, provided that this does not interfere with the powers granted by the rules and regulations to the State security departments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Organizing and facilitating traffic and circulation in the public streets, squares and roads as well as ensuring cleaning, lighting and litter and debris removal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Avoiding or preventing anything that might trouble public health, safety and security</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Transporting the dead, organizing funeral and burial ceremonies, digging graves and maintaining the good order and inviolability of the cemeteries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Protecting individual and public health such as ensuring the health control of the meeting places, the hotels, the inns, the brothels, the coffee shops, the restaurants, the bakeries, the slaughterhouses, the groceries, the barbershops, etc., and in general, all the places in which food or beverages are manufactured and sold, and all the persons related in any kind to these shops</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Taking preventive measures against fires, explosions, and floods such as organizing the fire extinguishing department, controlling the places where flammable and explosive materials as well as fuel are stored, fixing the quantity of such materials that it is allowed to be stored in these places and ordering to take the necessary preventive measures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>Imposing the necessary measures regarding the cleaning, the comfort, the safety and the security of public transportation means</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>Ensuring ethics and public decency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>Taking the appropriate measures to ensure the purity and safety of the food materials to be sold</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>Taking all the required measures to ensure the accuracy of quantities, volumes and measurements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>Protecting all that relates to the environment, landscapes and monuments, maintaining trees and forested areas as well as preventing pollution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>Granting construction permits, housing permits, certificates of completion for the routing of water, electricity and telephone, after the approval of the competent technical departments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>Applying the provisions of the law to settle the violations against building regulations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>Suspending the construction, upon the request of the prejudiced people, in return for a guarantee to be estimated by the President of the Municipality for a maximum period of fifteen days in order to enable the prejudiced people to review the competent Courts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>Authorizing the excavation of public streets in order to lay water, electricity, telephone and wastewater pipes and others, in return for a guarantee for the return of the premises to their previous state, on the expenses of the license applicant; the public institutions, the independent services and the State administrations are not being excluded from the said authorization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>Authorizing for extending sewer within the municipal area, after having collected the fees related thereto, even if the project has been carried out by the Council of the Union or any other entity and it crosses in several municipalities areas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>Controlling the selling and pricing of food products, provided that it shall not be in contradiction with the measures and decisions issued by the Ministry of Economy and Trade</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 36 | Appointing municipal civil servants in accordance with the regulations of the municipality and its cadres, ending their service, appointing daily workers within the limit of the amounts allocated to
them in the budget. However, shall not be employed in the same municipality a father and one of his children, a mother and one of her children, a husband and his wife or the wife of his son and brothers and sisters. If any of the above-mentioned cases is applied, the President of the Municipality has the right to dismiss one of the two civil servants, by virtue of an administrative decision enforceable of itself, provided that the latter receives his compensation according to the provisions of the law on employees.

37- Authorizing advertisements
38- Ensuring security through the municipal police in its capacity as Judicial Police. He shall ask for the support of the Internal Security Forces in the event of any crime or any disturbance of the public security and proceed with the required investigations
39- Taking the appropriate administrative and regulatory measures in order to maintain the smooth progress of the municipal work and to ensure municipal revenues, according to the provisions of the law on municipal taxes
40- Carrying out some tasks and urgent procedures related to public health and safety, transportation means, vehicles, protocols and receptions, provided that they may be subject thereafter to the approval of the Municipal Council.

11. The Taef Accord, which put an end to the country’s 15 years civil war, stipulated the need to adopt administrative decentralization. Its key provisions are outlined below in Box 3. However, the agreement did not outline any implementation mechanisms or the timeline for such a process. As a result, clear provisions for administrative decentralization have not yet been adopted by law.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Box 3 - Taef Accord 1989 on Administrative Decentralization</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. The State of Lebanon shall be a single and united state with a strong central authority.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The powers of the governors and district administrative officers shall be expanded and all state administrations shall be represented in the administrative provinces at the highest level possible so as to facilitate serving the citizens and meeting their needs locally.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The administrative division shall be recognized in a manner that emphasizes national fusion within the framework of preserving common coexistence and unity of the soil, people, and institutions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Expanded administrative decentralization shall be adopted at the level of the smaller administrative units [district and smaller units] through the election of a council, headed by the district officer, in every district, to ensure local participation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. A comprehensive and unified development plan capable of developing the provinces economically and socially shall be adopted and the resources of the municipalities, unified municipalities, and municipal unions shall be reinforced with the necessary financial resources.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


12. The current political system does not allow Municipal Councils to enjoy administrative and financial independence although it is guaranteed by law. In fact, the Lebanese system is heavily centralized with the key ministries and public administrations located in Beirut playing a major role in service delivery. In practice Municipalities are dependent on the central government and operate under the administrative control of central government represented by a large number of state institutions such as the Ministry of Interior and Municipalities, the Governor (Mohafez), and the District Commissioner (Kaemakam).

---

13. In practice, Lebanon’s system of municipalities is woefully crippled with weak administrative powers and excessive dependence on central government funding. Municipalities cannot effectively respond to peoples’ needs due to lack of resources and lack of authority. The most important decisions of municipalities must be approved by representatives of the central government. In addition, municipalities are subject to the control of the Civil Service Board, responsible for public servants employment. Municipalities are also subject to financial control by the Court of Account and the General Controller, to ensure compliance with the Public Accounting law. The Court of Accounts audits projects and contracts at the pre and post implementation phases. It verifies the validity of financial transactions and their compatibility with the annual budget. These conditions delay the decision-making process of Municipal Councils, even though councils can turn to article 63 of the municipalities’ decree law, which states that council decisions can be considered approved if the administration of tutelage in question does not give its opinion within one month after notification.

14. Recently, the debate on decentralization has been revived and enriched with some advocacy programs conducted by political parties and civil society groups. It is broadly accepted that decentralization is an important feature of good governance and that if such a system is put in place, municipalities will be core actors. The Ministry of Interior and Municipalities is currently finalizing a decentralization reform plan with the support of the Lebanese government that aims to submit a draft law on decentralization for ratification by the Lebanese Parliament.

Electoral democracy challenges

15. Lebanon is a parliamentary democratic republic with a multi-confessional and pluralistic society. According to the constitution, parliamentary elections are held every four years, during which 128 Members of Parliament are elected, with an equal representation of Christians and Muslims. Articles 16 and 17 of the municipal code refer to the parliamentary electoral law that also applies to municipal elections in conformity with all the provisions of this law and states that the Municipal Councils shall adopt the same voter’s roll as the Parliamentary elections law.

16. Lebanon’s current plurality system of “winner take all”, as outlined in electoral Law No.25/2008, is considered unfair by almost all political parties in Lebanon who are now seeking to adopt a new electoral law based on proportionality prior to the upcoming parliamentary elections. The proposed system of proportional representation would aim to ensure that the outcome of the election reflects the proportion of support gained by each competing group. It contrasts with the current plurality system, whereby whichever party or

---

7 The National Integrity System study, Lebanon 2011, The Lebanese Transparency Association (LTA), 2011, P. 116
8 Meeting outcomes with stakeholders
12 The Parliamentary elections that was due on June 16, 2013 was postponed till November 2014 following the ratification of the law No. 246 dated 31/05/2013 during a General Assembly session.
candidate obtains a majority of votes within any given constituency wins that contest outright\textsuperscript{13}. The current electoral system represents an obstacle to democracy at the municipal level, since it limits the ability of major groups to be represented in the Municipal Council, even if they receive a substantial proportion of votes.\textsuperscript{14}

17. Another particular problem is the fact that according to article 13 of the Municipal code of 1977, only registered citizens are allowed to vote in municipal elections. This means that significant numbers of urban residents, who hail from other localities and who therefore are not registered locally, are unable to participate in local elections and, as a result, have no means to sanction local municipal councilors or to hold the municipality accountable for its decisions and actions.

\textit{Municipal financing}

18. Municipal revenues are broadly considered to be insufficient and greatly constrain the ability of municipalities to offer services and conduct local development projects.\textsuperscript{15} The two core sources of municipal revenues are (i) transfers from central government which are distributed through the Independent Municipal Fund and represent about 70% of the Municipal budget and, (ii) local taxes and fees represent the remaining 30% of the municipal budget.\textsuperscript{16}

19. Independent Municipal Fund allocations are based on (i) the number of registered voters in the municipality (not the number of actual residents) and (ii) the total amount of revenues collected in the previous two years. According to Decree No. 1917 issued in April 1979 on the distribution of the Independent Municipal Fund revenues, not more than 30% will be used on development projects, and that the remaining 70% will cover salaries and administrative costs.

20. This formula is considered inequitable as it fails to take into account the size of individual municipalities and makes it difficult for smaller municipalities to provide an acceptable level of service. It is felt that the current parameters have consequently benefited larger, wealthier municipalities at the expense of smaller, poorer ones\textsuperscript{17}. They also fail to provide incentives for higher local tax collection.

21. A further serious problem with the Independent Municipal Fund is that payments are irregular, with payments sometime being delayed by up to two years. This deprives municipalities of the timely and predictable funding needed for the efficient delivery of services and payments of public servants salaries and contractors’ fees\textsuperscript{18}.

\textsuperscript{13}“Electoral reform voting systems”, cited at: http://www.politics.co.uk/reference/electoral-reform-and-voting-systems
\textsuperscript{14}For example, although the list of candidates backed by Mr. Osama Saad, the Leader of Popular Nasserist Organization secured 9381 votes in the 2010 municipal elections in Saida (compared to 18,449 votes for the winning list of candidates headed by Mr. Mohammed al Seoudi and backed by Future Movement and Muslim Brotherhood), based on the current system the opposition list has no representation on the Municipal Council
\textsuperscript{15}Meeting outcomes with stakeholders,
\textsuperscript{16}Meeting outcomes with stakeholders,
\textsuperscript{18}Meeting outcomes with stakeholders.
22. **Municipalities have also a very low autonomous spending ceiling.** Municipal Councils cannot approve spending on materials or works that exceed LBP 3 million (USD 2000) and they are prohibited from initiating any project that costs more than LBP 20 million (USD 13,372). This expenditure ceiling is set by the central government and is intended to protect against corruption at the local level. This reflects an underlying fear that Mayors use public money to finance personal or partisan interests. There is a concern that “local leaders can take advantage of decentralization to increase their grip on the local community and draw profits of the various flows of expenditure agreed at the local level without central control”. 19

B. **Saida municipality**

23. Saida is the third largest city in Lebanon. It has been always on the crux of current issues, due to several key factors including: its **geography and demographics, the presence of the Ain el Helweh refugee camp, and political dynamics.**

*Geography and demographics of Saida*

24. **Saida is often called the gateway to the south.** It is the principal city of Saida district, composed of 53 villages. Saida city area is around 7 km2 and is located 45 km south of Beirut, and a 30 min drive from the Beirut international airport. The city proper (by official delimitation) is rather small; therefore, most of its inhabitants live in the surrounding villages, which have slowly become part of the urban spread.

25. **The city enjoys an excellent reputation as the educational and medical capital of the south.** It is also home to the third largest maritime port in Lebanon, and to a large metropolitan area, with a diverse economy and bustling commercial life, represented by the food manufacturing industry, furniture production, the construction sector, the tourism sector and agriculture, in addition to the health and education. There are around 3000 small and medium enterprises operating in the old souks and the downtown of the city.

26. **There are approximately 125,000 resident living in Saida city**20, out of which 52,031 are registered voters divided as follows: Sunnis (43,500), Shiites (4,700) and Christians (3,073).21 The employment to population of Saida ratio is 38 % occupying the following key sectors: trade, industry, agriculture, education, health, fishing, services and tourism.

27. **Saida is in the center of a very diversified political, geographical, and commercial area.** Saida is a multi confessional city, with the Sunni community playing the major and essential role in decision-making processes. Saida is home to the largest Sunni community, in a Shiite dominated south. Additionally, there are several small Christian villages in the hills and mountains east of Saida Meanwhile, the Mount Lebanon geographical area, home to the majority of the Druze population borders the northern side of Saida. Christians in Saida enjoy a peaceful co-existence with Muslims without any discrimination. 22Recently, however,

---

20 Meeting outcomes with stakeholders.
22 Meeting outcomes with stakeholders.
tensions between Sunnis and Shiites are rising in Saida as a result of broader political divisions and tensions in the country.  

Ain El Helweh refugee camp

28. **Ain El Helweh Camp is the largest Palestinian camp in Lebanon and home to more than 47,500 Palestinian refugees.** It is located just south of the city, less than 5 min from its city center. The camp is not controlled by the Lebanese government, even though it is surrounded by a sizeable army force, and is home to several radical groups. In recent years, there have been several flare-ups of violence and scuffles, both internally (among Palestinian residents) and externally with the surrounding populations. The camp does not fall under the administrative or financial responsibility of Saida municipality nor the Lebanese state, and the municipality does not provide any official assistance to the citizens living inside. It is the UNRWA who has the responsibility for providing services in the Palestinian refugee camps and for administering its installations.

Political dynamics

29. **Saida city is politically divided between two factions - the Future Movement and the Popular Nasserist Organization.** The current Municipal Council, backed by the by Future Movement and the Muslim Brotherhood, won the 2010 municipal elections against a list backed by the Popular Nasserist Organization. Following the elections, Mr. Saad decided to boycott activities undertaken by the Future Movement, and there has been no formal cooperation between the groups since 2010.

30. **In addition to the two main political parties, the Future Movement and the Popular Nasserist Organization, there are also in Saida prominent figures and families, who have traditionally played a key role in governance at both the local and national level.** These include:

- Her Excellency MP Bahiya Hariri, member of the Future Movement Parliamentary bloc and sister of the late Prime Minister Rafic Hariri (assassinated in 2005).
- His Excellency Fouad Siniora, Head of the Future Movement Parliamentary bloc, and founding member of the Future Movement Party.
- Osama Saad, former MP (2005 to 2009) and leader of Popular Nasserist Organization.
- Mr. Abed Ramhman Bizri, former Mayor of Saida (from 2004 to 2010).
- The Muslim brotherhood organization.

31. **There are significant challenges facing democracy in Saida, with regard to relations and the struggle to share power between the residents, citizens and the Municipal Council.** A particular problem, as outlined above, is that according to law only registered citizens are allowed to vote. In a city like Saida, this means that a large number of city residents, who hail from other localities and who therefore are not registered in Saida, are unable to participate in the election of the Municipal Council. As a result, a significant number of tax-payers who benefit from services provided by the municipality, cannot participate in elections, nor seek

---

25Meeting outcomes with stakeholders.
26Saida citizens are approximately 80000, out of which 25% are living outside the city according to a study developed in 2005, and titled “Economic Basis of Saida”, cited at: http://www.localiban.org/spip.php?article580
accountability from local councilors. Interviewees also pointed out that many Saida voters, who live outside the city, cast their vote based on the party affiliation or family ties, rather than on the basis of the achievements of the Municipal Council, the services provided or the reform projects being implemented, all of which do not directly impact them.

32. Local stakeholders indicated that the dynamics of partisan politics sometimes obstruct accountable governance in Saida. One example cited during interviews is the now defunct Saida Stadium that was built prior to the Asian Football Confederation's cup of 2000, on the expanded grounds of the old Saida Municipal Stadium on the main northern entrance of the city by the sea. Some council members opposed building the stadium at this location and expressed concerns about the high cost of land and maintenance. Because they were considered members of the “opposition”, however, their proposals about building the stadium inside the city on cheaper land were not taken into consideration; on the contrary they were criticized and accused of being opposed to the development of the city.

Municipal structures

33. Saida municipality is composed of two main parts:

- The elected body is referred to as Saida Municipal Council. It is composed of 21 members, of which three are women. Municipal Council members were elected in 2010 for a 6 year term. The current Council is headed by the Mayor, Mr. Mohammed Seoudi, who is independent but has the backing of the Future Movement political party and the Muslim Brotherhood
- The administrative body is composed of four main departments (Administrative and Financial, Engineering, Health and, Environment), each of which is divided into units. The municipality employs a total of approximately 200 employees, including the local security forces and civil defense. Saida City Municipality also has a public library (located in City Hall but funded through charitable donations and run entirely by volunteers), in addition to an information and technology (IT) unit and a complaints unit.

34. The Municipal council has established 16 committees on major issues of concern to the municipality, as listed below. These committees are composed exclusively of elected council members, with the exception of two committees whose representation was recently expanded following a decision of the municipal council to include local citizens in order to promote interaction between both main political parties.

- The Bidding committee
- The Purchase committee
- The Receiving committee
- The Administrative committee
- The Financial committee
- The Legal committee
- The Planning and works committee
- The Environmental Health committee

---

27 Meeting outcomes with stakeholders.
28 Meeting outcomes with stakeholders.
29 “Saida Municipality official website”; http://www.saida.gov.lb/Municipal_Council
30 Meeting outcomes with stakeholders.
• The committee of Educational and Cultural affairs (expanded to include two citizens)
• The committee on Social, Sports and Youth affairs
• The Committee on Inaugural Ceremonies
• The Media committee
• The committee of Old Saida
• The Commercial and Old Market committee (expanded to include one citizen)
• The Ain el Helwe Camp committee
• The Emergency committee

35. Municipal Council members are not the only elected officials in Saida. There are also 23 public notaries (Mokhtar) who are also elected on Municipal Council election days. These Mokhtars are distributed among Saida’s three main areas (of Dekerman, Wastani and Old Saida), divided into 15 neighborhoods (13 for Old City and one each for Dekerman and Wastani). The Mokhtar enjoys a wide range of competencies covering the following areas: public administration and general security; personal status; financial affairs; judicial affairs; real estate affairs; agricultural affairs; health affairs, and; fine arts.31

36. The Mokhtar who communicates directly with citizens and seeks information from them has a potentially important role to play in social accountability development in Saida.32 The Mokhtar, who represents the central government and has a permanent office, is dedicated to receive citizens in order to assist them by executing basic administrative transactions and solving any problem or complaint that falls under his authority. For instance, the Mokhtar, issues birth certificates, passport documents, marriage and divorce certificates, and informs local authorities about community-level security issues public health concerns, traffic problems, cutting of trees, etc.33 Many citizens, who fail to reach the municipality, rely on the Mokhtar to deliver their message or complaint. In particular, it is older and poorer people or those lacking communication channels with the municipality who rely upon the assistance of the Mokhtar. Those citizens believe that the Mokhtar is their direct link with the municipality and his job is to facilitate the interaction. In some cases, the Mokhtar will accompany citizens to the municipality to assist them in submitting a complaint or request and help with any necessary follow-up.

Municipal budget

37. In accordance with Decree Law No. 118, the municipality is responsible for developing its own budgets (i.e. all estimated revenues and proposed expenditures) on a yearly basis. The Mayor submits the budget proposal, developed by the departments of the municipality, to the Municipal Council to vote on before the end of November of each year. According to the Municipal Decree Law, the budget must subsequently be approved by the Minister of Interior and Municipalities as the administrative authority.

38. Sources of municipal revenues include:
• Fees collected by the State, the independent services or the public institutions on behalf of the municipalities and distributed directly to each municipality (through the Independent Municipal Fund)
• Fees collected directly from tax payers
• Financial aids and loans

31 The Law on public Notary, issued on November 1947 and modified according to law, No. 665, issued on 29/12/1991
32 Meeting outcomes with stakeholders.
33 Meeting outcomes with stakeholders.
- Revenues of municipal properties, including the total revenues of public domains related to the municipality
- Fines
- Donations and wills

39. **The current (2012) total budget of the city of Saida is approximately 6 Billion LBP (or USD 4 million),** of which Saida receives approximately 5 Billion LBP annually from the Independent Municipal Fund. In 2012, the municipal tax income decreased compared to the previous year. Saida Municipality collected only 40% of total expected tax revenues due to economic hurdles. In previous years, the rate of collection has been higher.

40. **Development projects do not fall under the authority of the municipality.** In Saida, there are currently 47 development projects, totaling more than 500 million USD that are funded by external donors. The municipality has little decision-making control over these projects. Typically the municipality is consulted in the early stages of the project. It is also intended to provide oversight during the implementation phase.\(^3^4\) This is difficult however due to its limited capacity and the fact that the projects allocate no budget to the municipality for purposes of monitoring or oversight. Most of these projects are decided at the national level not the municipal one and cover sectors such as: providing equipment for Saida health care, building the Lebanese Turkish Hospital, the rehabilitation of Saida waterfront, the rehabilitation of St Louis castle, building of new library, hotel and public garden in Saida, as well as several infrastructure projects. The municipality has more responsibility in the case of small sanitation projects and the installation of water pipelines.\(^3^5\)

41. **The limited financial and administrative resources, pushed citizens to rate the performance of Saida city as poor** based on the results of the survey conducted in March 2013 as follows:

![Graph 1 – Rating of Saida local government performance](image)

---

\(^{3^4}\) Meeting outcomes with stakeholders.

\(^{3^5}\) Meeting outcomes with stakeholders.
III. STAKEHOLDER MAPPING

Saida Municipal Council

42. With the election of the new Municipal Council in 2010, composed of several young and dynamic figures, hopes are high to find new ways to implement social accountability in Saida. Elected council members do not belong to any political party and are considered independent. However, their electoral list was backed by the Future Movement party and the Muslim brotherhood and was opposed to the list backed by the former MP Osama Sadd. Currently, the Future Movement and the Muslim brotherhood are the most influential players in Saida as they occupy most of the Municipal Council seats. The Bizri family also has representatives at the Municipal Council as one of the biggest families of Saida.

Political parties

43. All political parties and figures, including Mr. Osama Saad, have expressed a willingness to put their differences aside, in order to work together for the development of the city and for the introduction of the new principle that consists of institutionalizing relations between local government and citizens. Political parties such as the Future Movement, seek to support and complement the role of the municipality, and Mr. Nasser Hammoud, Future Movement Party Coordinator for the South of Lebanon holds sporadic, informal visits with the Mayor of Saida Mr. el Seoudi. Political parties play a guiding role, criticize and draw the attention of the municipality to specific needs.

Civil society organizations

44. There are in Saida currently more than 73 civil society organizations organized into a platform known as the “NGOs Platform of Saida”, headed by Mr. Majed Hamto. Box 4 contains a list of 52 of the principal civil society organizations in Saida.

45. The majority of civil society groups in Saida focus on responding to the basic needs of citizens, for example by:

- Providing assistance for poor families;
- Dealing with proliferation of drugs, high rates of unemployment and the educational problem;
- Providing health services, and;
- Trying to solve security and violence problems by taking the initiative of meeting with the main policy makers to explain the negative impact of Sheik Assir movement on the city.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Box 4 – List of Saida Civil Society Organizations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Secours Populaire Libanais</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Al Razi Dispensary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Lebanese Association For the Handicapped and Sick– Happy Home</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

36 For more information about the Municipal council members, please visit the following link: http://www.saida.gov.lb/Municipal_Council_Members
37 Meeting outcomes with stakeholders.
38 Meeting outcomes with stakeholders.
39 Meeting outcomes with stakeholders.
40 Meeting outcomes with stakeholders.
4. MECC Literacy Program
5. Centre du Ministère des Affaires Sociales - Lebaa
6. Popular Association for Relief & Development
7. Lebanese Diabetic Association
8. Mostafa Saad Foundation
9. Foyer de la Providence
10. Al Isaaf Al Chaabi
11. Association Maarouf Saad Culturelle et Sociale
12. Development For People and Nature Association
13. Association Tadamoun wa Tamnia
14. Mouvement Social Libanais
15. The Ghassan Kanafani Cultural Foundation
16. Al Nida’a Al Insani Association
17. Centre du Ministère des Affaires Sociales-Haret Saïda
18. Service Social / UNRWA
19. Al Tadamun Al Chaebi Association
20. Association CARITAS
21. Association Najdeh
22. Lebanon Family Planing Association
23. Al Mouassat Association
24. Association Ahlona
25. Association A nous l’Avenir
26. Saida Eye Bank
27. Al Hussein Medical Center
28. Association Terre de l’Enfance (Ardtoufoula)
29. Association AMEL
30. Association Nabeh
31. Islamic Welfare Association
32. Beit Atfal Assoumoud
33. Norwegian Popular Aid
34. Nabila Brair Social Foundation
35. Sea Mosque Association – Dar As Salam
36. Fédération des Handicapés Libanais
37. Al Nahda Al Arabia
38. National Social Foundation
39. Saida Puplic Library For Children
40. Centre du Ministere des Affaires Sociales – Saida
41. Sidon Orphan Welfare Society
42. AVTC
43. Rahmah Center
44. Right To Play Association
45. Association Nour
46. Epilepsy
47. Sama for Development
48. Premiere Urgence
49. Danish Refugee Council
50. Shiraa – Drugs Abuse Prevention Association
51. Constructive Development Agency
52. Hariri Foundation
Source: http://tajamoh.org/?page_id=5

46. The NGO platform is equipped with a permanent office in the Saida municipality building and receives the half-time support of a designated administrative employee of the
**municipality.** The Platform office at the municipality was launched during the mandate of the previous Municipal Council headed by Mr. Bizri, and has been maintained by the current Municipal Council. The platform members meet on a monthly basis at the municipality and these meetings are usually attended by 35 or 40 association. Although the municipality does not provide financial assistance for the civil society groups, the groups do enjoy a good working relationship with the municipality they share information and data when needed upon request. Currently, three representatives of civil society groups are members of the Municipal Council; this also contributes to maintaining and strengthening good working relationships.

**Women of Saida**

47. **Women in Saida are active and currently occupy a range of high-level posts in both the public and private sector.** While their representation in positions of power remains inequitable, their representation at the public level is slightly increasing. For example, the current Municipal Council includes three women representatives (Ms. Arab Kalach, Ms. Diana Hammoud and Ms. Wafaa Chaib), up from two women in the previous Council.

48. **Her Excellency Bahiya el Hariri is a Member of Parliament and one of the most powerful policy makers in Saida,** Dr. Houwayda el Terek was appointed as the District Commissioner (Kaemakam) of Jezeine, Ms. Aya el Zein is the Director General of Urban Planning Administration of Saida, Ms. Soumaya Hneine is the Chairperson of the South educational area. At the private sector levels, several women are managers of local bank branches such as Ms. Carole el Haj, or Ms. Maysaa Yaafouri, the Manager of Saida Mall.

49. **Women also play a key role in establishing and presiding civil society organizations.** For example, the Ahlouna Association was cofounded by Ms. Arouba Khalash, Ms. Sahar Jubaili, and Ms. Ghada Sayyed to help underprivileged families and women find jobs and get a practical education. Similar to Ahlouna, Ms. Aarb Kalash (current Council Member) succeeded in establishing the Mouassat Association decades ago, also dedicated to women’s well-being. Currently, Ms. Hiyam Charif is the president of the Red Cross in Saida. Recently, in October 2012, the NGO Platform in Saida, the Forum of Palestinian Women, the Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation and the Danish Refugee Council launched the Women’s Resource Center in Saida that aims at identifying creative entry points into the job market for women at risk. The center is the first of its kind that works on offering holistic services to women including vocational training, psycho-social follow up, awareness-building programs, and life skills and employment skills development.

**Youth of Saida**

50. **The youth of Saida represent the majority of the population.** They are active but not directly involved in all activities conducted by the municipality. Youth should be involved more frequently, to help them take more responsibility for their work, and provide them with the skills and resources. The direct involvement of youth groups in the Urban Sustainable Development Project (USDS) and the Social Accountability project is considered as a positive step towards increasing the role of youth in the society.

51. Youth are also involved in the several types of committees established by political parties as follows:

---

42 Meeting outcomes with stakeholders.
44 Meeting outcomes with stakeholders.
• \textbf{18 Neighborhood committees of Future Movement party and Hariri Foundation:}\ These 18 committees are found in Saida region’s three main areas of Dekerman, Wastani and Old Saida and were initiated by her Excellency Bahiya Hariri. They conduct social works and assist citizens’ in raising their demands to the municipality. During the past few years, these committees organized awareness-raising sessions on different issues such as health and sports\textsuperscript{45}. They were also effective during the 2006 Israel-Lebanon war in informing the municipality about the needs of citizens, which in turn sought the support of the Arab League to help deliver basic services\textsuperscript{46}. They also organize annual campaigns to promote public health by spraying insecticides in the poorest areas of Saida\textsuperscript{47} and take part in the hygiene campaign launched by the Saida municipality which consists of cleaning the streets and spraying insecticides prior to the Holy month of Ramadan\textsuperscript{48}.

• \textbf{The Popular committees of the Popular Nasserist Organization:}\ These committees aim at organizing workshops to raise citizens’ awareness on several issues such as the environment, fundamental rights, and also conducting sport and scouts activities\textsuperscript{49}.

• \textbf{Youth and sports clubs:}\ Following the 2006 Israel-Lebanon war, 13 youth clubs were established for Saida city. These clubs are officially registered and cover, for example, the area of Old Saida, the Ain el Helwe camp area, Majdelioun, Abra. These clubs are different from the neighborhood committees and seek funds from the Youth and Sports Ministry and from the citizens to organize all kind of activities\textsuperscript{50}.

\textit{Local media}

\textbf{52. The weakness of the Saida Municipality media system prevents elected officials from reaching new audiences and better connects with residents of the city.} Media in Saida city does not include a local public TV, radio or newspaper. The most important media tool used by the municipality to reach citizens is the official website, currently ineffective in addition to a billboard located at a building facing the Municipality headquarters. In the absence of the official website, Saida municipality relies on Mr. Ghassan Zaatari, Journalist consultant of the municipality and owner of the website (www.sidonianews.net) in order to share information with residents by posting news and events details on his personal website.

\textbf{53. On the other hand, there are many private owned websites where useful information about Saida city and the main events and news are posted on a daily basis.} Most of these websites include a section allowing citizens to post articles and complaints in addition to investigations about the city which in return are monitored on a daily basis by Mr. Zaatari who inform the person in charge in the municipality if any. The following is the list of the most popular websites:

- www.saida.gov.lb/
- www.sidonianews.net/
- www.saidaonline.com/

\textsuperscript{46}Meeting outcomes with stakeholders.
\textsuperscript{47}http://www.saidanet.com/main.php?load=view&noid=5145
\textsuperscript{48}There are around 85 sub committees in the neighborhood in all Saida but don’t coordinate with Saida Municipality, since they don’t fall under its authority, unlike the 18 committees which falls under the authority of Saida municipality.

\textsuperscript{49}Meeting outcomes with stakeholders.
\textsuperscript{50}Meeting outcomes with stakeholders.
Private sector

54. **Private sectors actors, unions and syndicates are essential stakeholders in Saida city.** The private sector is organized in several groups, such as the Saida Traders Association, the Chamber of Commerce, Industry & Agriculture in Sidon & South Lebanon, Sidon Fishermen’s Syndicate in addition to the Union of workers and employees in Sidon and south. These groups are in direct contact with the municipality. They participate in the different workshops organized by the municipality and, on several occasions, have held common press conferences with the Mayor of Saida to raise concerns over issues such as security instability and its impact on the economy of the city.

IV. ASSESSMENT OF SOCIAL ACCOUNTABILITY IN SAIDA

55. This section of the report (i) **shares the findings of the survey on social accountability in Saida** and (ii) **assesses the current state and potential of ten key aspects of social accountability.**

A. **Findings of a survey on social accountability in Saida**

56. As mentioned above, **the research consultants conducted a public opinion survey, in which 88 respondents participated.** As shown below, respondents represented a mix of government actors, civil society representatives, private sector actors and ordinary citizens. 52% of respondents were women and 37% were under the age of 30.

**Graph 2 – Categories of survey respondents**
Assessment of the importance of social accountability-related activities

57. Social accountability is a new topic in Lebanon and in Saida. Research found that neither local officials nor citizens were familiar with the concept or practice of social accountability. As a result, the initial reaction of many stakeholders was that social accountability would be difficult to implement in Saida/Lebanon and that it is not the a top priority since residents are struggling with financial hurdles and lack of security unrest due to current political tensions. However, after learning more about the meaning of social accountability and its practical applications (through discussions with the research consultants, the survey and participatory workshops) many local stakeholders expressed the view that such reforms and practices are in fact very important for the city, that action is possible and that enhanced social accountability could bring real benefits to the citizens of Saida.

58. It is noteworthy that when asked to assess the importance of a range of social accountability activities, respondents rated all ten activities as “Very important” or “Important” (no activities were rated as “Not so important” or “Not at all important”. The ten areas, in order of the importance attributed to them by survey respondents, are as follows:
Assessed as “Very important”
1. Communication/sharing information with citizens
2. Educating citizens about civic rights and responsibilities
3. Complaints handling
4. Supporting citizen participation in oversight/anti-corruption measures
5. Government responsiveness and accountability to citizens
Assessed as “Important”
6. Citizen participation in M&E of public services
7. Financial transparency
8. Citizen participation in planning
9. Citizen-state dialogue
10. Citizen participation in budgeting

There were no significant gender or age differentials in results. Interestingly, there was also no significant differential in the responses of public servants and elected officials who identified the same top five priorities (though not necessarily in the same order).

Performance of the municipality in ten social accountability-related activities

26
The survey also asked respondents to rate the current performance of the municipality with regard to each of the ten social accountability activity areas. **On average, the performance of the municipality was considered as “Poor” or “Very Poor” in all ten social accountability areas.** As illustrated below, however, some areas rated better than others. It is notable that those areas that received the lowest ratings of all were: “Financial transparency”, “Supporting citizen participation in processes of budgeting” and, “Supporting citizen participation in oversight/anti-corruption measures”.

60. **The ten areas in order of performance from best to worst are as follows:**

*Assessed as “Poor”*

1. Complaints handling
2. Communication/sharing information with citizens
3. Citizen participation in planning
4. Citizen-state dialogue
5. Government responsiveness and accountability to citizens
6. Citizen participation in M&E of public services
7. Educating citizens about civic rights and responsibilities

*Assessed as “Very poor”*

8. Supporting citizen participation in oversight/anti-corruption measures
9. Citizen participation in budgeting
10. Financial transparency

Again, there was no significant gender or age differential in results. On average, public servants and elected officials rated no areas as “Very Poor”. They rated “Complaints handling” as “Good” and all other areas as “Poor”.

**Factors influencing social accountability**

61. **Among the various factors influencing social accountability listed in the questionnaire, none received the highest rating of “Very strong” or the lowest rating of “Non-existent”. The highest ratings (all of which are rated as “OK”) were attributed to:**

1. Ability of women to participate in public life;
2. Ability of youth to participate in public life;
3. Operational capacity of CSOs;
4. Role of independent media in promoting democracy and accountability, and;
5. Ability of citizens to publicly express their concerns.

Women, youth, and the combined category of elected officials and public servants all chose these same five factors as strongest. For youth, however, the top rating went to “Ability of youth to participate in public life”.

62. **The lowest ratings, all of which are rated as “Limited”, went to (starting with the lowest rating):**

1. Ability of citizens to hold government accountable;
2. Availability of funding/support for social accountability practices;
3. Existence of an enabling legal and regulatory framework;
4. Ability of citizens to influence public decision-making, and;
All sub-groups (women, youth and public servants) gave lowest ratings to the same five factors with one exception. Interestingly, public servants/elected officials (and women) include in their bottom five: “Willingness of local government authorities and service providers to listen/respond/account to citizens”.

**Principal constraints to achieving social accountability**

63. **The five most important constraints to achieving social accountability identified by survey respondents (in order of importance) were:**

1. Public sector corruption;
2. Lack of knowledge on the part of citizens about how the government spends citizens’ taxes, fees and utility charges;
3. Lack of knowledge of social accountability practices and tools;
4. Lack of established mechanisms for citizen-state engagement, and;
5. Lack of political will to listen and account to citizens.

64. **For all sub-groups, public sector corruption is considered, by far, to be the principal constraint to achieving social accountability.** It was selected as a principal constraint by 79% of all respondents, 75% of women, 73% of youth and, interestingly an even higher percentage (82%) of elected officials/public servants. In comparison, the constraint that is considered to be second most important (i.e. “Lack of knowledge on the part of citizens about how the government spends citizens’ taxes, fees and utility charges”) was selected as a principal constraint by only 40%, or half as many, respondents. In interviews and workshops, stakeholders generally expressed confidence in the integrity of the municipality and the Municipal Council. The problem of corruption identified here appears to be linked to a perception of wide-spread corruption throughout the public sector more generally, especially at national level where most power and resources are found. The distrust that this engenders and the negative impact it has on citizen-state relations were underlined by stakeholders.

**Fundamental principles of social accountability**

65. **The survey sought to assess the extent to which citizens of Saida agree or disagree with some of the key underlying principles of social accountability.** On average, as shown below, all groups of respondents stated that they personally agree “Entirely” with the four principles of social accountability listed in the questionnaire. As shown in column 2, they also judge that the general public agrees “Entirely” with three of the principles and “Mostly” with the principal that “Good governance cannot be achieved without the active involvement of citizens”. As indicated in column 3, survey respondents judged that local authorities agree only “Somewhat” or “Not at all” with each of the four principles. As shown in column 4, respondents indicate that, in practice, the first principle (“Good governance cannot be achieved without the active involvement of citizens”) is applied “Somewhat” in practice, while the other three principles are applied “Very little or not at all”.

---

51Interestingly, public servant respondents were of the opinion that the general public agrees “Entirely” with this principle.
52Interestingly, public servants concurred with this assessment and (along with women and youth) were slightly more negative in their assessment, judging that local government authorities agree only “Somewhat” or “Not at all” with each of the four principles. As shown in column 4, respondents indicate that, in practice, the first principle (“Citizens have the right to be informed about public finances”) is applied “Somewhat” in practice, while the other three principles are applied “Very little or not at all”.
53Public servants/elected officials were slightly more positive in their assessment, judging that principles, with the exception of “Citizens have the right to be informed about public finances” are applied “Somewhat” in practice.
**Graph 3 – Principles of social accountability**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Principles of social accountability</th>
<th>To what extent do you agree with this principle? Please give a score of 1 to 4.</th>
<th>To what extent does the public at large agree with this principle? Please give a score of 1 to 4.</th>
<th>To what extent do local government authorities agree with this principle? Please give a score of 1 to 4.</th>
<th>To what extent is this principle currently applied in practice? Please give a score of 1 to 4.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Good governance cannot be achieved without the active involvement of citizens.</td>
<td>Entirely</td>
<td>Mostly (“Entirely” according to public servants)</td>
<td>Somewhat</td>
<td>Somewhat (“Very little or not at all” according to women)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. It is the obligation of government authorities to answer to and account to citizens.</td>
<td>Entirely</td>
<td>Mostly</td>
<td>Somewhat</td>
<td>Very little or not at all (“Somewhat” according to public servants/elected officials)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Citizens have the right to be informed about public finances.</td>
<td>Entirely</td>
<td>Mostly</td>
<td>Somewhat (“Very little or not at all” according to women, youth and public servants/elected officials)</td>
<td>Very little or not at all</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Government authorities should provide public services in a transparent and objective manner to citizens.</td>
<td>Entirely</td>
<td>Entirely (“Mostly” according to women and youth)</td>
<td>Somewhat</td>
<td>Very little or not at all (“Somewhat” according to public servants/elected officials)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

66. **Several conclusions can be drawn from the survey findings.** First, on average, all categories of local stakeholders surveyed consider social accountability to be important or very important and personally agree with fundamental principles of social accountability (such as the importance of active citizenship, the obligation of public officials to account to the people, the right of citizens to access public financial information and the fact that public services should be delivered in a transparent and objective manner). Second, all categories of stakeholders (including public servants and public officials) acknowledge that the current performance of the municipality (and the Lebanese public sector more generally) with regard to social accountability is poor or very poor. Third, the perception of widespread corruption within the public sector is considered a key constraint to social accountability. (At the same time, it is a principal reason for seeking to promote greater social accountability). Fourth, information-sharing and civic education are considered top priorities in moving towards social accountability. Lastly, the existence of strong and well-organized civil society organizations in Saida as well as the dynamic nature of women and youth in Saida are considered key strengths to be drawn upon in order to promote social accountability.

b. **Assessment of ten key aspects of social accountability in Saida**
67. **This section of the report offers a more detailed assessment of the current practices and lessons regarding ten different key aspects of social accountability. In the order of importance they were attributed by local stakeholders, these include:** (i) information-sharing, (ii) civic education; (iii) complaints handling, (iv) citizen participation in oversight/anti-corruption measures, (v) government responsiveness and accountability to citizens, (vi) citizen participation in the monitoring and evaluation of public services, (vii) financial transparency, (viii) citizen participation in planning, (ix) citizen-state dialogue, and (x) citizen participation in budgeting.

**Information-sharing**

68. **There is no culture of information sharing among the central government, local governments (municipalities) and citizens due to the absence of access to information law in Lebanon.** In 2008, a group of parliamentarians and civil society activists established the “National Network of the Right to Access Information” and succeed in developing a draft law that was submitted to the parliament for approval. After 3 years, and in September 2012, the parliamentary committee of administration and justice reviewed the draft law and approved it. Until nowadays, the draft law is yet to be adopted by the parliament; as a result, Lebanon still suffers from the absence of an Access to Information Law.

69. **Saida Municipality relies on traditional media and social media tools to share information with citizens.** Announcements are posted at the entrance of the Municipality building and meetings with citizens are sporadically organized. The Municipality has exerted efforts to expand its use of social media by developing a website to publish information about its activities and projects, and by opening a Facebook page and a Twitter account. However the contract of the technician responsible of updating the website, the Facebook page and Twitter was not renewed and, as a result, these tools are not being actively used and have not been updated since the beginning of this year. Saida Municipality is planning to revamp its official website which currently contains minimal information, by adding new sections and improving the English one. The Municipal Council also recently hired a social media expert to work on the website and oversee the newly updated page. In addition to this, the municipality has contracted a local journalist who covers the news and events of the municipality on a daily basis and updates his own website page with a summary of events and news.

70. **Although these tools exist, there are no proper mechanisms for systematically and broadly sharing information by Saida municipality.** The social media strategy is not developed, communication with universities and schools is limited, the municipality produces no regular newsletter and does not convene town hall meetings. The local government represented by Saida municipality, is not the citizens’ reference for different types of information. In reality, Members of Parliament, political parties and prominent families, play this role, and intervene to

---

54 For more information about the access to information in Lebanon please visit the following website www.a2ilebanon.org
55 Meeting outcomes with stakeholders.
56 Meeting outcomes with stakeholders.
57 Meeting outcomes with stakeholders.
58 Meeting outcomes with stakeholders.
59 Meeting outcomes with stakeholders.
60 Outcomes of youth workshop, organized on 22/3/2013 at the Saida Municipality building.
solve problems, inform citizens of new projects and interact directly with them. As a result, political, families, and personal relationships are often much more important than institutional ones in shaping relations between citizens and power-holders.\textsuperscript{61}

\textit{Civic education}

71. At the current time, citizens of Saida (and Lebanon more generally) are not well-educated about citizen rights and responsibilities. While the school curriculum includes civic education modules, these do not address concepts such as social accountability and to not cover issues of local-level governance. Local stakeholders, both in responding to the survey and in the context of participatory workshops, considered enhanced civic education to help citizens (and elected councilors) to better understand their rights, responsibilities and roles to be a top priority.

72. Stakeholders identified a number of current strengths that can contribute to enhanced civic education in Saida. These include: a strong education system, an acceptable level of education quality and the existence of a school-based civic education curriculum (that could be improved). The presence of strong and active civil society groups in the city was also considered a core strength and it was felt that these groups have a potentially important role to play in educating the public about civic rights and responsibilities. The municipality’s committee for Education and Cultural Affairs, as well as the website of the municipality, were also identified as existing mechanisms that could be used to contribute to enhanced civic education.

73. Stakeholders also identified several obstacles hindering the implementation of a proper civic education system. These include:
   - Current lack of understanding about civic rights and duties;
   - The absence of established systems for communication and dialogue between local authorities and residents;
   - The absence of qualified personnel responsible for civic education, and;
   - Limited citizen initiative and participation.

\textit{Complaints handling}

74. A number of local stakeholders expressed the view that a lack of human and financial resources limits the ability of the municipality to respond to their needs and complaints in an efficient manner. Interviewees also reported that, in some cases, due to political pressures, the municipality has failed to deal with citizens’ complaints -for example, in the case of a private generator installed nearby a public school in Saida which caused pollution and was an annoyance for students and teachers.\textsuperscript{62}

75. Interviewees acknowledged that a lack of understanding on the part of citizens, as to the role and competencies of the municipality and the rights and duties of citizens exacerbates the problem.\textsuperscript{63} When citizens refer to the municipality to pose a complaint, they often lack knowledge as to whether the problem they are raising actually falls under the authority of the municipality.\textsuperscript{64} Complaints that fall under the direct competencies of the municipality (for example, regarding internal roads safety, abuse of public spaces, building code violations and

\textsuperscript{61}Meeting outcomes with stakeholders.
\textsuperscript{62}Meeting outcomes with stakeholders.
\textsuperscript{63}Outcomes of women’s workshop, organized on 22/3/2013 at the Saida Municipality building.
\textsuperscript{64}Meeting outcomes with stakeholders.
sanitary problems) can be dealt with by the municipality. However, when citizens lodge complaints that fall outside these sectors, the municipality is unable to deal with complaints and must refer them to a central authority over which it has no control.

76. **Most citizens rely on their personal contacts to submit complaints to the municipality**, usually by directly calling the head of the Engineering or Sanitation Department to complain about infrastructure problems and sanitary or public health concerns. On average, 70% of complaints are submitted using personal contacts, and only 30% of complaints are received through the municipality’s hotline number or complaints unit. Although the complaints unit located at the entrance of the municipality is easily accessible to citizens its effectiveness is limited due to: a lack of human resources, equipment and appropriate procedures. For example, the complaints is open only from 8 am to 2 pm and lacks a computer. Research revealed that citizens were frequently unaware of the complaints unit or dissatisfied with results. Citizens also do not rely on the complaints section of the website, which is ineffective and has only received two complaints in five years.

77. **In addition to the complaints unit, the journalist consultant of the municipality maps on a daily basis several private websites of Saida (www.saidacity.net/, www.saidaonline.com/, www.saidagate.net/, www.saidatv.tv/, www.saidasea.com/) which provide useful information and news and also provide citizens with an independent space to express their thoughts, ideas and complaints.** On a daily basis, the consultant informs the Head of the Human Resources and Financial Department or the Head of the Engineering Department about relevant complaints. He also delivers a monthly progress report to the Municipal Council on activities and citizens’ complaints.

Citizen oversight/participation in anti-corruption measures

78. **Lebanon is perceived as one of the most corrupt countries in the world.** In the 2012 Corruption Perception Index (CPI) published by Transparency International (TI), Lebanon ranked in the 128th position out of 174 countries included in the assessment. Its score of 30/100 was significantly below the global average of 43 points. Corruption in Lebanon is endemic and the country lacks official data on the cost of corruption for the economy. According to TI’s 2010/2011 Global Corruption Barometer, Lebanese citizens believe that the corruption level increased by 82% over the previous three years. Lebanese citizens perceive the political parties, the parliament and the police are the three most corrupted institutions. Low salaries of public employees (e.g. compared to private sector wages) is considered a key factor contributing to public sector corruption in Lebanon.

79. **Corruption in Lebanon is exacerbated by an outdated legal framework and the absence of access to information and whistleblower protection laws.** This makes it very difficult to detect corruption and prevents victims or witnesses of corruption from denouncing misdeeds. Another weak point in Lebanon is the absence of an ombudsman office to deal with cases of public sector corruption and citizen complaints. Existing regulatory authorities lack financial resources and means of enforcement. Lebanon signed the United Nations Convention against Corruption (UNCAC) in 2008 but, in the absence of the political will, no concrete actions have been taken.

---

65 Meeting outcomes with stakeholders.
66 The CPI ranks countries based on how corrupt its public sector is perceived to be by experts and businesses. The index uses the data to award scores ranging from 0, perceived to be highly corrupt, to 100, perceived to be very transparent. For more information please visit: http://www.transparency.org/cpi2012/results
80. There are currently no ongoing anti-corruption activities in Saida city and no examples of citizen engagement on issues related to public sector integrity or corruption issues were identified. At Saida city level, there were no reports or evidence of corruption of public employees at the municipal level, although financial transparency is absent and citizens lack essential information on major development projects being implemented in the city. Citizens currently do not have the right to oversee public financial transactions, procurement processes or the work of local contractors.

Government responsiveness and accountability to citizens

81. While individual municipal staff and officials express a clear desire to respond to citizen’s need, the municipality currently has no formalized mechanisms in place for identifying citizens’ priorities or ensuring responsiveness to needs. Requests and demands tend are made and dealt with on a personal basis rather than through any systematic, organized or collective process. While there is currently no mechanism in place to assess the responsiveness of Saida municipality, survey respondents rated performance in this area as “poor”.

82. The concept of communicating commitments or to citizens or accounting to citizens for decision and actions of the municipality is absent in Saida city. For municipal staff, council members and citizens the notion of “downwards accountability” is very new. While the vast majority of local stakeholders agree that the municipality (and public actors more generally) should be accountable to citizens, they acknowledge that this is currently not the case. Interviewees attribute this absence of social accountability to a political culture of highly centralized, top-down decision-making and a lack of understanding of citizen rights and responsibilities. Citizens (and council members) are not familiar with their rights and duties under the Municipal code of 1977. Citizens’ capacities to monitor government actions and seek accountability are further limited by limited access to public information, the absence of clear government targets and progress reports and, a lack of knowledge of social accountability practices and tools.

Participatory monitoring and evaluation of public services

83. Research was not able to identify any examples of citizen involvement in assessing the quality or effectiveness of public services or in Saida city. Participatory assessment tools (such as the Citizen Report Cards, Community Scorecards, social audits and community-led monitoring & evaluation) are not known to citizens, CSOs or public officials. Because there is no tradition of participatory monitoring and evaluation of the public sector, it does not occur to citizens to seek to engage in such activities. Nor do public actors initiate or facilitate such practices. In the course of discussion with the research team, however, considerable interest was expressed (both on the part of citizens and local authorities) in the possibility of introducing participatory monitoring and evaluation approaches – either in the context of municipal services or essential public services such as schools and health clinics.

84. Considerable interest was also shown in the possibility of introducing participatory monitoring and evaluation of large-scale development projects. It was suggested that donors introduce the concept of social accountability into the design of these projects and that provisions be made and resources allocated for citizen-led monitoring and evaluation of project implementation and outcomes.
85. Research identified both a number of strengths and challenges regarding the introduction participatory monitoring and evaluation practices in Saida. Strengths include: openness on the part of the Municipal Council, the presence of a relatively active and well-organized civil society, the existence of bodies such as parent-teacher committees that are well-established and could potentially facilitate monitoring processes in schools for example and, growing support among international donors (who support development projects in Saida) for social accountability and participatory monitoring practices. Potential challenges include: the lack of a culture of performance monitoring and evaluation, the present lack of knowledge of participatory monitoring and evaluation methods, lack of access to information (though this could be overcome if local-level service providers are willing to provide information) and, lack of authority and resources at local level to remedy potential issues/problems identified as a result of monitoring & evaluation.

Financial transparency

86. The financial system in Lebanon provides the public with minimal information on the national government’s budget and financial activities during the course of the budget year. In 2012, Lebanon received an Open Budget Index (OBI) score of 33 out of 100, significantly below the average score of 43 for all the 100 countries surveyed. Lebanon’s score on the OBI has remained almost the same during the last three rounds of surveys. This lack of financial transparency, at all levels of government, makes it challenging for citizens to hold the government accountable for its management of the public’s money.

87. At the local level, municipalities do not publish budget information and are not required to do so by law, however citizens can visit the municipality and ask for such information when needed. According to municipal staff, citizens are aware that Saida municipality is facing delays in receiving the money generated from the Independent Municipal Fund, but still only 40% of Saida residents paid their taxes in 2012, adding to the financial shortcomings of the municipality. There is no law enforcement on collecting municipal taxes, in other words, municipalities cannot hold citizens accountable for not paying taxes.

88. In the case of the 47 development projects being implemented in (or projected for) Saida, financial information (including project budgets, bidding documents and financial agreements with donors) is published in the official gazette and, therefore, theoretically in the public domain. In practice, however, local stakeholders were neither aware of the availability of this information nor had they ever attempted to obtain it.

Participatory planning

---

67 The Open Budget Survey assesses whether the central government in each country surveyed makes eight key budget documents available to the public, as well as whether the data contained in these documents is comprehensive, timely, and useful. The Survey uses internationally accepted criteria to assess each country’s budget transparency developed by multilateral organizations, such as the International Monetary Fund (IMF), the Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD), and the International Organization of Supreme Audit Institutions (INTOSAI). The scores on 95 of the 125 Open Budget Survey questions are used to calculate objective scores and rankings of each surveyed country’s relative transparency. These composite scores constitute the Open Budget Index (OBI), the world’s only independent and comparative measure of budget transparency.

89. **Citizens’ participation in planning is becoming a new trend in Saida city.** Since the election of the new municipal council in 2010, a new system was adopted that consists of consulting with citizens prior to the implementation of vital projects at the city level. The main concern of the new municipal council is to avoid previous mistakes where implemented without any consultation with citizens. For example, references were made by several stakeholders to the Cultural Heritage and Urban Development (CHUD) project, described in Box 5.

90. **The CDR is currently implementing the final stages of the CHUD project in Saida.** At the start of this project the Saida Municipal Council (headed by Mr. el Bizri at the time) was asked by CDR to approve the initial scope of work, action plan and feasibility study. The CDR asked for the approval of the Municipal Council before starting the project, even though it is not a condition imposed by Lebanese laws. The CDR had the ability to launch the project without the Mayor’s signature, but wanted to seek approval in order to avoid clashes at a later stage. Although the Municipal Council approved the project, they did not feel that they contributed to its development and do not feel ownership of the national project.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Box 5 - Cultural Heritage and Urban Development Project</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The Cultural Heritage and Urban Development (CHUD) project aims at rehabilitating and protecting selected historical sites in five cities of Lebanon (Tyre, Tripoli, Baalbek, Byblos, and Sidon), while enhancing local economic development and quality of life in the historic city centers. The project is executed by The Council for Development and Reconstruction (CDR) and jointly financed by the World Bank, the Agence Française de Développement (AFD) and Governments of France, Italy and Lebanon. The project also targets institutional strengthening and capacity building through the organization of training workshops to ensure effective implementation of the project. The CHUD was approved in April 17, 2003 by the Lebanese Parliament with the closing date on December 31, 2015. The project cost is 61.89 million USD, with a Saida share of 9 million USD. Project themes include: Cultural heritage (40%), Municipal governance and institution building (40%) and Participation and civic engagement (20%). CHUD interventions in Old Saida have included the rehabilitation of ‘Bab Al-Saraya’ and its surroundings, the rehabilitation and renewal of old pedestrian routes within the Old City, the adaptive re-use of old historical buildings, the conservation of the terrestrial citadel and its surroundings areas, and the promotion of local food and drink industries.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

91. **Although the CHUD project included a component on “civic engagement”, local stakeholders felt that citizens were not adequately consulted during the planning process nor involved in implementation or monitoring.** There have since been complaints about the deterioration of certain historical sites. A 2010 assessment stated that sub-projects funded by the CHUD “have mostly concentrated on physical renovation rather than urban regeneration, and have had only minor impacts on the economic profile of the old city. These unbalanced interventions are negatively affecting the local people living in the core, and are leading to an isolated ghetto, and might eventually lead to an empty center”.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Box 6 - The Renovation of the Saida Downtown</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The Renovation of the Saida Downtown project is funded by the Islamic Bank. The budget of 15 million USD and was approved by the Lebanese parliament as a national project. Following the approval, shop owners were invited to a series of discussion meetings about the project in order to inform and consult</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

with them about their preferences. For instance, the shop owners preferred that the contractor execute works at night rather than in the morning to allow them to keep their businesses open. These concerns were taken into consideration and the contractor was informed about the shop owners’ demands and executed accordingly.

92. Local stakeholders expressed regret that the implementers of large-scale national projects (e.g. funded by international donors and implemented by national agencies such as the CDR) that target the geographical areas of the municipality are not required to consult with the municipality and its citizens. Currently 47 development projects, representing a budget of approximately 500 million USD or 100 times the municipal budget, are proposed or being implemented in Saida. These are funded by international donors or the central government and aim at reforming roads and urban infrastructure, building schools, hotels and public parks are. These projects are usually discussed and decided at the national level and, as a result, both citizens and municipality officials feel marginalized from planning and decision-making processes. Two partial exceptions are the Renovation of Saida City Downtown project (see Box 6) and the early stages of the Urban Sustainable Development Project (see Box 7), both of which were cited as positive examples with regard to participatory planning.

Box 7 - The Urban Sustainable Development Project (USDS)

The Urban Sustainable Development Strategy (USUDS) project is considered a success story allowing citizens to participate in the planning process of the Sustainable Development Strategy of Saida. The USDS aims to: (i) develop the descriptive memory of Saida city; (ii) conduct a diagnosis of transversal issues by examining a range of urban variables (demography, economic activities, social welfare, poverty and risk situations, institutional framework); (iii) develop a mission and vision for the city, and; identify strategic objectives for the coming ten to twenty years. Citizen participation was achieved through the establishments of:

- A consultative committee composed of around 160 persons representing various stakeholders and background.
- A steering committee composed of 12 decision-makers in Saida responsible for developing the framework of the USDS.
- Six working groups composed of around 12 to 15 participants from different background including one Municipal Council member responsible of discussing the transversal issues and other topics.
- A technical team of experts responsible of developing the USDS.

So far, the team of experts has succeeded in developing the descriptive memory of the city (covering themes of local economic development, social structures and urban governance; landscape, environment and ecology; cultural heritage, and; Saida’s urban form and urban amenities) and it has been reviewed by the steering committee.

Six transversal issues have been identified (Urban Infrastructure; Green / Open Space Networks; Cultural and Natural Heritage; Employment in Traditional Industries and Trades; Institutional and Legal Frameworks; Local Economic Development). For each issue, a working group has been formed that will meet twice per phase.

To date, the USDS project is considered a consultative project rather than participatory one. Rather than being planned and implemented in a bottom-up manner, the process remains expert-led. While the various mechanisms described above ensure some level of information-sharing and consultation, the
USDS to date has offered little opportunity for ordinary citizens to engage with or contribute to the process. In order to address this shortcoming, the USDS team is in the process of hiring a community engagement expert to develop and implement a strategy for public outreach and active citizen involvement moving forward.

93. **If the municipality were to be consulted and/or be given responsibilities for monitoring or oversight, it would need to be equipped with the necessary human and financial resources.** Like most Lebanese municipalities, Saida suffers from serious shortages in terms of financial and human resources and, at the moment does not have on staff specialists with the expertise to adequately analyze and evaluate project proposals or to monitor implementation. Although the municipality is frequently expected to ensure the maintenance of new municipal infrastructure or facilities, it lacks the resources to do so and project budgets fail to allocate funds to the municipality for purposes of maintenance (or monitoring of the implementation process).

*Citizen-state dialogue*

94. **Citizen-state dialogue is not limited to the municipality in Saida city.** Other groups such as political figures and parties, the civil society and the Mokhtar (who is an elected Public Notary and referred to as the head of a village or neighborhood) take part of the dialogue as well. These groups connect through several types of established committees and commissions to share ideas and thoughts. Citizen-state dialogue principally takes place at two levels: with MPs/political parties and at the local government level.

95. **Most citizens consider Members of Parliament as their principal reference in resolving problems or responding to concerns or complaints.** Most residents of Saida consider her Excellency MP Bahiya Hariri to be the most powerful political figure of the city. Her Excellency has successfully developed three essential tools for direct communication with citizens and other policy makers in Saida, given that providing services to the citizens is not sufficient to gain their trust as they are also in need to be directly contacted and informed about most of the issues and project directly linked with the city affairs. These include:

- The Hariri Foundation which represents one of the most dynamic civil society organizations in Saida that provide services for citizens and assistance to the municipality;
- Regular meetings with stakeholders;
- Four permanent committees:
  - The Consultative Gathering of Saida;
  - The Lebanese-Palestine Committee for Dialogue and Development in Saida;
  - The School Network of Saida and Neighborhoods (described in Box X), and;
  - The League of Doctors in Saida.

**Box 8 - Objectives of the School Network of Saida and Neighborhoods**

The network includes 112 public and private schools and aims at:

---

70 Meeting outcomes with stakeholders.
71 Meeting outcomes with stakeholders.
- Promote communication, cooperation and coordination among the schools network.
- Conduct research studies and education in schools to create an information observatory network and contribute effectively in the Lebanese educational community.
- Work on the effectiveness of the network to positively impact the decision making at the educational level in Lebanon.
- Produce common cultural, social, and scientific activities
- Strengthen dialogue, coordination and cooperation with local and international institutions through conferences and meetings at the national and international levels
- Foster cooperation with institutes and universities and exchange of information and skills.
- Activate the partnership among schools administration, teachers, parents, students, local community


96. These committees meet regularly at her Excellency Bahiya Hariri residence and discuss the city priorities, affairs and the implementation of current projects. For instance, the consultative gathering for Saida includes 32 main stakeholders such as MPs, families’ leagues, doctors, engineers, political parties, in addition to Mr. El Seoudi Mayor of Saida. These meetings are not attended by Mr. Osama Saad following his decision to boycott such gathering from the beginning. In parallel, the “National Democratic Gathering for Saida” was established prior to the 1998 municipal elections and includes most of the leftist parties in Saida and civil society groups opposed to the Future movement and its allies. The National Democratic Gathering is headed by Mr. Osama Saad and conducts several national, social and political activities and raises their voices against the municipality misconduct if any.

97. None of these gatherings mentioned can be considered as town hall meetings, since they are not open to the public. Only attendees, invited through direct contact, are able to attend, access information and participate in dialogue about various city issues and projects.

98. Another form of social accountability was introduced for the first time in Saida in 2009 in the lead up to the parliamentary elections. At this time, her Excellency MP Bahia Hariri and MP Fouad Sinora succeeded in meeting with around 30,000 residents of Saida in order to consult with them about the electoral program. The consultations resulted in the formulation of a ten-point electoral program of the Future Movement party, based on citizen priorities and featuring among others: economic development, social cohesion, urbanization and housing, health sector, the environment, women, youth and Lebanese Palestinian relations. These types of consultations can lead to enhanced social accountability, but in this case they are not organized by the municipality but by national political figures.

99. At the level of local government, the municipality is currently developing new tools in pursuit of more open and productive interactions with citizens. However, there are no

---

72 Meeting outcomes with stakeholders.
73 Meeting outcomes with stakeholders.
75 Meeting outcomes with stakeholders.
76 http://www.almustaqbal.org/admin/PDF/saniora%20and%20bahia%20hariri.pdf
77 Meeting outcomes with stakeholders.
official channels to promote citizens state dialogue as expressed by most of the interviewed stakeholders. Citizens mostly rely on personal and direct contacts with the municipality whether to deliver a message or seek information. Meetings at the municipality are not regularly open to the public, but occasionally it does host stakeholders to discuss vital issues or projects and their impact on the city. For example, meetings were organized with shop owners to consult on issues surrounding infrastructure works and upgrading of Saida downtown.78

100. In addition to these meetings, Saida Municipal Council is strengthening relationships with civil society groups through the municipal committees whose role is to facilitate citizens’ demand and cooperate with them to guarantee the success of activities. For instance, if civil society groups are organizing an event, and a public site is needed for this occasion, the committee on Social, Sports and Youth affairs, works closely with them to communicate their needs to the Municipal Council and to guarantee access to the site. In addition the municipality consults with civil society groups concerning issues like the installation of public decorations during the month of Ramadan. Citizen-state dialogue extends also to the Mokhtar who plays a key role as messenger between the poorest populations and the municipality. As described in Box 9, the opening of the fruit and vegetables market was cited as good practice in citizen-municipality dialogue by numerous stakeholders, who underlined how a process of consultation and dialogue helped resolve a dilemma (of illegal stalls and carts) that has plagued the municipality for many years.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Box 9 - Saida Fruit and Vegetable Market</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Saida municipality succeeded in moving around 100 vegetable stalls and carts from old commercial souks in downtown to the new souk in Sahel al-Sabbagh and Al-Baasiri following the council decision of 6/5/2012. The decision was taken to free the old souks and sidewalks of vegetable carts and stalls that are randomly spread across the city center. A compromise was reached between the Mayor and the delegation of vendors after months of negotiations and meetings. The majority of stalls placed illegally in front of shops in the commercial souks have been removed and police are surveying the area daily to ensure they do not resume operation. These measures have been welcomed by different groups in the city, particularly Saida Traders Association, as organizing the commercial souks benefits the economy and puts an end to the chaos of scattered stalls and carts. Mr. el Seoudi succeeded in solving this dilemma after that his predecessors failed to do so. The successful approach was to include all parties in the discussions and not to exclude anyone. A range of different stakeholders, the Governor of South Lebanon, the Mayor of Saida, the Head of Saida Traders Association and the commander of the local branch of the Internal Security Forces, were involved in resolving the issue to ensure the satisfaction of almost all parties and mainly the vendors. The decision was executed on a three-stage plan as follows:

- The first stage involved freeing the sidewalks from illegal stalls.
- The second stage is rehabilitating and organizing the old vegetable market on Fakhreddine Street in the city center, and
- The third is moving the stalls and carts spread in the commercial souks to the new vegetable market which can fit more than 100 carts or stalls.

Citizen participation in budgeting

101. Citizen participation in processes of public budgeting is not provided for by law nor applied in practice. Municipal Councils currently develop their yearly budget without consulting
citizens, nor necessarily taking into consideration their priority needs. As mentioned above, municipalities currently face deficits in their revenues and income, and rely heavily on the Independent Municipal Fund to compensate for lack of tax revenues. Because municipal revenues are so low, they focus mainly on paying salaries and wages and the scope for implementing community development projects or improving the delivery of public services is extremely limited. In the current context, opportunities for a meaningful citizen participation in budgeting is limited. As a first step, however, enhanced budget transparency would (i) help citizens to better understand the municipality’s financial constraints and (ii) potentially mobilize citizens to advocate for change.

102. **Citizens currently lack knowledge about the content of public budgets and budget processes.** Information regarding revenue collection, spending, and borrowing are found in the annual budget report. However, citizens need support to learn how to understand and analyze the municipal budget and advise on how to reallocate resources towards the real desires of the community. Citizens could also potentially be supported to advocate for: an increase in Independent Municipal Fund transfers, improvements to the functioning of the Fund, and/or a re-prioritization by the municipality of the portion of the budget allocated for development projects, away from administrative costs.

103. **Over time, participatory budgeting, or at least increased budget transparency and consultation, could enhance governance and public service delivery by:**

- Making budget information and budgeting processes more transparent and accountable to citizens;
- Helping citizens better understand the municipality’s budget constraints, potentially inciting them to pay their taxes;
- Combatting corruption and building citizen confidence and trust in public actors;
- Better aligning budget allocations with citizens’ priority needs, and;
- Improving the quality of public services and investments over time.

**IV. RECOMMENDATIONS AND CONCLUSIONS**

104. Based on survey findings, interviews and workshops outcomes, and informed by global social accountability experiences and lessons, the study team was able to formulate recommendations with regard to each of the aspects of social accountability identified above. These recommendations were presented, discussed and approved by municipal councilors at a validation workshop (conducted at Saida city hall on 23 April 2013). Recommendations targeting the Saida municipality are listed below by category in the order of importance attributed by local stakeholders who participated in the survey. These are followed by recommendations for national-level actors, aimed at creating a more enabling environment for social accountability, and finally by some messages for the World Bank.

A. **Recommendations for Saida municipality**

(i) **Information-sharing**

   a. Design and implement a communication strategy, aimed at keep citizens informed about key public issues, decisions and developments.
• Develop a strategy for communicating with citizens of Saida living abroad and inform them about development projects in an attempt to attract them for future investment opportunities.
• Develop communication strategies not only from a public relations perspective, but from an accountability perspective.

b. Publish a regular (quarterly) newsletter.
• The newsletter should be made available free of charge and distributed to citizens through CSOs, Mokhtars, mosques, schools, the public library and government offices.
• Put in place system for rapid approval by the media committee.
• Consider covering costs through advertising.
• Publish monthly updates about key decisions of the Municipal Council.

c. Convene regular (quarterly) townhall meetings.
• These meetings should be open to the general public as well as to representatives from CSOs, educational, industrial and commercial institutions.
• Ensure that the meetings are well-publicized to encourage public attendance.
• Invite local media to cover these events.

 d. Expand use of ICTs for purposes of information-sharing. In revamping the city’s Facebook page, consult with citizens (e.g. by means of a series of focus group discussion) to find out their information interests and needs.
• Use text messages to announce public events, etc.
• Given that not everyone has access to ICTs, also use public billboards to post information and communicate key public service messages.

e. Draw on the assistance of interns/volunteers. Given HR constraints, consider recruiting interns/volunteers to assist with these various communication activities.
• In particular, recruit a team of technologically-savvy young people to assist in improving the municipality’s use of social media tools such as the website, Facebook and Twitter accounts and text messaging.

(ii) Civic education
a. Clarify and build consensus around mutual roles and responsibilities.
• Through a participatory process involving citizens, CSOs, municipal staff and councilors, develop a “Municipal Charter of Rights and Responsibilities” defining and describing the respective rights and responsibilities of citizens, Municipal Council members and municipal staff.
• Publicly disseminate the Charter and organize orientation/training sessions for citizens, elected representatives and municipal employees on its content.

b. Conduct public awareness-raising activities
• These should address key topics such as: the meaning of “active citizenship”; the role of the municipality; the revenues and expenditures of the municipality; respect for public spaces and public hygiene.
• Work with a communications specialist to develop messages and outreach strategies that are tailored to different groups (e.g. women and youth).
• Organize targeted workshops on “active citizenship” for university students and youth.

c. Improve and support school-based civic education programs.

• Develop a learning module on local governance and active citizenship for use by primary school teachers.
• Advocate for amendments to the civic education module of the Lebanese school curriculum to include components on municipal governance and citizen rights and responsibilities.
• Encourage Municipal Council members to visit schools and talk to students about the role of the municipality and its citizens.

d. Engage youth outside of school.

• Launch a series of discussions between students and municipal committees.
• Introduce special events and contests to engage young people in civic/municipal affairs.
• Introduce a parallel youth municipal council.

(iii) Complaints handling

a. Establish and publicize clear processes and standards for complaints handling

• Consider introducing a “one-stop shop” at the municipality (either an actual physical office or a web or phone-based hotline) where citizens can go to get all information they need, post their complaints, access key services, etc.
• Develop and implement a media campaign to inform citizens about the existing hotline and complaints unit (or new "one-stop shop" service).
• Establish and publicly disseminate standards for complaints handling, including, for example, limits for response time and measures of redress.

b. Involve citizens/civil society in overseeing and contributing to the complaints handling process

• Establish a committee for complaints handling (made up of municipal councilors and civil society representatives). The responsibility of this committee is to oversee the complaints handling process and to ensure that complaints are communicated to relevant departments/committees and acted upon in a timely fashion.
• Benefit from existing Neighborhood Committees, Popular Committees, and Youth Committees by recruiting volunteers as two-way “infomediaries” to help share information with citizens and transmit citizens’ comments, suggestions and complaints to the municipality.

(iv) Citizen oversight/participation in anti-corruption measures

a. Develop capacities and skills for citizen oversight and anti-corruption.

• Conduct awareness-raising activities to help municipal staff and councilors understand the benefits of citizen oversight/participation in anti-corruption measures.
• Seek training/capacity development opportunities for citizens and councilors to learn about methods of social audit, procurement monitoring and other forms of citizen oversight.

b. Enhance citizen access to financial information.

• Implement financial transparency measures (described below in section vii).
- Collect information (including financial information) on all major development projects being implemented (or prepared) in Saida.
- Publicly present this information (e.g. at quarterly town hall meeting) and post it on the municipality’s website.
- Consider recruiting a university student as an intern volunteer to collect the information (from the official gazette and international donor websites and databases) and to prepare user-friendly summaries.

c. Support citizen participation in anti-corruption measures.
- Explore possibilities for citizen oversight over public procurement and the work of local contractors (e.g. require contractors to publicly report progress annually or at the end of each project phase).
- Support independent social audits of public budgets, projects and services by citizen groups/CSOs.

(v) Government responsiveness and accountability to citizens
a. Publicize annually the specific goals and commitments of the municipal government.
- Develop a vision, a statement and a mission for Saida municipality with the participation of youth and other citizens.
- Publish the electoral program on the website and produce an annual report on the execution of programs to facilitate citizen monitoring.

b. Take concrete steps to better understand citizen’s priority needs.
- Conduct a survey to learn about citizens’ views, needs, priorities and their evaluation of different public services (potentially using SMS technology).
- Support the establishment of neighborhood committees to identify and communicate local priorities and needs.
- Initiate monthly neighborhood “walk-abouts” by the mayor and/or Municipal Councilors to discuss informally with citizens about their priority needs and concerns.

c. Develop capacities, skills and resources for government responsiveness and social accountability.
- Offer training for municipal councilors to understand their role, rights and responsibilities.
- Offer training in social accountability methods and tools to municipal councilors, employees and CSOs.
- In the context of awareness-raising and training activities, emphasize the potential benefits for municipal staff and councilors of enhanced responsiveness and accountability (e.g. enhanced citizen satisfaction with muni, greater legitimacy and popularity, improved chances of re-election, increased tax revenues, etc.)

(vi) Participatory monitoring and evaluation (M&E) of public services and projects
a. Build capacities and skills for participatory monitoring and evaluation.
- Seek out and support opportunities for training in participatory monitoring and evaluation to municipal councilors, employees and CSOs.

b. Better inform citizens and CSOs about ongoing and upcoming development projects.
- Inform citizens and CSOs about future projects and share with them design documents and proposed budgets.
- Promote transparency during the implementation of development projects for the benefit of the public (e.g. through the publication of quarterly progress reports).

c. **Support citizen/CSO efforts to monitor and evaluate public services.**
- Develop service charters so that citizens are better informed about municipal services and standards, know what standard of service they can expect and able to monitor performance against established benchmarks.
- Introduce the concept of performance evaluation through the adoption of social monitoring tools (e.g. such as social audits and Community Scorecards). For example, these tools could be used to evaluate the municipality, local schools or health centers.
- Advocate for the allocation of a certain percentage of any development project budget for citizen monitoring and social accountability practices.

**(vii) Financial transparency**

a. **Facilitate citizen access to municipal financial information.**
- Publish simplified municipal budget and project budgets (e.g. in newspapers, on the city’s website and using social media communication tools).
- Publish the annual “conformity of accounts” report.
- Facilitate access to budget information upon request from the municipality.
- Organize an annual “general assembly” to directly inform citizens them about the municipal budget and to allow them to ask questions.

b. **Build “budget literacy”.**
- Undertake public education activities aimed at raising awareness of the benefits of financial transparency and participatory budgeting and building the “budget literacy” (of citizens, CSOs, municipal councilors and staff).
- Raise citizen awareness on the current budget and revenues, with a view to helping citizens understand budget constraints and to provide evidence of municipal achievements with a limited amount of money.

**(viii) Participatory planning**

a. **Sustain and deepen citizen participation in the ongoing development and implementation of urban development plans.**
- In moving forward with the USDS, introduce even more inclusive and substantive forms of citizen participation (beyond information-sharing).
- Ensure regular public reporting on progress in designing and implementing the USDS.
- Introduce mechanisms for citizen/CSO participation in the implementation and monitoring of the USDS.

b. **Institutionalize the use of participatory planning methodologies.**
- Take steps to raise citizen awareness of the importance of participatory planning.
- Create a public database of projects carried out in Saida (including a description of their scope and an evaluation of their impact)
- Establish a municipal department or committee tasked with following up with international donors and agencies on big projects.
• Use participatory planning methodologies (e.g. such as public opinion polls, focus group discussions, workshops, meetings and consultations with CSOs and other stakeholders) to identify citizens’ needs and priorities.
• Lobby for the establishment of the proposed Saida social observatory to monitor economic and social indicators.
• Draw on the assistance of specialists or consultants, as required, to guide and facilitate participatory planning processes.

Organize regular meetings with sector experts to discuss new plans and ideas according to each group area of expertise. (ix) Citizen-state dialogue

a. Promote citizen participation and dialogue in the context of municipal committee work.
• Develop systematic communication channels between Municipal Council committees and working groups of external experts and civil society groups (e.g. through the organization of regular meetings rather than through direct and personal contacts) in order to extend participation beyond prominent figures and “connected” citizens.
• Expand the representation of the Municipal Council committees to include civil society and citizen representatives in dialogue around day-to-day municipal activities.
• Use an open and transparent selection process to identify these representatives.

b. Support meaningful and regular dialogue with citizens and civil society actors.
• Convene quarterly town hall meetings to share information, listen/respond to citizen concerns and debate issues of priority concern. (See Recommendation i.c).
• Organize regular quarterly meetings on priority sector-specific issues.
• Organize an annual “general assembly” to share information (on the municipal budget, revenues, expenditures, achievements and future projects) with citizens, to listen to their suggestions and concerns and to respond to their questions.
• Capitalize on the important role played by the Mokhtar in promoting social accountability and citizen-state dialogue.

(x) Citizen participation in budgeting

a. Share budget information with citizens.
• Enhance financial transparency (by means of the recommendations outlined above in section vii).
• Develop a user-friendly budget template for purposes of public disclosure - including revenue sources and amounts, as well as projected and actual expenditures for all municipal projects and activities.

b. Consider introducing mechanisms of participatory budgeting.
• Consider supporting the establishment of neighborhood committees (e.g. building on existing committees and supported by Mokhtars) to identify and communicate local priorities and needs.
• Set aside a portion of the municipal budget to be allocated to small-scale community development/improvement projects proposed by citizens/CSOs (and selected through a transparent and competitive process, potentially drawing on a “development marketplace” model).

c. Seek policy reforms.
• Advocate for reforms to the Public Accounting Law of 1963 and to decree 5596/1982 on “Regulating Municipal Budgets and the Accounting of Municipalities” to include provisions for budget transparency and citizen participation.
• Lobby national-level actors to empower municipal financial departments with the necessary authority and tools to collect taxes and pursue those who do not pay taxes.

B. Recommendations for national-level reforms

105. The recommendations listed above all concern decisions and actions to be taken by the municipal staff, local authorities and citizens of Saida. However, local-level social accountability is also strongly influenced by national-level factors. The following recommendations, addressed to national-level actors, are aimed at creating a more enabling environment and more supportive legal and policy framework for social accountability in Saida. These are:

a. Strengthen decentralization.
• Reform the decentralization system of Lebanon to empower municipalities with (i) more authority and (ii) adequate financial resources to perform their duties.
• Decentralization reform should specifically address problems related to the role of the regulatory authorities and taxation without representation.
• Reform the Independent Municipal Fund system to ensure that funds are delivered on a regular basis and according to established deadlines.
• Empower the tax collection unit of municipalities with the necessary tools to ensure the proper and accurate collection of taxes and the ability to pursue those who are not paying taxes.
• Ratify a law that requires the Central Government and international donors to gain the approval of Municipal Councils regarding development projects to be implemented within their jurisdiction.

b. Promote civic education and citizen participation.
• Amend the civic education module of the Lebanese school curriculum to include components on municipal governance and citizen rights and responsibilities.
• Decentralization reform should make provisions for more transparency and citizen participation (e.g. allow citizens to attend Municipal Council meetings).

c. Expand access to information.
• Ratify Access to Information legislation Amend the Public Accounting Law of 1963 and the decree 5596/1982 on “Regulating Municipal Budget and on the Accounting of the Municipalities in Lebanon” to make provisions for enhanced budget transparency and citizens’ participation.
• The budget format should also be modified to include more details of revenues collection and expenditures spending to cover all resources and entities.

d. Fight corruption.
• Increase the salaries of public employees (as an anti-corruption measure).
• Fulfill the provisions of the UNCAC by ratifying access to information and whistleblowers’ protection laws.
• Establish an Ombudsman Office.

C. Messages for the World Bank

106. Finally, local stakeholders suggested a number of messages for the World Bank, as the supporter and funder of this initiative. These are as follows:

• Support a social accountability capacity development program in Lebanon (and/or a smaller-scale pilot program in Saida).
• Explore the possibility of providing financial and/or technical support to the proposed Saida Urban observatory which is currently being discussed in the USUDS project and its indicators will be set by the experts of USUDS that are relevant to Saida city. The Saida Urban observatory will aim at analyzing and producing official economic and social data for the city based on indicators, after that the preparation of the descriptive memory of Saida, undertaken in the context of USDS, revealed a serious lack of economic and social data for the city.
• Encourage more active and meaningful forms of citizen and civil society participation in the design and implementation of new and ongoing Bank-supported development projects in Saida.
• Ensure that any new development project dedicates a certain percentage of its budget for purposes of citizen education, participation and oversight (e.g. monitoring of project activities and expenditures by citizens and the Municipal Council).
• Ensure that infrastructure projects include adequate provisions for ongoing maintenance, including support to the municipality to fulfill this role and support for citizen monitoring.
Annex 1

Bibliography

1- Laws and conventions:

- The Law on public Notary, issued on November 1947 and modified according to law, No. 665, issued on 29/12/1991

2- Reports:

- The National Integrity System study, Lebanon 2011, The Lebanese Transparency Association (LTA), 2011

3- Newspapers:

- Now Lebanon, March 12, 2009, cited on: https://now.mmedia.me/lb/en/commentaryanalysis/the_name_game
- http://www.transparency.org/cpi2012/results
- http://www.transparency.org/research/gcb/overview
- http://tajamoh.org/?page_id=5

4- Websites:
- www.worldbank.org/lb
- www.medcities.org
- www.hariri-foundation.org/
- www.cdr.gov.lb
- www.saida.gov.lb/
- www.sidonianews.net/
Annex 2

List of Persons Met

- Phase 1: Dany Haddad meetings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>29/01/2013 @ 11:00</td>
<td>Member of Parliament</td>
<td>Her Excellency Mp. of Saida Ms. Bahiya Hariri</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29/01/2013 @ 15:00</td>
<td>Political party representative</td>
<td>Mr. Nasser Hammoud, Future Movement Party Coordinator for the South of Lebanon.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22/02/2013 @ 10:00</td>
<td>Elected official</td>
<td>Mr. Mohammed Seoudi: Mayor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22/02/2013 @ 10:00</td>
<td>Government staff</td>
<td>Ms. Zahra Darazi: Head of Financial and Administrative Department at Saida Municipality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22/02/2013 @ 13:00</td>
<td>Private sector representative</td>
<td>Mr. Mounir Bissat: Member of the Chamber of Commerce and Industry in Saida &amp; South Lebanon, and he is the Managing Director &amp; Partner of Mounir Bissat Factories</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22/03/2013 @ 15:00</td>
<td>CSO representative</td>
<td>Mr. Rachid Hamto: Director of Ahlouna organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22/02/2013 @ 16:00</td>
<td>Academician</td>
<td>Ms. Fadia Halabi: Public School administrator in Saida, with more than 25 years of experience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26/02/2013 @ 11:00</td>
<td>Media representative</td>
<td>Mr. Ghassan Zaatari: Journalist and owner of <a href="http://www.sidonianews.net">www.sidonianews.net</a>, premier local website of Saida</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26/02/2013 @ 15:00</td>
<td>Previous Mayor (2004-2010)</td>
<td>Mr. Abed Ramhman Bizri</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26/03/2013 @ 17:00</td>
<td>Youth group representative</td>
<td>Mr. Hicham Kotb: Youth coordinator, Future Movement Party</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11/03/2013 @ 9:00</td>
<td>Government staff</td>
<td>Mr. Ziad Hakawati: Head of Engineers Department at Saida Municipality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11/03/2013 @ 10:00</td>
<td>Women’s group representative</td>
<td>Ms. Arab Khalash: Council Member of Saida Municipality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11/03/2013 @ 11:00</td>
<td>Elected official</td>
<td>Mrs. Dianna Hammoud: Council Member and coordinator of Cities for New Generation Project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13/03/2013 @ 12:00</td>
<td>Elected official</td>
<td>Mr. Mostafa Hijazi: USDS project Lead</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
- **Phase 2: Carmen Malena and Dany Haddad meetings:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>19/03/2013 @ 15:30</td>
<td>Council for Development and Construction (CDR)</td>
<td>Ms. Wafa Charaffeddine, Head of Funding Division in CDR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20/03/2013 @ 9:00</td>
<td>Government staff</td>
<td>Mr. Ziad Hakawati: Head of Engineers Department at Saida Municipality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20/03/2013 @ 10:00</td>
<td>Women’s group representative</td>
<td>Ms. Arab Khalash: Council Member of Saida Municipality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20/03/2013 @ 11:00</td>
<td>Elected official</td>
<td>Mrs. Dianna Hammoud: Council Member and coordinator of Cities for New Generation Project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21/03/2013 @ 14:00</td>
<td>Youth group representative</td>
<td>Mr. Ibrahim Jawhari, Officer in former Prime Minister Mr. Saad Hariri, foreign affairs office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20/03/2013 @ 15:00</td>
<td>Political party representative</td>
<td>Mr. Nasser Hammoud, Future Movement Party Coordinator for the South of Lebanon.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21/03/2013 @ 9:00</td>
<td>Private sector representative</td>
<td>Mr. Mounir Bissat: Member of the Chamber of Commerce and Industry in Saida &amp; South Lebanon, and he is the Managing Director &amp; Partner of Mounir Bissat Factories</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21/03/2013 @ 11:00</td>
<td>Elected official</td>
<td>Mr. Mohammad Ismail Bassiri, Mukhtar of Dekerman Neighborhood of Saida</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21/03/2013 @ 13:00</td>
<td>Previous Mayor (2004-2010)</td>
<td>Mr. Abed Ramhman Bizri</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21/03/2013 @ 15:00</td>
<td>Media representative</td>
<td>Mr. Ghassan Zaatari: Journalist and owner of <a href="http://www.sidionianews.net">www.sidionianews.net</a>, premier local website of Saida</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21/03/2013 @ 16:00</td>
<td>Academician</td>
<td>Ms. Fadia Halabi: Public School administrator in Saida, with more than 25 years of experience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21/03/2013 @ 17:00</td>
<td>Youth group representative</td>
<td>Mr. Hicham Kotb: Youth coordinator, Future Movement Party</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22/03/2013: From 10:00 to 13:00</td>
<td>Workshop for the representatives of womens’ interest</td>
<td>12 participants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22/03/2013: From 14:00 to 14:30</td>
<td>CSO representative</td>
<td>Miss Nour: Project Coordinator at Blue Mission Organization; Responsible of the public Library at Saida Municipality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22/03/2013:</td>
<td>Workshop for</td>
<td>14 participants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td>Time</td>
<td>Activity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23/03/2013</td>
<td>From 15:00 to 18:00</td>
<td>Workshop for representatives of Youth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23/03/2013</td>
<td>From 9:00 to 11:00</td>
<td>Workshop for municipality employees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23/03/2013</td>
<td>From 11:00 to 13:00</td>
<td>Workshop of Council members</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23/03/2013</td>
<td>From 16:00 to 18:00</td>
<td>Workshop for Mixed group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24/03/2013</td>
<td>No activities</td>
<td>No activities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25/03/2013</td>
<td>@ 11:00</td>
<td>Member of Parliament</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25/03/2013</td>
<td>@ 14:00</td>
<td>Urban Sustainable Development Strategy (USDS) for Saida project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25/03/2013</td>
<td>@ 16:00</td>
<td>World Bank, Cities for New Generation Project /</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25/03/2013</td>
<td>@ 17:00</td>
<td>World Bank Office-Lebanon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26/03/2013</td>
<td>@ 10:00</td>
<td>Government staff</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26/03/2013</td>
<td>@ 11:30</td>
<td>Elected official</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26/03/2013</td>
<td>@ 12:00</td>
<td>Elected official</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26/03/2013</td>
<td>@ 12:00</td>
<td>USDS for Saida project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26/03/2013</td>
<td>@ 13:00</td>
<td>Previous Member of Parliament and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26/03/2013</td>
<td>@ 15:30</td>
<td>CSO representative</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Annex 3

Survey findings

(See attached pdf file)
Annex 4

Summary of workshops findings and list of workshop participants

Desk and field research revealed that, out of the ten identified social accountability practices, four are currently being implemented to some degree in Saida city. These are the following:

- Information sharing
- Citizen-state dialogue
- Participatory planning
- Complaints handling

The following table shows those areas identified as priorities at each of four workshops (conducted on 22-23 March 2013).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The women’s workshop</th>
<th>The youth workshop</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Civic education</td>
<td>- Information sharing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Participatory planning</td>
<td>- Civic education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Complaints handling</td>
<td>- Financial transparency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Participatory monitoring and evaluation of public services</td>
<td>- Citizens oversight /participation in anti-corruption measures</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The municipal elected officials and employees workshop</th>
<th>The multi-stakeholder workshop</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Civic education</td>
<td>- Information sharing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Participatory planning</td>
<td>- Civic education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Complaint handling</td>
<td>- Participatory planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Citizens oversight /participation in anti-corruption measures</td>
<td>- Complaints handling</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Women’s workshop

The four following priorities were identified:

- Civic education
- Participatory planning
- Complaints handling
- Participatory monitoring and evaluation of public services

For each of these priorities women participants identified the following strengths, weaknesses, best practices and recommendations.

1- Civic education:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strength</th>
<th>Weakness</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Acceptable level of education quality</td>
<td>- There is a miscommunication between the policy makers and Saida residents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Active civil society groups</td>
<td>- The duties and competencies of the municipality are not clear</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Prominent figures of Saida are occupying public positions</td>
<td>- The absence of communication and dialogue frameworks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- The social diversity in Saida</td>
<td>- The ignorance of laws which everyone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- The existence of initiatives launched by Saida residents that aims at</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
developing the city is bound to know
- The political aspect and affiliation of successive municipalities
- The absence of qualified personnel responsible of civic education

Success stories
- 2009 parliamentary elections
- This current social accountability research for Saida is also considered as a success story since it involves citizens in reflection and open discussion with them

Recommendations
- Establish permanent frameworks and mechanisms of communication between citizens and municipality
- Develop a guide on the rights and duties of the municipality
- Hire qualified personnel
- The regular usage of audio visual media and marketing tools

2- Participatory planning:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strength/ Recommendations</th>
<th>Weakness</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A honest and constructive dialogue and participation in planning between citizens and municipality can guarantee acceptance of the project at a later stage and increase their sense of ownership</td>
<td>The lack of basic skills and sufficient information of certain participants in the planning process could negatively affect the process</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ensure citizens involvement at the implementation phase in addition to the project sustainability. Citizens are aware of the plan and project of the municipality and will follow up on the implementation since they were involved in the planning</td>
<td>The absence of participatory planning can lead to a waste of time and money</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Promoting corporate social responsibility through the participation of the private sector</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Success stories
- The UDSD project is considered as a success story since it is based on participatory approach between Saida Municipality and the different sectors of the society
- The Social Accountability project for Saida is also considered as a success story since it involves citizens in the planning process

Recommendations
- Train current municipal employees or hire specialists or consultants responsible of establishing proper mechanisms for citizens inclusion in the decision making process
- Organize regular meetings to discuss with citizens new plans and ideas according to each group area of expertise

3- Complaints handling

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strength/ recommendations</th>
<th>Weakness</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
- The municipality shall be equipped with a complaint office and box
- Establish proper mechanisms to deal with complaints
- Meet citizens need and identify their priorities without any discrimination
- Conduct field studies to identify citizens needs
- Develop a strategic plan

- The absence of a disaster preparedness plan to overcome natural disasters, the displacement of citizens, and a sudden war
- Poor economic conditions
- It is not clear whether there is a committee at the municipality responsible of following up on citizens complaints about the environment, security, health, etc

**Success stories** (The extent to which these are successes was questioned by other stakeholders, but the list is retained)
- Saida Harbor
- Saida museum
- Infrastructure projects of Riad el Soleh street
- USDS project

**Recommendations**
- Adopt a strategic plan to deal with citizens complaints and needs
- Improve the municipal committees performance to follow up on citizens needs
- Promote transparency during the implementation of projects for the benefit of the public
- Promote the participation of civil society in identifying priorities

4- **Participatory monitoring and evaluation of public services**

**Strength**
- The continuous announcement for big projects in Saida
- Saida Municipal council members are aware of the importance of change and communication between all parties
- Saida Municipal council members are insisting on cooperating and sharing ideas and thoughts with different parties of Saida

**Weakness**
- Absence of means to conduct the monitoring and evaluation of public services
- Ignorance of rights and duties
- Absence of an annual agenda and a long-term strategy

**Success stories**
- The continuous invitation to workshops and direct contact with stakeholders (examples of fruit and vegetables market and municipal landfill)

**Recommendations**
- Organize regular, quarterly (vs. ad hoc) meetings with a specific agenda set in advance targeting different sectors.
- Inform citizens about future projects and share with them ideas and thoughts

**Youth workshop**

Participants at the youth workshop identified the four following priorities:
- Information sharing
- Civic education
- Financial transparency
- Citizens oversight/participation in anti-corruption measures

For each of these priorities the youth participants identified: the following strengths, weaknesses, best practices and the recommendations.

1- Information sharing:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strength</th>
<th>Weakness</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Inviting citizens to workshops such as the USDS and the social accountability for Saida project</td>
<td>Weak social media strategy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Initiative of using social media such as Facebook and the development of the municipality’s website</td>
<td>Weak communication system with universities and schools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organizing press conferences and invitations to meetings</td>
<td>Weak system of town hall meetings (irregular)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lack of communication with other municipalities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The absence of hard copies of newsletters (weekly, monthly…)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Success stories:
- Participation at USDS and social accountability project workshops
- Communication with civil society
- Participation in development projects
- USAID – Baladi project

Recommendations:
- Keep citizens and youth posted about key issues
- Establish proper communication framework with citizens
- Organize regular meetings with residents of Saida
- Improve the social media tools (Facebook, twitter, newsletters)
- Communicate with citizens of Saida living abroad and involve them in projects and development decisions
- Communicate with educational, industrial and commercial institutions
- Establish proper mechanisms of communication with the neighborhood

2- Civic education:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strength: The proper implementation of civic education could lead to:</th>
<th>Weakness</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Raising citizens awareness</td>
<td>Inability to exercise oversight by holding guilty persons accountable for their actions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fair accountability system</td>
<td>Faulty practices</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Promote partnership between citizens and municipalities at the level of projects</td>
<td>Citizens are playing a negative role as development agents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Behavioral changes</td>
<td>Low level of cooperation with the Municipality</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Success stories
- Baldati newspaper (currently not published)
- The conference organized on landfill

Recommendations
- Organize workshops for different groups of the society
- Improve the social media tools
- Amend the Lebanese school curriculum
- Establish a friendly organization to the municipality and a youth shadow municipality
- Set regular communication with the elites of the society and civil society organizations
- Publish newspapers on a regular basis and billboards

3- Financial Transparency:

Strength
- Increase citizens trust in the municipality
- Implement good governance principles and accountability
- Develop the sense of ownership and responsibility of citizens and civil society groups
- Encourage citizens to bear some financial responsibilities
- Promote transparency and social responsibility

Weakness
- Disclosure of financial information could lead to citizens challenging the published numbers and fighting against the municipality

Success stories
Not available

Recommendations
- Organize an annual meeting with citizens to inform them about the municipal budget
- Publish the municipal budget and the projects budgets in newspapers and websites and social media communication tools
- Facilitate the access to budget information upon request from the municipality

4- Citizens oversight/participation in anti-corruption measures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strength</th>
<th>Weakness</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

59
• The existence of complaint office and emergency number
• The existence of the municipal police
• The existence of social media tools

• Delays in handling complaints or neglecting them completely
• Citizens do not believe that it is possible to fight corruption in Saida unless it’s a personal damage
• The municipality has limited power and the local police is sometimes inefficient
• The absence of follow up mechanisms due to the lack of permanent development and modernization
• Political interference in small and big decisions

### Success stories
- The municipality is handling complaints within its capacity
- The establishment of a new fruit and vegetables market

### Recommendations
- It is important to deal fast with citizens complaints in order to rebuild the trust between both parties and cooperate in the future
- Give the local police more powers support and cooperate with them
- Hire an experts team to follow up and improve the website of the municipality

### Municipal elected officials and employees’ workshop

The four following priorities were identified:

• Participatory planning
• Civic education
• Citizens oversight/participation in anti-corruption measures
• Complaint handling

For each of these priorities municipal elected officials and employees identified the following strengths, weaknesses, best practices and recommendations.

#### 1- Civic education

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Strength</strong></th>
<th><strong>Weakness</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• The existence of committees at the municipality that deal with the civic education</td>
<td>• Citizens are not well informed about the authority of the municipality and are not familiar with the Municipal code of 1977</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The existing municipal website</td>
<td>• Citizens are not familiar with their rights and duties towards the municipality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• There is a limited interaction between citizens and the municipality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• There is a limited citizens participation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Absence of initiatives taken by citizens</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Success stories</td>
<td>Recommendations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| • The open discussion between civil society organizations and Saida municipal council (a reference was made to the fruit and vegetables market case)  
• Informing citizens on the reasons limiting the capability of solving specific problem in Saida such as the landfill which had become a serious problem and subject of intense debate between political parties | • Raising citizens awareness on the role of the municipality, its financial resources and activities  
• Develop and improve the website of the Municipality and include a section on the rights and duties of citizens towards the municipality  
• Organize open discussion sessions and meetings with citizens on several topics. These meetings should be an open discussions and not limited to a specific topic  
• Launch a series of discussions between students and municipal committees  
• Modify the Lebanese curriculum  
• Conduct workshops and meetings on the meaning and understanding of citizenship |

---

2- Participatory planning:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strength</th>
<th>Weakness</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Participatory planning can contribute to:  
• Finding common points and solutions for problems between citizens and policy makers  
• Limiting the difference of views after launching a series of debates  
• Ensuring financial and moral support for certain projects from wealthy people in case they are aware of the proposed projects or plans  
• Promoting cohesion and cooperation among the different level of societies  
• Ensuring good planning and organization of projects | • Promoting private and political parties interests  
• Requires time and money |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Success stories</th>
<th>Recommendations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| • Fruit and vegetables market  
• Public library  
• Public swimming pool  
• Sorting waste factory  
• Municipal slaughterhouse. | • To raise the awareness and provide guidance on the importance of participatory planning  
• To promote interaction between different groups mainly, citizens, municipal council and prominent figures of Saida  
• Introduce the concept of performance evaluation through the adoption of social monitoring tools  
• Increase and improve planning process |
### 3- Complaints handling:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Strength:</strong></th>
<th><strong>Weakness:</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| • The existence of a complaints office  
• Resources for handling citizens complaints are limited | • Citizens inability to differentiate between public and private demands  
• Limited financial resources  
• Poor and weak humane resources to handle complaints in a fast way  
• Absence of a culture of accountability |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Success stories:</strong></th>
<th><strong>Recommendations:</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| • Dealing with the storm which hit Saida this year  
• Dealing with partial collapse of an old building and rescuing three families living inside | • Increase the raising awareness sessions to limit the abuse of public spaces and maintain public hygiene |

### 4- Citizens oversight/participation in anti-corruption measures:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Strength</strong></th>
<th><strong>Weakness</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| • The existence of regulatory authorities such as the Court of Accounts responsible of monitoring the financial spending and resources of Saida municipality in addition to other public agencies  
• Citizens desire to fight corruption | • Weak salaries for public employees compared to private sector salaries. This situation limit the performance of public servants and their ability to achieve their duties in a perfect manner  
• The absence of effective and regular monitoring  
• The absence of social awareness  
• Weak legal framework  
• Weak regulatory authorities which is the state responsibility  
• Corrupted control agencies  
• The role of politics and its negative impact on the efficiency of work especially if political groups are divided |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Success stories</strong></th>
<th><strong>Recommendations</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| • The health administration of Saida municipality in collaboration with the Ministry of Economy succeeded in seizing a quantity of expired and corrupted meat and dairy product. (However, those responsible were not held accountable for their actions). | • Ensure proper equipments for effective monitoring by building a food safety laboratory for instance  
• Prevent the interference in the regulatory affairs and tighten sanctions to prevent the misuse of public resources  
• Increase employees salaries  
• Raise citizens’ awareness on the role of |
Multi-stakeholder workshop

The four following priorities were identified:

- Information sharing
- Civic education
- Participatory planning
- Complaints handling

For each of these priorities the stakeholders identified the following strengths, weaknesses, best practices and recommendations

1- Information sharing

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strength</th>
<th>Weakness</th>
<th>Recommendations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• The existence of social media tools such as the Facebook, twitter..</td>
<td>• Lack of information on the touristic guides of Saida</td>
<td>• Publish a newspaper on a regular basis to be circulated among schools and citizens</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The workshops organized and conferences</td>
<td>• Lack of citizens knowledge on the municipal role and duties</td>
<td>• Develop a touristic and commercial guide for Saida</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The existence of a guide on municipal transactions</td>
<td>• The absence of cultural workshops</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Success stories

2- Civic education

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strength</th>
<th>Weakness</th>
<th>Recommendations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Weak civic education</td>
<td>• Organize raising awareness sessions on the role of the municipality, its duties, composition and power</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Success stories</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Raising awareness on the nature of taxes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Inform citizens about spending</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Improve the use of social media tools (Facebook, twitter, newsletters)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Improve the communication means through a more developed website and publications</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### 3- Participatory planning

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strength</th>
<th>Weakness</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Cooperation between the Municipality, donors and implementing agencies during the execution of development projects. As an example, the cooperation that exists between the municipality, the World Bank and the CDR regarding the “Cultural Heritage Project”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Success stories**

**Recommendations**

- Conduct a comprehensive survey in order to identify the experts of Saida and based on the results organize regular meetings with them
- Establish a specialized unit at the municipality to assist the engineers department and building capacity

### 4- Complaints handling

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strength</th>
<th>Weakness</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Success stories**

**Recommendations**

- Inform citizens about the hotline and the complaints unit through media campaigns
- Build a specialized unit to deal with complaints
- It is important to deal with complaints in a timely manner
- Perform regular maintenance (to prevent citizen complaints)
### Women workshop- 22/3/2013

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Organization</th>
<th>Telephone</th>
<th>Email</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mayssa Yaafouri</td>
<td>Saida Mall Manager</td>
<td>Saida Mall</td>
<td>03/650118</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Mayssa.yaafouri@saida-mall.com">Mayssa.yaafouri@saida-mall.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hiyam Bizri Charif</td>
<td>President</td>
<td>Lebanese Red Cross</td>
<td>03/678676</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shaden Joubaii</td>
<td>Manager</td>
<td>Center of Culture and Arts</td>
<td>03/848421</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Shaden@csf-lb.org">Shaden@csf-lb.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>olfat el Baba</td>
<td>Public Relations Officer</td>
<td>Debbane Company</td>
<td>03/561649</td>
<td><a href="mailto:obaba@debbane.com">obaba@debbane.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wafaa Sheib</td>
<td>Council Member</td>
<td>Municipality of Saida</td>
<td>03/689800</td>
<td><a href="mailto:wsheib@hotmail.com">wsheib@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maya Majzoub</td>
<td>Lawyer</td>
<td>Lebanese-Palestinian Committee for Dialogue and Development</td>
<td>03/209799</td>
<td><a href="mailto:majzoubmaya@hotmail.com">majzoubmaya@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diana Hammoud</td>
<td>Council Member of Saida Municipality</td>
<td>Hammoud Hospital</td>
<td>03/617030</td>
<td><a href="mailto:dzh@hammoudhospital.com">dzh@hammoudhospital.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bana Kalach Koubrously</td>
<td>Manager of Boecker company in Saida</td>
<td>Boecker company</td>
<td>03/639839</td>
<td><a href="mailto:banak@hotmail.comm">banak@hotmail.comm</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carole el Hajj</td>
<td>Branch Manager of Byblos Bank in Saida</td>
<td>Byblos Bank</td>
<td>03/374647</td>
<td><a href="mailto:chaberelhaj@byblosbank.com.lb">chaberelhaj@byblosbank.com.lb</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nahiya Hawari</td>
<td>Representative of Mr. Osama Saad</td>
<td></td>
<td>03/312177</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nisrine Ghazawi</td>
<td>Manager at Pro Quality Control</td>
<td>NTCC</td>
<td>71/588820</td>
<td><a href="mailto:pr@ntcc-ntcc.com">pr@ntcc-ntcc.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fatima Khalil</td>
<td>Center Manager</td>
<td>Service center at the Ministry of Social Affairs</td>
<td>03/969499</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Fatima.khalil@live.com">Fatima.khalil@live.com</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Youth workshop- 22/3/2013

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Organization</th>
<th>Telephone</th>
<th>Email</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bilal Arkadan</td>
<td>Executive Manager</td>
<td>Association for Social Development and Advancement</td>
<td>70/992380</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Bilal_arkadan@hotmail.com">Bilal_arkadan@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hozeifa Mallah</td>
<td>President</td>
<td>League of Muslims Students</td>
<td>70/972085</td>
<td><a href="mailto:hozeifa@gmail.com">hozeifa@gmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abdallah Ajlouni</td>
<td>General Coordinator</td>
<td>Group of Saida Values</td>
<td>76/424047</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Abdallah_ajlouni@hotmail.com">Abdallah_ajlouni@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abla Hariri</td>
<td>University Student</td>
<td>Rafic Hariri University</td>
<td>03/948685</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Ablahariri@gmail.com">Ablahariri@gmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ali Sleem</td>
<td>Head of Department</td>
<td>Islamic Cultural Center</td>
<td>70/852349</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Aisleem85@hotmail.com">Aisleem85@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hozeifa Mallah</td>
<td>President</td>
<td>League of Muslims Students</td>
<td>70/972085</td>
<td><a href="mailto:hozeifa@gmail.com">hozeifa@gmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abdallah Ajlouni</td>
<td>General Coordinator</td>
<td>Group of Saida Values</td>
<td>76/424047</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Abdallah_ajlouni@hotmail.com">Abdallah_ajlouni@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abla Hariri</td>
<td>University Student</td>
<td>Rafic Hariri University</td>
<td>03/948685</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Ablahariri@gmail.com">Ablahariri@gmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ali Sleem</td>
<td>Head of Department</td>
<td>Islamic Cultural Center</td>
<td>70/852349</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Aisleem85@hotmail.com">Aisleem85@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amjad el Khawli</td>
<td>Civil Engineer</td>
<td>Khawli Consultancy</td>
<td>03/776899</td>
<td><a href="mailto:amjadkhawli@hotmail.com">amjadkhawli@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sara Kasem</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>Lebanese Red Cross</td>
<td>70/108242</td>
<td><a href="mailto:sarakassem@gmail.com">sarakassem@gmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zein Abu Zahar</td>
<td>Lawyer</td>
<td>Lebanese Red Cross</td>
<td>03/565370</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Zein-abuzahr@hotmail.com">Zein-abuzahr@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Noura ek Sherif</td>
<td>University Student</td>
<td>Lebanese International University</td>
<td>70/940014</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Noura_sherif@gmail.com">Noura_sherif@gmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charif El Ansari</td>
<td>Company Manager</td>
<td>Charif El Ansari &amp; Sons Company</td>
<td>03/087330</td>
<td><a href="mailto:charif@elansarigroup.com">charif@elansarigroup.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hicham Kotb</td>
<td>General Coordinator of</td>
<td>Youth coordinator for the South of Lebanon Future Movement Party</td>
<td>03/876517</td>
<td><a href="mailto:hishamkotob@hotmail.com">hishamkotob@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maysaa elyaman</td>
<td></td>
<td>Elyaman printing house</td>
<td>03/117211</td>
<td><a href="mailto:maysaa@elyamangroup.com">maysaa@elyamangroup.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ahmad Halabi</td>
<td>University Student</td>
<td>El Jinan University</td>
<td>70/769865</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Ahmad_halabi1@hotmail.com">Ahmad_halabi1@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jalal Aoun</td>
<td>Council Member of Youth of Future Movement Party</td>
<td>Future Movement Party</td>
<td>03/602837</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Jalal15@hotmail.com">Jalal15@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Municipal employees workshop - 23/3/2013

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Organization</th>
<th>Telephone</th>
<th>Email</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mohamad Nakouzi</td>
<td>Painter</td>
<td>Saida Municipality</td>
<td>70/075536</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Sandro_87@hotmail.com">Sandro_87@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ahmad</td>
<td>Engineers Department</td>
<td>Saida Municipality</td>
<td>70/961739</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Mirna_sabbagh@hotmail.com">Mirna_sabbagh@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mirna Sabbagh</td>
<td>Financial Department</td>
<td>Saida Municipality</td>
<td>70/927852</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Brokenwings_h86@hotmail.com">Brokenwings_h86@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hasnaa Freij</td>
<td>Administrative Department</td>
<td>Saida Municipality</td>
<td>03/343645</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mahmoud Alzinawa</td>
<td>Engineers Department</td>
<td>Saida Municipality</td>
<td>70/811055</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ezzeddine Abdel Nabi</td>
<td>Accountant</td>
<td>Saida Municipality</td>
<td>71/389591</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Ezzeddin75@gmail.com">Ezzeddin75@gmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Firas Mehtar</td>
<td>Engineers Department</td>
<td>Saida Municipality</td>
<td>03/299130</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Firas82@hotmail.com">Firas82@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ziad Hakawati</td>
<td>Engineers Department</td>
<td>Saida Municipality</td>
<td>03/307758</td>
<td><a href="mailto:ziadhakawati@hotmail.com">ziadhakawati@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jala el Zarif</td>
<td>Financial Department</td>
<td>Saida Municipality</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mohamad Zarzour</td>
<td>Financial Department</td>
<td>Saida Municipality</td>
<td>03/640153</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mahmoud Natout</td>
<td>Engineers Department</td>
<td>Saida Municipality</td>
<td>03/361404</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heba Kobrosly</td>
<td>Treasurer at Saida Municipality</td>
<td>Saida Municipality</td>
<td>76/496768</td>
<td><a href="mailto:hebakobrosly@hotmail.com">hebakobrosly@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abbas Kasem</td>
<td>Health Controller</td>
<td>Saida Municipality</td>
<td>03/093297</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Abbas_kasem@hotmail.com">Abbas_kasem@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nisrine Awada</td>
<td>Administrative Department</td>
<td>Saida Municipality</td>
<td>70/029572</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hafez Al Halabi</td>
<td>Administrative Department</td>
<td>Saida Municipality</td>
<td>03/011277</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Aboza74@hotmail.com">Aboza74@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Position</td>
<td>Organization</td>
<td>Telephone</td>
<td>Email</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Mohammed Seoudi</td>
<td>Mayor</td>
<td>Municipal Council</td>
<td>01/772464</td>
<td><a href="mailto:mzseoudi@cc.gr">mzseoudi@cc.gr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mohamad Hilal Kobrosly</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td>Municipal Council</td>
<td>03/264926</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Kobrosly.m@saida.gov.lb">Kobrosly.m@saida.gov.lb</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mohamad el Zein</td>
<td>Advisor to the Mayor</td>
<td>Municipal Council</td>
<td>70/876886</td>
<td><a href="mailto:mohelzein@hotmail.com">mohelzein@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mohamad Mounir el Sayed</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td>Municipal Council</td>
<td>03/746122</td>
<td>mohamads@future</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ali Dali Balta</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td>Municipal Council</td>
<td>03/870688</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Hazem Badih</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td>Municipal Council</td>
<td>03/810820</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Hazem_badih@hotmail.com">Hazem_badih@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ibrahim Bassat</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td>Municipal Council</td>
<td>03/677717</td>
<td><a href="mailto:ibsat@hotmail.com">ibsat@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arab Kalash</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td>Municipal Council</td>
<td>03/347860</td>
<td><a href="mailto:kalasharab@yahoo.com">kalasharab@yahoo.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mohamad el Baba</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td>Municipal Council</td>
<td>03/333975</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Baba.m@saida.gov.lb">Baba.m@saida.gov.lb</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Mohamad Hussein el Bizri</td>
<td>Member and dentist</td>
<td>Municipal Council</td>
<td>70/101414</td>
<td><a href="mailto:osteobiotech@yahoo.com">osteobiotech@yahoo.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wafaa Sheaib</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td>Municipal Council</td>
<td>03/689800</td>
<td><a href="mailto:wsheaib@hotmail.com">wsheaib@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ghassan el Zaatari</td>
<td>Media Advisor</td>
<td>Municipal Council</td>
<td>03/226013</td>
<td><a href="mailto:zaataripress@yahoo.com">zaataripress@yahoo.com</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Stakeholders’ workshop- 23/3/2013

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Organization</th>
<th>Telephone</th>
<th>Email</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mohamad Jamil Kotb</td>
<td>Deputy of Saida Traders Association</td>
<td>Saida Traders Association</td>
<td>03/720640</td>
<td><a href="mailto:moh@mjkotb.com">moh@mjkotb.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mohy al-Din</td>
<td>Manager</td>
<td>Hariri Foundation</td>
<td>03/720005</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abdelatif Teriyaki</td>
<td>President of the Labor Unions</td>
<td>Labor Unions</td>
<td>03/945914</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Abed.teryaki@yahoo.com">Abed.teryaki@yahoo.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arab Kalash</td>
<td>President</td>
<td>Moasat organization</td>
<td>03/347860</td>
<td><a href="mailto:kalasharab@yahoo.com">kalasharab@yahoo.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nazih el Bizri</td>
<td>President</td>
<td>League of Doctors</td>
<td>03/243300</td>
<td><a href="mailto:n-bizri@hotmail.com">n-bizri@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monzer abou Zaher</td>
<td>Municipal Council member</td>
<td>Saida Municipality</td>
<td>03/721071</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mostafa Mahmoud Dandash</td>
<td>Tradesman</td>
<td></td>
<td>03/355530</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Hwaida el Turk</td>
<td>Jezzine District Commissioner</td>
<td>Local Government</td>
<td>03/986561</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Hwaida.turk@hotmail.com">Hwaida.turk@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michel Samaha</td>
<td>Economic Consultant</td>
<td>Council for Development and Reconstruction (CDR)</td>
<td>03/423533</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Michsam77@hotmail.com">Michsam77@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nidal Chehaib</td>
<td>Economic Consultant</td>
<td>Council for Development and Reconstruction (CDR)</td>
<td></td>
<td><a href="mailto:nidalc@cdr.gov.lb">nidalc@cdr.gov.lb</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Phase 3 workshop, April 23, 2013

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Organization</th>
<th>Telephone</th>
<th>Email</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Diana Hammoud</td>
<td>Council Member of Saida Municipality</td>
<td>Hammoud Hospital and Municipal Council</td>
<td>03/617030</td>
<td><a href="mailto:dzh@hammoudhospital.com">dzh@hammoudhospital.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Mostapha Hijazi</td>
<td>Council Member</td>
<td>Municipal Council</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ali Dali Balta</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td>Municipal Council</td>
<td>03/870688</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wafaa Sheib</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td>Municipal Council</td>
<td>03/689800</td>
<td><a href="mailto:wsheib@hotmail.com">wsheib@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mohamad el Baba</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td>Municipal Council</td>
<td>03/333975</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Baba.m@saida.gov.lb">Baba.m@saida.gov.lb</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mahmoud Mohamad Chrayteh</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ziad Hakawati</td>
<td>Engineers Department</td>
<td>Saida Municipality</td>
<td>03/307758</td>
<td><a href="mailto:zidhakawati@hotmail.com">zidhakawati@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arab Kalash</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td>Municipal Council</td>
<td>03/347860</td>
<td><a href="mailto:kalasharab@yahoo.com">kalasharab@yahoo.com</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>